

FROM SOCIAL COMPETITION
TO SOCIAL DUMPING

Edited by
Jan BUELENS
Marc RIGAUX



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

From Social Competition to Social Dumping
© The editors and contributors severally 2016

The editors and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

ISBN 978-1-78068-352-2
D/2016/7849/47
NUR 825

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

PREFACE

“From Social Competition to Social Dumping” is the title of the collection of papers written on the occasion of the symposium which took place in Antwerp on 20 and 21 November 2014. In this book the phenomenon of social dumping is looked at in the wider context of the liberalized social competition as steered by the European Union. Special attention is paid to the harrowing dumping practices in the road transport sector. Therefore this publication contains a number of testimonies by people who actively fight social dumping. Some of the authors also examine the phenomenon of social dumping in relation to compliance with every worker’s fundamental right to respect for his/her dignity as a human being. In this respect, the underlying question is whether, by tolerating legislation that allows human dignity to be violated by social dumping, the European and national legislators do not infringe on the primary fundamental right...

Marc Rigaux
Jan Buelens

CONTENTS

Preface v

PART I. CONTRIBUTIONS

Chapter 1.

The Right to Human Dignity at Stake

Marc RIGAUX 3

1. Introduction – a complex social issue shaped and provoked by European law 3
2. The free labour market and free social competition as the foundations of labour relations 7
 - 2.1. Free market economy, free labour market and free social competition 7
 - 2.1.1. Market economy as a reference system 7
 - 2.1.2. The free labour market and the commercialization of labour 7
 - 2.1.3. Labour as an object of social competition 8
 - 2.1.4. Free social competition: concept, types and consequences 9
 - 2.2. The free labour market and free social competition: structural legal anchoring 10
 - 2.2.1. Free labour market and free social competition: cornerstones of a legal order 10
 - 2.2.2. Labour relations and free social competition: market relations and power relations 11
 - 2.2.3. Structural anchoring in law 12
3. Free social competition, social exploitation and social exclusion 12
 - 3.1. Social exploitation and social exclusion: inevitable consequences of free social competition 12
 - 3.2. Social exploitation and social exclusion: proposal of typification 13
4. Free social competition and the right to dignity at work: the necessity of social corrections of the labour market 15
 - 4.1. Functions and objectives of social law 15
 - 4.2. Content and scope of the corrections 15

4.3.	Conditions necessary for the application of social corrections	16
4.4.	Limits to the corrections	16
5.	Fair and unfair social competition versus social dumping	16
5.1.	Fair and unfair social competition: a legal fact	16
5.2.	Unfair social competition and social dumping: congruous legal concepts?	17
6.	Social dumping and the right to dignity at work	19
6.1.	The right to dignity at work: a primary fundamental right.	19
6.2.	The absolute and relative scope of the right to human dignity.	19
6.3.	Lack of respect for human dignity, an intrinsic element of social dumping	20
7.	Lack of respect for human dignity (at work): a structural defect of European market law?	20

Chapter 2.

Human Dignity of Workers and Competition

	Wolfgang DÄUBLER.	21
1.	Point of departure: the worker treated as an object	21
2.	Mitigating the situation.	21
2.1.	The indispensable worker	21
2.2.	Protection by labour law	22
2.3.	Collective agreements	22
2.4.	Informal rules	23
3.	Returning to the market forces	23
4.	Internationalization of the markets.	24
5.	Using information technology	25
6.	Proposals to improve the situation	26
6.1.	Better trade unions?	26
6.2.	Mobilizing public opinion.	28
6.3.	Collective action on the Internet	31
7.	Perspectives	32

Chapter 3.

Social Dumping: A Symptom of the European Construction.

An Exploratory Study of Social Dumping in Road Transport

	Jan BUELENS and Lies MICHELSEN	33
1.	Introduction	33
2.	The European construction	36
2.1.	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union	36

2.1.1.	Separate title on transport in the TFEU: a common transport policy	36
2.1.2.	Free movement of workers, freedom of establishment and free movement of services	38
2.1.2.1.	Free movement of workers	38
2.1.2.2.	Freedom of establishment	39
2.1.2.3.	Free movement of services	39
2.1.2.4.	The case law of the Court of Justice	40
2.1.2.5.	Restrictions on free movement	41
2.2.	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	44
2.3.	The relation between the internal market and the fundamental social rights	45
2.4.	Conclusion	45
3.	Other European rules and regulations relevant to the road transport sector	46
3.1.	Private international law	46
3.2.	Access to the market in the international carriage of goods by roads: Regulation 1071/2009	49
3.3.	Cabotage regulations	50
3.4.	The Posted Workers and Enforcement Directives	52
3.5.	Material law applicable	56
3.6.	Conclusion	57
4.	Some avenues to combat social dumping in road transport	57
4.1.	Towards an upward harmonization of the various social and fiscal laws of the Member States	58
4.2.	The fundamental social rights must be reinforced	58
4.2.1.	Social progress clause	59
4.2.2.	Fundamental rights test	59
4.3.	No further liberalization of cabotage rights and harsher cabotage rules	59
4.3.1.	No further liberalization	59
4.3.2.	Harsher cabotage rules	60
4.4.	New connecting factor in private international law	61
4.5.	Better monitoring of the application of European Regulation 1071/2009	61
4.6.	Conclusion	62
5.	Conclusion	62

Chapter 4.

The Territorial Application of Labour Law in the EU Internal Market.

On Legal Rules and Economic Interests

Herwig VERSCHUEREN	63
1. Introduction	63
2. In principle labour law continues to be a matter of national competence	64
3. The territorial application of labour law in cross-border situations.	66
3.1. Principle: free movement of workers.	66
3.2. The territorial application of labour law and private international law.	68
3.3. The territorial application of labour law under pressure as a result of the free movement of services	69
3.3.1. Free movement of services and the territorial application of labour law	69
3.3.2. The Posted Workers Directive.	70
3.3.2.1. Objectives and content	70
3.3.2.2. The Member States' ability to organize efficient control of compliance with the applicable employment provisions	74
3.4. The posted workers' position at the crossroads of legal rules and of economic interests	77
4. Conclusion.	82

Chapter 5.

The Tense Relationship Between Labour Market Rights and Respect for Dignity at Work: European Dimension

Barbara KRESAL.	85
1. Labour market as an integral part of a broader concept of the market	85
2. (Neo)liberal model and the precarisation of society.	87
3. The European Union is following the same neoliberal trends	88
4. Freedom of establishment and freedom of services versus dignity at work, fundamental social rights and free movement of workers	94
5. Human rights approach.	95
6. Conclusion.	96

Chapter 6.**Limiting the Role of Public Authorities in the Deployment of Services.
The Tense Relationship between Labour Market Rights and Respect
for Dignity at Work, Limiting the Role of Public Authorities in the
Deployment of Services**

Gian Guido BALANDI	99
1. Social services in general	99
2. What is the relationship between public and private subjects?	102
3. The limitation of the role of public authorities: effects as regards the citizens	103
4. Effects of the limitation as regards employees	104

Chapter 7.**Do we Need a New Conflict-of-Laws Rule for Labour in the European
Road Transport Sector? Yes We Do**

Fieke VAN OVERBEEKE	107
1. Introduction	107
2. Legal framework	108
2.1. Freedom of services and freedom of establishment	108
2.2. Conflict of laws – Article 8 Rome I Regulation	109
2.2.1. Article 8(1) Rome I Regulation	109
2.2.2. Article 8(2), (3) and (4) Rome I Regulation	110
2.2.3. A difficult regime applicable to a difficult sector	111
3. Case law of Article 8 Rome I Regulation	111
3.1. <i>Koelzsch</i> case – broad habitual workplace principle	112
3.2. <i>Voogsgeerd</i> case – confirmation	113
3.3. Provisional review	113
3.3.1. Broad interpretation desirable to mitigate bold flag out operations	113
3.3.2. Still, not a solution	114
3.3.3. Risk of an incorrect interpretation of the <i>Koelzsch</i> elements – <i>Ryanair</i> case	116
3.3.4. Possibilities through the escape clause?	117
3.3.5. Summary	117
3.4. <i>Schlecker</i> case – qualification of the reasoning of the Court in <i>Koelzsch</i>	118
3.4.1. Evaluation – effect on road transport situations?	119
4. Final remarks	120

Chapter 8.

The Right to Human Dignity: Ultimate Limit to Social Competition and Market Freedoms

Ferran CAMAS RODA	123
1. Introduction	123
2. Human dignity in the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	124
3. References to human dignity in the Treaties of the European Union and derived legislation	127
4. Human dignity as an integrated, transversal assumption	130
4.1. The effects of dignity in relation to work	130
4.2. A threat to labour law: the devaluation of work	131
5. Conclusions	135

PART II. TESTIMONIES FROM THE FIELD

Chapter 9.

The National Legal Battle against Social Exploitation in Austria

Walter GAGAWCZUK	139
1. The wage system in Austria	139
2. The Anti-Wage and Social Dumping Act	140
3. Applicable law for cross-border employment in the transport sector . . .	141

Chapter 10.

Fighting the Grey Economy with National Legislation. The Case of Finland

Heini POLAMO	143
1. Introduction	143
2. Commercial goods transport and grey economy in Finland	144
3. Finnish hauliers support strong measures to fight the grey economy . . .	144

Chapter 11.

The National Legal Battle against Social Exploitation. National Practices of Finnish Labour Inspection

Jarno VIRTANEN	147
--------------------------	-----