The Long and Winding Road to Equality and Inclusion for Persons with Disabilities

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities





Intersentia Ltd

Sheraton House | Castle Park

Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom

Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK: Distribution for the USA and Canada:

NBN International International Specialized Book Services

Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road 920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300

Plymouth, PL6 7PP Portland, OR 97213

United Kingdom USA

Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331 Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)

Email: orders@nbninternational.com Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria: Distribution for other countries:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag Intersentia Publishing nv

Argentinierstraße 42/6 Groenstraat 31 1040 Wien 2640 Mortsel Austria Belgium

Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24 Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 Email: office@nwv.at Email: mail@intersentia.be

The Long and Winding Road to Equality and Inclusion for Persons with Disabilities. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities Andrea Broderick

© 2015 Intersentia Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: © Doron Rosendorff – Dreamstime

ISBN 978-1-78068-358-4 D/2015/7849/141 NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book is the culmination of two and a half years of hard work, all of which I thoroughly enjoyed. The process of writing was made easier by the support and encouragement of several people.

I am indebted to Lisa Waddington, as my main supervisor, for her many words of wisdom, her generous support and her careful work in checking through all aspects of this book. Lisa has gone far beyond what I could have expected from a supervisor and has dedicated a lot of time to reading drafts of this Ph.D., as well as helping me along the way with other academic work. For that, I am truly grateful. I am also deeply grateful for the support and dedication of my co-supervisor, Fons Coomans. He has provided me with inspiration for several aspects of this thesis and his door was always open to discuss concerns and new ideas. I am also thankful to him for the time he spent checking through the drafts of this thesis and for his wise feedback on those drafts.

In addition, I am grateful to the members of the Reading Committee, who took the time to read this thesis and provided helpful comments and insight: Aalt Willem Heringa, Jenny Goldschmidt, Liesbeth Lijnzaad, Oddný Mjöll Arnardóttir and Theresia Degener.

I would also like to thank the European Commission for the financial support and impetus provided in the framework of the DREAM (Disability Rights Expanding Accessible Markets) network, through which this research project was made possible.

In addition, a special word of thanks is due to Gerard Quinn, Professor of Law at the National University of Ireland, Galway, for introducing me to disability rights scholarship. I am also indebted to Anna Lawson, Shivaun Quinlivan and Mary Keys for their invaluable support and advice.

To my many colleagues at Maastricht University, I also owe special thanks. You have become great friends along the way and I will always hold you very dear.

Last but certainly not least, I dedicate this book to my parents, Madge and Tom. Their unwavering support and love has helped me enormously. I owe them much gratitude for encouraging me along my chosen career path and helping me at any stumbling blocks I encountered.

Where, after all, do universal human rights begin? In small places, close to home – so close and so small that they cannot be seen on any maps of the world. Yet they are the world of the individual person; the neighborhood he lives in; the school or college he attends; the factory, farm, or office where he works.

Such are the places where every man, woman, and child seeks equal justice, equal opportunity, equal dignity without discrimination. Unless these rights have meaning there, they have little meaning anywhere. Without concerted citizen action to uphold them close to home, we shall look in vain for progress in the larger world.\(^1\)

Excerpt from a speech by Eleanor Roosevelt at the presentation of 'In Your Hands: A Guide for Community Action for the Tenth Anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights' (United Nations, New York, March 27, 1958).

CONTENTS

| | nowledgments | |
|----|---|-----|
| | opter 1. | . 1 |
| 1. | Introduction | |
| 2. | Research Objectives and Research Questions | |
| 3. | Methodology | |
| | 3.1. Normative Analysis: Treaty Interpretation | |
| | 3.1.1. The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties | . 7 |
| | 3.1.2. The Purpose of Treaty Interpretation | . 8 |
| | 3.1.3. Approaches to Treaty Interpretation in the VCLT | |
| | 3.1.3.1. The Literal (Textual) Interpretative Approach | |
| | 3.1.3.3. The Teleological (Functional) Approach | |
| | 3.1.3.4. The Historical Interpretative Approach | |
| | 3.2. Traditional Doctrinal Methodology | |
| | 3.3. Comparative Methodology | |
| 4. | Structure | |
| 5. | Existing Research Gaps | |
| 6. | Research Limitations. | |
| 7. | Conclusion. | |
| | pter 2. ability Equality: An Evolving Journey | 21 |
| | | |
| 1. | Introduction | |
| 2. | Theoretical Models of Disability. | 22 |
| | 2.1. Introduction to Theoretical Models of Disability: The Medical | |
| | Model <i>versus</i> the Social Model | |
| | 2.2. A Consideration of Theoretical Models of Disability | |
| | 2.2.1. The Minority Rights Approach to Disability | |
| | 2.2.2. The Universalist Approach to Disability | |
| | 2.2.3. The Human Rights-Based Approach to Disability.2.2.4. The Capabilities Approach. | |
| 3. | Theoretical Models of Equality and their Relationship to Disability | ∠8 |
| ٥. | Rights | 21 |
| | Nigino | ונ |

| | | Introduction to Theoretical Models of Equality | |
|------|-------|--|-----|
| | 3.2. | Formal Equality | |
| | | 3.2.1. Formal Equality and the Medical Model of Disability | 33 |
| | | 3.2.2. The Shift Away from Formal Equality Towards Substantive | |
| | | Equality | 34 |
| | 3.3. | | |
| | 3.4. | Transformative Equality (Equality as Transformation) | 36 |
| | 3.5. | The Objectives of Substantive and Transformative Equality Models | 38 |
| | | 3.5.1. Equality of Opportunity | 38 |
| | | 3.5.2. Equality of Results (Outcome) | 40 |
| | 3.6. | The Development of the Equality Norm in International | |
| | | Human Rights Law: Substantive Difference versus Substantive | |
| | | Disadvantage Equality | |
| | | 3.6.1. Substantive/Specific Difference Equality | 42 |
| | | 3.6.2. Substantive Disadvantage (Diversity) Equality | 44 |
| | 3.7. | Conclusion on Theoretical Models of Equality | 46 |
| 4. | The | International Framework for the Protection of Disability Rights | 46 |
| | 4.1. | Disability Rights in Soft-Law Human Rights Instruments | |
| | | (1945–1980) | 46 |
| | 4.2. | Disability Rights in Soft-Law Human Rights Instruments | |
| | | (1980–1990) | 49 |
| | 4.3. | Disability Rights in Soft-Law Human Rights Instruments | |
| | | (1990-Present Day) | 51 |
| | 4.4. | The Protection of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities | |
| | | under Binding International and Regional Human Rights Law | |
| | | before the Adoption of the CRPD | 56 |
| | | 4.4.1. The Protection of Disability Rights under the Core | |
| | | International Human Rights Treaties | 56 |
| | | 4.4.2. The Regional Framework for the Protection of the Rights of | |
| | | Persons with Disabilities | 61 |
| | 4.5. | The Final Steps in the Journey towards the Adoption of the CRPD | 63 |
| 5. | The | Link between 'Equality' and 'Participation and Inclusion' in Society | |
| | | Persons with Disabilities | 68 |
| | 5.1. | Introduction to the Concepts of Participation and Inclusion in | |
| | | Society for Persons with Disabilities: Their Link to the Equality | |
| | | Norm | 68 |
| | | The Dilemma of Difference: Inclusion versus Integration in Society. | |
| 6. | Con | clusion | 73 |
| | | | |
| | pter | | |
| | | nterpretation: The Equality and Non-Discrimination Provisions | - |
| ın t | ne CF | RPD | 75 |
| 1 | Inte | advation | 7. |
| 1. | | oductionearch Methodology | |
| 2. | | Conceptual Understanding of Disability in the CRPD | 77 |
| 7 | 1110 | CONCEDENTAL CHUCKSTANGING OF DISABINEV III LIE CRED | / / |

| | 3.1. | The Social-Contextual Model of Disability |
|----|------|--|
| | 3.2. | The Human Rights-Based Understanding of Disability |
| 4. | | al Interpretation of Article 5 of the CRPD80 |
| | 4.1. | The Tripartite Typology of States' Obligations under International |
| | | Human Rights Law 80 |
| | 4.2. | Article 5(1) of the CRPD82 |
| | | 4.2.1. The Guarantee of 'Equality Before the Law' and 'Equal |
| | | Protection of the Law' Without Discrimination 83 |
| | | 4.2.2. The Requirements of 'Equality Under the Law' and 'Equal |
| | | Benefit of the Law' |
| | 4.3. | Article 5(2) of the CRPD. 90 |
| | | 4.3.1. Introduction to Article 5(2) of the CRPD |
| | | 4.3.2. The Definition of Discrimination in the CRPD |
| | | 4.3.2.1. Enjoyment of Rights 'On an Equal Basis with |
| | | Others' |
| | | 4.3.2.2. Direct <i>versus</i> Indirect Discrimination |
| | | 4.3.2.3. Discrimination 'on the Basis of Disability' |
| | | 4.3.3. The Prohibition of Disability-Based Discrimination 98 |
| | | 4.3.4. The Guarantee of 'Equal and Effective Legal Protection |
| | | against Discrimination' |
| | | 4.3.4.1. The Requirement of 'Equal and Effective Legal |
| | | Protection against Discrimination' under the |
| | | CRPD: An Analogy with Similar Obligations in |
| | | the Core Human Rights Treaties and Observations |
| | | from the Drafting History of the CRPD |
| | | 4.3.4.2. The Obligation to Protect against Discrimination |
| | | in the Private Sector |
| | | 4.3.4.3. Equal and Effective Protection against |
| | 4.4 | Discrimination 'on all grounds' |
| | 4.4. | Article 5(3) of the CRPD |
| | | 4.4.1. Introduction to Article 5(3) of the CRPD |
| | | 4.4.2.1 What is Mount by the Town (Accommodate |
| | | 4.4.2.1. What is Meant by the Term 'Accommodation?' 107 |
| | | 4.4.2.2. The Limitation to the Duty to Accommodate: |
| | | 'Disproportionate or Undue Burden' |
| | | 4.4.2.3. The Duty to Accommodate as Part of the Equality |
| | | and Non-Discrimination Norms in the Convention 111 |
| | | 4.4.3. The Objective of the Duty to Accommodate |
| | | 4.4.3.1. The Duty to Accommodate and the Promotion of Equality |
| | | 1 2 |
| | | 4.4.3.2. The Duty to Accommodate and the Elimination of Discrimination |
| | 15 | Article 5(4) of the CRPD. |
| | 4.3. | 4.5.1. Introduction to Positive Action Measures under Article 5(4) |
| | | of the CRPD |
| | | or the CIVI D |

| | 4.5.2. | General Observations on Special Measures in the Core | |
|-----|-------------|---|------------|
| | | Human Rights Treaties | 17 |
| | | 4.5.2.1. Temporary <i>versus</i> Permanent Special Measures 1 | |
| | | 4.5.2.2. The Importance of a Clear Delineation of the | |
| | | Types of Measures Adopted by States | 17 |
| | | 4.5.2.3. 'Specific Measures:' An Exception to the Equality | 1 / |
| | | and Non-Discrimination Norms? | 20 |
| | | 4.5.2.4. The Participation of Marginalised Groups in the | 20 |
| | | | 21 |
| | 152 | Observations from the Drafting History of Article 5(4) of the | <i>4</i> 1 |
| | 4.3.3. | | าา |
| | 151 | | 22 |
| | 4.3.4. | Comparison of the Positive Action Clause in the CRPD with | 2.5 |
| | 4.5.5 | | 25 |
| | 4.5.5. | Examples of Temporary and Permanent Specific Measures | • |
| | 4.5.6 | | 28 |
| | 4.5.6. | | 30 |
| | | 4.5.6.1. The Nature of Temporary Specific Measures under | |
| | | | 31 |
| | | 4.5.6.2. The Nature of Permanent Specific Measures under | |
| | | | 34 |
| | 4.5.7. | Conclusion on the Interpretation of Article 5(4) of | |
| | | | 35 |
| 5. | | of Equality in the CRPD: A Theoretical and Comparative | |
| | Perspective | | 36 |
| | | nsideration of the Theoretical Framework of Equality in the | |
| | |) | |
| | | A Substantive Conception of Equality | |
| | | A Transformative Approach to Equality | |
| | | Substantive Disadvantage Equality | |
| | 5.2. The C | RPD's Approach to Disability | 41 |
| | 5.3. A Coa | mparative Perspective on the CRPD's Equality Provisions 14 | 42 |
| 6. | Conclusion | | 48 |
| | | | |
| | pter 4. | | |
| The | Duty to Ac | commodate Persons with Disabilities | 51 |
| | | | |
| 1. | | n | |
| 2. | • | o Accommodate | 52 |
| | | Origins and Theoretical Underpinning of the Duty to | |
| | Accor | mmodate | 52 |
| | 2.2. What | is Meant by the Term 'Accommodation?' | 54 |
| 3. | The Duty to | o Accommodate in the CRPD | 54 |
| | 3.1. The K | Ley Strengths of the Duty to Accommodate in the CRPD 15 | 54 |
| | | Weaknesses of the Duty to Accommodate as a Facilitator of | |
| | | · | 56 |
| 4 | The Outer | | 58 |

| | | Introduction to the Outer Limits of the Duty to Accommodate | 158 |
|-----|--------|--|-----|
| | 4.2. | The Outer Limits of the Duty to Accommodate in the CRPD: | |
| | | The Concept of 'Reasonableness' | 158 |
| | 4.3. | The Outer Limits of the Duty to Accommodate in the CRPD: | |
| | | The Requirements of Necessity and Effectiveness | 159 |
| | 4.4. | The Outer Limits of the Duty to Accommodate in the CRPD: | |
| | | A Consideration of the Objective of the Accommodation Duty | |
| | | and the Inherent Dignity of Persons with Disabilities | 162 |
| | 4.5. | • • | |
| | | | 163 |
| | | 4.5.1. Financial and Other Resource Considerations | 164 |
| | | 4.5.2. Third-Party Benefits and Negative Impacts of the Requested | 101 |
| | | Accommodation | 170 |
| | | 4.5.3. Non-Financial Considerations | 174 |
| 5. | Con | clusion. | 175 |
| ٥. | Con | orusion | 1/3 |
| Cha | pter : | 5. | |
| | | ed Framework for the Assessment of the Progressive Realisation | |
| | | Rights | 177 |
| | | 8 | |
| 1. | Intro | oduction | 177 |
| 2. | The | Progressive Realisation of Human Rights | 181 |
| | | Introduction to the Concept of Progressive Realisation | 181 |
| | | The Immediate Duties of States Parties to the CRPD in the | |
| | | Realisation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 182 |
| | | 2.2.1. The Obligation to 'Take Steps' to Achieve Progressively the | |
| | | Full Realisation of Rights | 183 |
| | | 2.2.2. Deliberately Retrogressive Measures | 185 |
| | | 2.2.3. The Obligation to Ensure Non-Discrimination in the | 100 |
| | | Exercise of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 187 |
| | | 2.2.4. The Obligation to Devote the 'Maximum of Available | 107 |
| | | Resources' to Achieving Progressively the Full Realisation | |
| | | of Rights | 187 |
| | | 2.2.5. Minimum Core Obligations | 188 |
| | 2 3 | Equality Considerations in the Realisation of Socio-Economic | 100 |
| | 2.3. | | 190 |
| 3. | Dage | Rights | 190 |
| ٥. | | Introduction to Reasonableness Review of Socio-Economic | 191 |
| | 3.1. | | 192 |
| | 2.2 | Rights | 192 |
| | 3.2. | ** | 102 |
| | | Progressive Realisation of Human Rights | 192 |
| | | 3.2.1. South African Reasonableness Review: Delineation of the | 104 |
| | | Test by the Constitutional Court | 194 |
| | | 3.2.1.1. The Rationality Test. | 195 |
| | | 3.2.1.2. The Introduction of the Reasonableness Standard | 195 |
| | | 3.2.1.3. The Criteria Inherent in the <i>Groothoom</i> Test | 196 |

| | 3.2.1.4. The Development of the Reasonableness Test: | |
|-----|--|------|
| | The Use of Available Resources, the Equality | |
| | | 200 |
| | 3.2.1.5. Summary of the South African Approach to | |
| | | 204 |
| | 3.3. Reasonableness Review: The Standard of Review at the | 201 |
| | | 206 |
| 4. | A Proposed Framework for Review of the Progressive Realisation of | 200 |
| 4. | Rights under the CRPD | 200 |
| | | |
| | 4.1. Introduction to the Proposed Framework. | 210 |
| | 4.2. A Proposed Framework for Review of the Progressive Realisation | 210 |
| | of CRPD Rights | 210 |
| | 4.3. Proposed Criteria for Assessment of Progressive Realisation | |
| | under the CRPD | |
| | 4.3.1. The Necessity and Effectiveness of Measures taken by States | |
| | 4.3.2. Disproportionate Burden/Cost Considerations | |
| | 4.3.3. Equality Considerations | 220 |
| | 4.3.4. Dignity Considerations | 224 |
| | 4.3.5. The Impact of Failure to Take Measures | 228 |
| | 4.3.6. Participatory Processes/Accountability | 229 |
| | 4.3.7. Third-Party Benefits | 231 |
| 5. | Conclusion. | 231 |
| | | |
| Cha | pter 6. | |
| | Accessibility Obligation in the CRPD | 235 |
| | | |
| 1. | Introduction | 235 |
| 2. | The Accessibility Obligation: Article 9 of the CRPD | 236 |
| | 2.1. Introduction to Accessibility under Article 9 of the CRPD | 236 |
| | 2.2. The Objective of Article 9 of the CRPD | 238 |
| | 2.3. Accessibility and Access to Rights | |
| 3. | The Interrelationship Between Accessibility and Equality in the CRPD | |
| | 3.1. The Nature of the Link between Accessibility and Equality | |
| | 3.2. Inaccessibility as a Breach of the Non-Discrimination Norm? | |
| | 3.3. Accessibility and Reasonable Accommodation Measures | |
| 4. | The Progressive Realisation of Article 9 of the CRPD. | |
| ٦. | 4.1. The Tripartite Obligations of States Parties under Article 9 of | 27) |
| | the CRPD | 2/10 |
| | 4.2. The Progressive Implementation of Disability Accessibility | Z#7 |
| | under the CRPD | 250 |
| | | 250 |
| | 4.3. The Obligation to Ensure Satisfaction of the Minimum Core of | 2.50 |
| | Article 9 of the CRPD | |
| | 4.3.1. Priority Areas of Disability Accessibility | |
| | | 253 |
| | | |
| | 4.4. Relevant Considerations in the Implementation of Article 9 | 254 |

| | | 4.4.1. | The Requirement to Adopt Legislation to Ensure | |
|-----|--------|---------|--|------|
| | | | Implementation of Article 9 of the CRPD and the Drafting | |
| | | | of Accessibility Standards | 254 |
| | | 4.4.2. | The Obligation to Monitor the Realisation of Disability | |
| | | | Accessibility | 255 |
| | | 4.4.3. | The Provision of Effective Legal Remedies | |
| | | | The Provision of Disability Accessibility Training for | |
| | | | Stakeholders | 256 |
| | | 4.4.5. | Accessibility as Part of the Educational Curriculum | |
| | | | The Continuous Obligation to Improve Conditions of | |
| | | | Accessibility | 257 |
| | | 447 | The Obligation to Abstain from Taking Deliberately | |
| | | | Retrogressive Measures in Realising Disability | |
| | | | Accessibility | 257 |
| | | 448 | Privatisation of Goods, Products and Services: The Impact | 23 / |
| | | 1. 1.0. | on States Parties' Accessibility Obligations | 258 |
| | 45 | The C | Criteria for Assessment of Measures taken by States in the | 250 |
| | 1.5. | | essive Realisation of Article 9 of the CRPD | 258 |
| | | | Disproportionate Burden/Cost Considerations | |
| | | | The Obligation to Use the Maximum of Available | 20) |
| | | 1.5.2. | Resources: Resource Prioritisation and Resource | |
| | | | Optimisation Efforts of States | 260 |
| | | 453 | The Necessity and the Effectiveness of Measures Taken by | 200 |
| | | 1.5.5. | States | 261 |
| | | 454 | Equality Considerations | |
| | | | Dignity Considerations | |
| | | | Participation and Inclusion: The Requirement to | 203 |
| | | 1.0.0. | Involve Persons with Disabilities in all Aspects of the | |
| | | | Implementation and Monitoring of Disability Accessibility | 266 |
| | | 457 | The Impact of Failure to Take Measures to Ensure Disability | 200 |
| | | 1.5.7. | Accessibility | 268 |
| | | 458 | Benefits to Third Parties | |
| 5. | Conc | | l | |
| ٥. | Com | crasion | | 2/1 |
| Cha | pter ' | 7. | | |
| | | | lucation for Persons with Disabilities | 273 |
| | Ü | | | |
| 1. | Intro | ductio | n | 273 |
| 2. | The | Right t | to Education in International Human Rights Law | 275 |
| | 2.1. | The R | Light to Education in International Human Rights Law and | |
| | | the De | evelopment of the Right to Inclusive Education | 275 |
| | 2.2. | The N | Normative Content of the Right to Education in International | |
| | | | nn Rights Law | 278 |
| 3. | The | Right t | to Inclusive Education: Article 24 of the CRPD | 281 |
| | | | Concept of Inclusive Education | 281 |
| | 3.2. | A Leg | gal Interpretation of Article 24 of the CRPD | 284 |

| | 3.3. | The C | Obligations of States under Article 24 of the CRPD | 289 |
|-----|-------|-------------------------------------|---|------------|
| | | 3.3.1. | Non-Discrimination in Education | 289 |
| | | 3.3.2. | Reasonable Accommodations and Other Individualised | |
| | | | Support Measures | 293 |
| | | 3.3.3. | Appropriate Forms of Communication, Training for | |
| | | | Teachers and Lifelong Learning | 294 |
| 4. | Asse | essmen | t by the CRPD Committee of the Measures Taken by States | |
| | | | cle 24 of the CRPD | 296 |
| | | | oportionate Burden/Cost Considerations | |
| | | | lity Considerations | |
| | | | ty Considerations | |
| | | | Necessity and Effectiveness of Measures Taken to Ensure the | 200 |
| | | | to Inclusive Education | 301 |
| | 4 5 | | cipation of Persons with Disabilities in the Provision of | 501 |
| | 1.0. | | sive Education | 301 |
| | 46 | | -Party Benefits | |
| 5. | | | Trends in Inclusive Education Provision in States Parties to | 302 |
| ٥. | | | | 303 |
| | | | Practices in Inclusive Education Provision. | |
| | | | Practices in Inclusive Education Provision | |
| 6. | | | L | |
| 0. | Con | Ciusion | | 500 |
| Cha | pter | R | | |
| | | | e Influence of the CRPD on the Council of Europe | 311 |
| | | J | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · | |
| 1. | Intro | oductio | on | 311 |
| 2. | Case | e Study | Part 1: The Influence of the CRPD on the Interpretation of | |
| | | | | 313 |
| | | | duction to the Case Study (Part I) | |
| | | | Relevance of the CRPD to the Interpretation by the European | |
| | | | t of Human Rights of the ECHR | 313 |
| | 2.3 | | nterpretation of the Equality Norm in the ECHR | |
| 3. | | | Part I: The Influence of the CRPD on the Interpretation of | 510 |
| ٥. | | | hts | 320 |
| | | \sim | ightened Standard of Scrutiny of Disability Rights at the | 320 |
| | 5.1. | | R: The 'Vulnerable Groups Approach' | 320 |
| | | | A Positive Step in the Direction of Substantive Equality | |
| | | | A Heightened Standard of Scrutiny of Disability Rights | |
| | | | | |
| | | | A Failure to Recognise Systemic Disadvantage | 377 |
| | | | A Failure to Recognise Systemic Disadvantage | |
| | | 3.1.4. | Further Evidence of a Heightened Standard of Scrutiny | |
| | | 3.1.4. | Further Evidence of a Heightened Standard of Scrutiny The Social-Contextual Approach – Steps in the Direction of | 326 |
| | | 3.1.4. 3.1.5. | Further Evidence of a Heightened Standard of Scrutiny The Social-Contextual Approach – Steps in the Direction of the Social Model of Disability? | 326 328 |
| | 2.2 | 3.1.4. 3.1.5. 3.1.6. | Further Evidence of a Heightened Standard of Scrutiny The Social-Contextual Approach – Steps in the Direction of the Social Model of Disability? | 326 328 |
| | 3.2. | 3.1.4. 3.1.5. 3.1.6. De Fa | Further Evidence of a Heightened Standard of Scrutiny The Social-Contextual Approach – Steps in the Direction of the Social Model of Disability? | 326 328 |

| | | 3.2.1. | De Fact | o Reasonable Accommodation Duties in Prison | |
|-----|---------|--------|-----------|--|-----|
| | | | Settings | : Pre-CRPD | 335 |
| | | 3.2.2. | Post-CR | APD Case Law on Disabled Prisoners | 337 |
| | | | 3.2.2.1. | A Marked Absence of Reference to the CRPD in | |
| | | | | the ECtHR's Case Law on Disabled Prisoners | 337 |
| | | | 3.2.2.2. | Increased Recognition of the CRPD in the | |
| | | | | ECtHR's Case Law on Disabled Prisoners | 338 |
| | | | 3.2.2.3. | The Vulnerable Groups Approach: An Obligation | |
| | | | | to Take 'Reasonable Steps' | 341 |
| | | | 3.2.2.4. | An Inconsistent Approach to International Law as | |
| | | | | an Interpretative Guide to ECHR Rights | 344 |
| | | 3.2.3. | Conclus | ion on De Facto Reasonable Accommodations in | |
| | | | Instituti | onal Settings | 346 |
| 4. | Case | Study | Part I: T | The Potential Influence of the CRPD on the | |
| | Interp | retati | on of the | Right to Equality for Persons with Disabilities | |
| | | | | | 347 |
| | | | | ecognition of a Duty to Accommodate under the | |
| | | | | Discrimination Provision? | 348 |
| | | | | e Groups Approach as a Facilitator of Substantive | |
| | | | | Context of Disability Rights? | 350 |
| | | | | tual Analysis and the Social Model of Disability | |
| | | | | Pre-Cursor to a Mainstreaming Approach | |
| _ | | | | tation of the ECHR? | 354 |
| 5. | | | | The CRPD, General Disability Policy of the Council | 2.5 |
| | | | | evised European Social Charter | 356 |
| | | | | d Council of Europe Policy Instruments on Disability | 356 |
| | | | | PD: The Council of Europe Disability Action Plan | 356 |
| | | 5.1.2. | | RPD: Committee of Ministers' Recommendations on | 358 |
| | | 512 | | ty | 363 |
| | | | | I the Revised European Social Charter | 366 |
| | | | | the Revised European Social Charter | 300 |
| | | J.Z.1. | | ised European Social Charter | 369 |
| | | 522 | | PD Collective Complaints on the Right to Education. | 369 |
| | | | | APD Collective Complaints on the Right to Education | 372 |
| 6. | | | | | 374 |
| 0. | Conc | doron | | | 5 / |
| Cha | pter 9. | , | | | |
| Con | cludin | g Cha | pter: Fi | ndings, Conclusions and Recommendations | 377 |
| | G | | 0.0 | | 2== |
| 1. | | | | Objectives | |
| 2. | | | | Conclusions | |
| | | | | | |
| | | | | | |
| | 2.3. | Findir | igs and C | Conclusions | 379 |

Contents

| | | 2.3.1. The Gaps in the Protection of the Rights of Persons with | |
|-----|------|---|-----|
| | | Disabilities Pre-CRPD | 380 |
| | | 2.3.2. The Legal Meaning of Equality in the CRPD | |
| | | – A Theoretical and Comparative Framework | 380 |
| | | 2.3.3. Lessons Drawn from the Outer Limits of the Duty to | |
| | | | 384 |
| | | 2.3.4. A Proposed Framework for the Progressive Realisation of | |
| | | Rights in the CRPD | 385 |
| | | 2.3.5. The Interrelationship between the Accessibility Obligation | |
| | | 1 3 | 388 |
| | | 2.3.6. The Right to Education for Persons with Disabilities | 389 |
| | | 2.3.7. The Influence of the CRPD on Council of Europe Disability | |
| | | <u> </u> | 391 |
| 3. | Maii | n Recommendations | 393 |
| | 3.1. | Recommendations for the CRPD Committee | 393 |
| | 3.2. | Recommendations at the National Level (EU and beyond) | 394 |
| | 3.3. | Recommendations for the Council of Europe Mechanisms | 394 |
| 4. | Con | cluding Remarks | 395 |
| Sum | marv | in English | 397 |
| | - | ion Addendum | |
| | | ım Vitae | |
| | | phv | |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

American with Disabilities Act (ADA)

Centre for Studies on Inclusive Education (CSIE)

Court of Justice of the European Union (CJEU)

Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE)

Education For All (EFA)

Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (EEOC)

European Committee of Social Rights (ECSR)

European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)

European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR)

European Disability Forum (EDF)

Human Rights Committee (HRC)

Hyper Text Markup Language (HTML)

Information and Communications Technology (ICT)

International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (ICF)

International Classification of Impairments, Disabilities and Handicaps (ICIDH)

International Disability Alliance (IDA)

International Disability Caucus (IDC)

International Labour Organization (ILO)

International Law Commission (ILC)

International Year of Disabled Persons (IYDP)

Mental Disability Advocacy Center (MDAC)

National Human Rights Institutions (NHRI)

Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs)

Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR)

Optional Protocol to the CRPD (OP-CRPD)

Optional Protocol to the Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (OP-ICESCR)

Organisations of People with Disabilities (DPOs)

Union of the Physically Impaired Against Segregation (UPIAS)

United Nations (UN)

United Nation's Children's Fund (UNICEF)

United Nations Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (UNCESCR)

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW Committee)

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD Committee)

United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC Committee)

United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW)

United Nations Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD)

United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD)

United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT)

World Conference on Education for All (WCEFA)

World Declaration on Education for All (WEA)

World Federation of the Deaf (WFD)

World Health Organisation (WHO)

World Institute on Disability (WID)

World Programme of Action Concerning Disabled Persons (WPA)