

REFUGEES FROM ARMED CONFLICT

The 1951 Refugee Convention and
International Humanitarian Law

Vanessa HOLZER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Refugees from Armed Conflict. The 1951 Refugee Convention and International
Humanitarian Law
Vanessa Holzer

© 2015 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-318-8
D/2015/7849/100
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

To my mother Hildegard

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is based on my doctoral thesis which was accepted by the Law Faculty of Goethe University in Frankfurt in 2014. I am very grateful to my supervisor Professor Dr Rainer Hofmann for his support. I also wish to thank Professor Dr Stefan Kadelbach for acting as my examiner.

This book would not have been possible without the support from a number of people. While in Heidelberg I learned a great deal from Professor Dr Ulrich Beyerlin, and Dr Christine Fuchs provided encouragement. When conducting a study for UNHCR, Dr Alice Edwards, Dr Cornelis Wouters and many others lent assistance. Dr Nina Burri, Dr Anthony Cullen, Dr Sarah Nouwen and Dr Ruvi Ziegler offered helpful comments on draft chapters. Michael Meyer OBE provided invaluable support and inspiration during my time at the British Red Cross. The German National Academic Foundation funded my doctoral research. I am grateful to them all. Any errors are of course my own.

Last but not least I thank my husband Wes for being there for me during each and every step of this journey. I am grateful to my mother Hildegard for her support and encouragement. This book is dedicated to her.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii

Chapter 1. Introduction

1

1. Overview of the Topic	1
2. Structure of the Book	9
2.1. Research Questions and Objectives	9
2.2. Methodology and Sources	10
2.2.1. General Observations	10
2.2.2. The Views of UNHCR and its Executive Committee	12
2.2.3. Customary International Humanitarian Law	14
2.3. Scope of the Book	18
2.3.1. Delimitations	18
2.3.2. Definition of Armed Conflict	19
2.4. Outline of the Book	22

Chapter 2. The Historical Evolution of International Refugee Law in Light of Armed Conflict

27

1. Introduction	27
2. The Inter-War Period	27
2.1. Arrangements for Russian and Armenian Refugees	27
2.2. Arrangements for Refugees from Germany	31
3. The Aftermath of the Second World War and Beyond	32
3.1. The Establishment of the International Refugee Organisation	33
3.2. The Creation of UNHCR and the Evolution of its Mandate	34
3.3. The Adoption of the Refugee Convention and its Protocol	36
4. Conclusion	38

Chapter 3. The International Legal Framework for the Protection of the Individual in Armed Conflict

41

1. Introduction	41
2. The Protection of the Individual in Armed Conflict	42
2.1. International Human Rights Law	43

2.2. International Humanitarian Law	46
2.2.1. Material Scope of Protection	46
2.2.2. Protection of Nationals and Stateless Persons	49
2.3. International Criminal Law	63
2.4. Result	64
3. Interactions.	65
3.1. The Refugee Convention and Other Branches of International Law . .	65
3.1.1. International Human Rights Law	65
3.1.2. International Humanitarian Law	68
3.1.3. International Criminal Law	71
3.1.4. Result	72
3.2. International Humanitarian Law and International Human Rights Law	73
3.3. Result	77
4. Conceptual Approaches	77
4.1. Fragmentation	77
4.2. The International Law for Humankind.	78
4.3. Discussion	80
4.4. Result	80
5. Conclusion	81
Chapter 4. The Interpretation of the Refugee Definition	83
1. Introduction	83
2. Armed Conflict and Refugee Status Determination	83
3. Interpretative Methods and Actors.	88
3.1. Overview	88
3.2. UNHCR and its Executive Committee	94
3.3. Interpreting the Refugee Definition in Light of International Law . .	95
3.3.1. International Human Rights Law	95
3.3.2. Customary International Humanitarian Law	97
3.3.3. International Criminal Law	101
4. Conclusion	102
Chapter 5. The Well-Founded Fear of Being Persecuted.	105
1. Introduction	105
2. Well-Founded Fear	105
2.1. Burden of Proof and Standard of Proof.	105
2.2. Risk Assessment	107
2.2.1. Subjective-Objective Approach versus Objective Approach . .	107
2.2.2. Individualisation	110
2.3. Result	112

3. The Human Rights-Based Interpretation of Persecution	113
3.1. Hierarchical Approach.	113
3.2. Two-Tiered Approach.	114
3.3. Discussion	115
3.3.1. General Observations	115
3.3.2. Material Scope in Peace and Armed Conflict	116
3.3.3. Persecutors.	118
3.3.4. Victims of Persecution.	120
3.4. Result	121
4. Persecution in Light of Customary International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law	121
4.1. Violations of Customary International Humanitarian Law in General.	121
4.2. War Crimes as Intensity Yardstick.	127
4.3. Result	128
5. A Complementary Approach to Understanding Persecution in Armed Conflict	129
5.1. Overview	129
5.2. <i>Lex specialis derogat legi generali?</i>	131
5.3. Selected Forms of Persecution	134
5.3.1. Use of Lethal Force.	134
5.3.2. Torture	140
5.3.3. Rape and Other Forms of Sexual Violence.	142
5.3.4. Enforced Disappearance	143
5.3.5. Forced Recruitment or Participation of Children in Hostilities	145
5.3.6. Starvation as a Method of Warfare	148
5.3.7. Use of Chemical Weapons	151
5.3.8. Forced Displacement as a Method of Warfare.	152
5.3.9. Arbitrary Deprivation of Liberty.	156
5.4. Result	162
6. Conclusion	163
 Chapter 6. Lack of Protection in the Country of Origin.	 165
1. Introduction	165
2. Lack of Protection	165
2.1. Textual and Conceptual Bases	165
2.2. Providers of Protection	168
2.3. Effectiveness of Protection	170
2.4. Result	173
3. Internal Protection Alternative.	174
3.1. Textual and Conceptual Bases	174

3.2. Criteria for the Existence of an Internal Protection Alternative.	175
3.2.1. Accessibility.	176
3.2.2. Protection in the Narrow Sense.	177
3.2.3. Protection in the Broader Sense.	179
3.3. Result	180
4. Conclusion	181

Chapter 7. The Nexus to a Refugee Convention Ground in Armed Conflict 183

1. Introduction	183
2. The Nexus Requirement in International Refugee Law.	184
2.1. The Causal Relationship.	184
2.2. The Standard of Causation	185
2.3. Comparative versus Non-Comparative Approach	186
2.4. Context of Armed Conflict	189
2.5. Result	190
3. The Nexus Requirement in Light of Customary International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law	191
3.1. General Observations.	191
3.2. The Principle of Military Necessity	192
3.2.1. The Notion of Military Necessity.	193
3.2.2. Rules Implicitly Referring to Military Necessity.	195
3.2.3. Rules Explicitly Referring to Military Necessity.	198
3.3. The Principle of Distinction	200
3.4. The Principle of Proportionality.	204
3.5. Result	207
4. The Refugee Convention Grounds	208
4.1. Race, Religion, Nationality	208
4.2. Membership of a Particular Social Group	211
4.3. Political Opinion.	213
5. Conclusion	218

Chapter 8. Conclusion 219

Bibliography 227

ABBREVIATIONS

AIT	Asylum and Immigration Tribunal
BGBL	<i>Bundesgesetzblatt</i> (Federal Law Gazette)
BVerwG	<i>Bundesverwaltungsgericht</i> (Federal Administrative Court)
BIA	Board of Immigration Appeals
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CLR	Commonwealth Law Reports
CNDA	<i>Cour nationale du droit d'asile</i> (National Asylum Court)
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DRC	Democratic Republic of the Congo
CanLII	Canadian Legal Information Institute
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
Cir.	Circuit
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECOSOC	United Nations Economic and Social Council
e.g.	<i>exempli gratia</i>
ER	English Reports
EU	European Union
ELN	<i>Ejército de Liberación Nacional</i> (National Liberation Army)
EWCA	England and Wales Court of Appeal
EXCOM	Executive Committee
FARC	<i>Fuerzas Armadas Revolucionarias de Colombia</i> (Revolutionary Armed Forces of Colombia)
FC	Federal Court
FCA	Federal Court of Appeal
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross

ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IFOR	Implementation Force
IHL	international humanitarian law
Imm AR	Immigration Appeal Reports
INLR	Immigration and Nationality Law Reports
INS	Immigration and Naturalization Service
IPA	internal protection alternative
IRB	Immigration and Refugee Board
i.e.	<i>id est</i>
LNTS	League of Nations Treaty Series
LTTE	Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam
mn	margin number
NVwZ	<i>Neue Zeitschrift für Verwaltungsrecht</i> (New Journal for Administrative Law)
NZRSAA	New Zealand Refugee Status Appeals Authority
MIMA	Minister for Immigration and Multicultural Affairs
OJ	Official Journal
para.	paragraph
QB	Queen's Bench
RRTA	Refugee Review Tribunal of Australia
SCR	Supreme Court Reports
SSHD	Secretary of State for the Home Department
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UK	United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
UKAIT	United Kingdom Asylum and Immigration Tribunal
UKHL	United Kingdom House of Lords
US	United States of America
UN	United Nations
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
VG	<i>Verwaltungsgericht</i> (Administrative Court)
VGH	<i>Verwaltungsgerichtshof</i> (Higher Administrative Court)
WL	Westlaw Transcripts
WLR	Weekly Law Reports