

INTERNATIONAL ACTORS  
AND TRADITIONAL JUSTICE  
IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA

Policies and Interventions in Transitional  
Justice and Justice Sector Aid

*Edited by*  
Eva BREMS  
Giselle CORRADI  
Martien SCHOTSMANS



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58<sup>th</sup> Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinierstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

International Actors and Traditional Justice in Sub-Saharan Africa. Policies and Interventions in Transitional Justice and Justice Sector Aid  
Eva Brems, Giselle Corradi and Martien Schotsmans (eds.)

© 2015 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover © Юлия Снегирева – Thinkstock.com

ISBN: 978-1-78068-287-7  
Depot no.: D/2015/7849/5  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## PREFACE

This book originates in a research project conducted by the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University (UG) in partnership with the University of Cape Town (UCT). The project 'Addressing Traditional Law in Post-Conflict Judicial and Legal Development Aid in Sub-Sahara Africa' (AFTRALAW) was funded by the Belgian Science Policy Office (BELSPO) from April 2008 to March 2011, and was carried out under the supervision of Professor Eva Brems (UG) and Professors Thomas Bennett and Christina Murray (UCT), with Martien Schotsmans as a researcher for the component on transitional justice (UG) and Giselle Corradi (UG) and Lia Nijzink (UCT) as researchers for the component on justice sector aid. An initial version of the results of this three-year policy-supportive research was published in Dutch in Bennett, Brems, Corradi, Nijzink and Schotsmans' *Internationale Actoren en Traditioneel Recht in Sub-Sahara Afrika: Beleid en Interventies op het Vlak van Transitional Justice en Ontwikkelingshulp aan de Justitiesector* (Academia Press).

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The editors of this book wish to thank the Belgian Science Policy Office for funding the AFTRALAW research project (Addressing Traditional Law in Legal and Judicial Development Aid in Sub-Saharan Africa) that gave rise to this book, and in particular Mrs Margarida Freire and her predecessor, Mrs Zakia Khattabi, for their enthusiasm and support throughout the course of the research. We are also grateful to the scientific committee that followed up the project from beginning to end for providing their input and advice: Mrs Lara Deramaix, Prof. Marie-Claire Foblets, Mr Renaud Galand, Prof. Em. Luc Huyse, Mr Robert Olbrechts, Prof. Barbara Oomen, Mr Dick Oosting, Prof. Stephan Parmentier, Prof. Filip Reyntjens, Dr Heidy Rombouts, Dr Stef Vandeginste, Mr Marc Van Wymeersch and Mr Pierre Vincke. We are also much indebted to Dr Marleen Renders who played a key role in the design of the AFTRALAW project and the acquisition of the funding that made the research possible, as well as to our South African partners, Prof. Tom Bennett, Prof. Christina Murray and Mrs Lia Nijzink from the University of Cape Town with whom we collaborated in the course of the research. Our thanks are also due to all the interviewees who dedicated their time and shared their views with us during the fieldwork. A word of thanks also goes out to the keynote speakers and participants in the focus group discussions held during the ‘Traditional Justice and the Role of External Actors in Africa’ international forum organised in Cape Town from 23 to 25 March 2010: Mrs Jane Frances Adongo, Prof. Joe Alie, Mr Littleton Braima, Mr Abdul Carimo, Mr Jacob Chibwe, Mr Peter Chinoko, Prof. Danwood Chirwa, Dr Aninka Claassens, Mrs Olayinka Creighton-Randall, Mr Custodio Dumas, Mrs Charlotte Duncan, Mr Gratien Dusingizimana, Mr Christian Eldon, Mr Anastase Gakire, Prof. Chuma Himonga, Mrs Urusaro Alice Karekezi, Mr Fergus Kerrigan, Mr Daniel Komakech, Mr Sheku A. Koroma, Mr Kenan Manda, Mr Greg Moran, Dr Sindiso Msihi, Mr Daniel Muwolobi, Mr Freddy Mutanguha, Mrs Annette Nhekairo, Mrs Frieda Nicolai, Mr Lino Owor Ogara, Mr Kenneth Akena Oketta, Mr Robert Olbrechts, Mr Benedict Sannoh, Mr Monfred Sesay, Ms Emily Sikazwe, Mrs Yasmin Sooka, Mrs Katja Taela, Mr Hugo Van der Merwe and Mr Charles Villa-Vicencio, as well as the keynote speakers and panel participants of the ‘International Actors and Traditional Justice in Sub-Saharan Africa: Policies and Practices in Justice Sector Aid and Transitional Justice’ international seminar held in Brussels on 14 February 2011: Dr Phil Clark, Dr Tanja Chopra, Mrs Jacky Devis, Mr Mark Freeman, Prof. Anne Griffiths, Mr Fergus Kerrigan, Mrs Kersty McCourt, Mr Robert Olbrechts, Mr Mark Salter, Mr Albrecht Stockmayer and

Dr Stef Vandeginste. Finally, we wish to thank Ms Martine Dewulf for her administrative support in the course of the project and her assistance with setting up the bibliography for this book.

# CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i> .....	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....	xv

## PART I. GENERAL INTRODUCTION

<b>Chapter 1. International Actors and Traditional Justice in Africa</b>	
Giselle CORRADI and Martien SCHOTSMANS .....	3
1. Introduction .....	3
2. Methodological Choices .....	8
3. Structure of the Book .....	10
Bibliography .....	11

## PART II. INTERNATIONAL ACTORS AND TRADITIONAL JUSTICE IN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

<b>Chapter 2. The Role of Tradition in Transitional Justice</b>	
Martien SCHOTSMANS .....	19
1. Aim and Scope of the Research .....	19
2. Methodology .....	20
3. Conceptual Framework .....	22
3.1. Transitional Justice .....	22
3.2. Traditional and Tradition-Based Mechanisms in Transitional Justice .....	24
3.3. Traditional Values .....	26
Bibliography .....	28

**Chapter 3. The Policy of International Actors on Traditional Justice in Transitional Justice**

Martien SCHOTSMANS ..... 31

1. The Context of Policy Development..... 31

    1.1. Globalisation in International Criminal Law, Peacebuilding and Human Rights..... 31

    1.2. Localisation in Transitional Justice..... 33

    1.3. Local Ownership and Harmonisation in Development Cooperation..... 33

2. Policies regarding Traditional Mechanisms in Transitional Justice ..... 35

    2.1. Policies regarding Transitional Justice ..... 35

    2.2. Policies regarding Traditional Mechanisms ..... 37

3. Conclusion ..... 39

Bibliography ..... 40

**Chapter 4. Non-Official Use of Tradition: A Case Study on Sierra Leone**

Martien SCHOTSMANS ..... 43

1. Background to the Conflict ..... 43

2. The Role of Tradition in Society ..... 44

3. Transitional Justice Landscape ..... 45

4. The Role of Tradition in Transitional Justice..... 46

5. Policies and Interventions of International Actors ..... 51

Bibliography ..... 53

**Chapter 5. Official Hybridisation of Tradition: A Case Study on Rwanda**

Martien SCHOTSMANS ..... 55

1. Background to the Conflict ..... 55

2. The Role of Tradition in Society ..... 56

3. Transitional Justice Landscape ..... 56

4. The Role of Tradition in Transitional Justice..... 57

    4.1. Gacaca Courts (*Inkiko Gacaca*)..... 58

    4.2. NURC: Traditional Values of Unity and Reconciliation ..... 61

5. Policies and Interventions of International Actors ..... 63

Bibliography ..... 67

<b>Chapter 6. Official Complementarity: A Case Study on Northern Uganda</b>	
Martien SCHOTSMANS .....	71
1. Background to the Conflict .....	71
2. The Role of Tradition in Society .....	72
3. Transitional Justice Landscape .....	73
4. The Role of Tradition in Transitional Justice.....	74
5. Policies and Interventions of International Actors .....	77
Bibliography .....	82
<b>Chapter 7. Tradition in Transitional Justice: Between Localisation and Globalisation</b>	
Martien SCHOTSMANS .....	85
1. Introduction .....	85
2. Local Ownership .....	85
2.1. State Ownership .....	86
2.2. National Ownership.....	88
3. Fragmented Approach to Tradition .....	91
4. Hybridisation .....	94
Bibliography .....	99
PART III. INTERNATIONAL ACTORS AND TRADITIONAL JUSTICE IN JUSTICE SECTOR AID	
<b>Chapter 8. At the Crossroads of Theory and Practice</b>	
Giselle CORRADI .....	103
1. Introduction .....	103
2. Conceptual Framework.....	106
3. Situating the Study within Broader Debates .....	107
4. Multi-Sited Qualitative Research Methods .....	112
5. Structure of Part III .....	114
Bibliography .....	115



**Chapter 9. Justice Sector Aid in Legally Plural Africa**

Giselle CORRADI..... 121

1. Introduction ..... 121

2. The Plural Justice Landscapes of Sub-Saharan Africa..... 121

    2.1. Legal Pluralism in Historical Perspective ..... 121

    2.2. Local Normative Orders and Dispute Processing Forums ..... 125

    2.3. Local Legal Orders and Human Rights ..... 128

3. Justice Sector and Human Rights Aid in Sub-Saharan Africa:  
    The Emergent Engagement with Local Legal Orders ..... 134

4. Conclusion ..... 137

Bibliography ..... 138

**Chapter 10. Linking Socio-Legal Theory and Justice Sector Aid**

Giselle CORRADI..... 143

1. Introduction ..... 143

2. Legal Pluralism and Justice Sector Aid ..... 143

    2.1. Looking Beyond State Justice ..... 144

    2.2. Considering How Legal Orders Intersect Each Other ..... 145

    2.3. Assessing the Legal Nature of Normative Orders and  
        the Distinctiveness of State Law ..... 147

    2.4. Understanding Legal Orders as Resources ..... 148

    2.5. How ‘the Legal’ is Defined ..... 149

3. Advancing Human Rights Cross-Contextually ..... 150

    3.1. Reconceptualising Human Rights’ Universality ..... 151

    3.2. Reconceptualising Culture and Customs..... 152

    3.3. Understanding and Supporting Local Dynamics of Change ..... 154

4. Conclusion ..... 157

Bibliography ..... 158

**Chapter 11. Traditional Law through a State Lens: A Case Study  
on Malawi**

Lia NIJZINK ..... 163

1. Introduction ..... 163

2. Historical Background..... 163

3. The Justice Landscape ..... 165

4. The Institutional Framework for Legal Pluralism ..... 165

5. The Human Rights Landscape..... 167

6. International Actors and Local Legal Orders ..... 167

7. Conclusion ..... 170

Bibliography ..... 172

<b>Chapter 12. Polycentric Legal Landscapes: A Case Study on Mozambique</b>	
Giselle CORRADI .....	173
1. Introduction .....	173
2. Colonial and Post-Colonial Background of Legal Pluralism .....	173
3. The Justice Landscape .....	176
4. The Institutional Framework for Legal Pluralism .....	178
5. The Human Rights Landscape.....	180
6. International Actors and Local Legal Orders .....	182
7. Conclusion .....	185
Bibliography .....	187
<b>Chapter 13. Beyond Dichotomies: A Case Study on Sierra Leone</b>	
Giselle CORRADI .....	189
1. Introduction .....	189
2. Colonial and Post-Colonial Background of Legal Pluralism .....	189
3. The Justice Landscape and Institutional Framework for Legal Pluralism .....	190
4. The Human Rights Landscape.....	193
5. International Actors and Local Legal Orders .....	194
6. Conclusion .....	200
Bibliography .....	201
<b>Chapter 14. Traditional Law through a State Lens: A Case Study on Zambia</b>	
Lia NIJZINK .....	205
1. Introduction .....	205
2. Historical Background.....	205
3. The Justice Landscape .....	207
4. The Institutional Framework for Legal Pluralism and Proposed Reforms .....	207
5. The Human Rights Landscape.....	208
6. International Actors and Local Legal Orders .....	209
7. Conclusion .....	212
Bibliography .....	213

**Chapter 15. From Addressing Local Legal Orders to Embracing Legal Pluralism**

Giselle CORRADI and Lia NIJZINK . . . . . 215

1. Introduction . . . . . 215

2. The Context of Interventions . . . . . 215

3. Trends in the Type of Interventions Supported . . . . . 217

    3.1. Law Reform . . . . . 217

    3.2. Institutional Support and Reform . . . . . 217

    3.3. Strengthening the Capacity of Justice Providers . . . . . 218

    3.4. Empowering Justice Seekers . . . . . 219

4. Analysing and Improving Strategies . . . . . 219

    4.1. Addressing the Actors ‘at the Tip of the Iceberg’ . . . . . 219

    4.2. Human Rights within Different Modes of Dispute Processing . . . . . 220

    4.3. Minimal Engagement with Local Knowledge . . . . . 221

    4.4. Approaching Human Rights in a Critical Way . . . . . 222

    4.5. Embracing a Legally Plural Perspective . . . . . 222

5. The Way Forward . . . . . 222

Bibliography . . . . . 225

PART IV. GENERAL CONCLUSION

**Chapter 16. Embracing Legal Pluralism: General Conclusion**

Giselle CORRADI, Lia NIJZINK and Martien SCHOTSMANS . . . . . 229

1. Introduction . . . . . 229

2. Policies in the Field of Traditional Justice . . . . . 230

3. Trends in Interventions Addressing Traditional Justice . . . . . 231

4. Strategies regarding the Tension between Traditional Justice and Human Rights . . . . . 232

5. Recommendations . . . . . 232

    5.1. Recommendations regarding Transitional Justice . . . . . 233

        5.1.1. Refine the Concept of Local Ownership . . . . . 233

        5.1.2. Understand Transitional Justice Holistically . . . . . 234

        5.1.3. Support Transitional Justice as a Hybridisation Process . . . . . 235

    5.2. Recommendations regarding Justice Sector Aid . . . . . 236

        5.2.1. Adopt a Dynamic Perspective on Local Legal Orders and Human Rights . . . . . 236

        5.2.2. Adopt a Legally Plural Perspective . . . . . 236

        5.2.3. Adopt a Power-Informed Perspective . . . . . 237

Bibliography . . . . . 237

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ASF	Avocats Sans Frontières
BTC	Belgische Technische Coöperatie
CDDH	Centre Danois des Droits de l'Homme
CFJJ	Centro de Formação Jurídica e Judiciaria
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DFID	Department for International Development
DPKO	Department for Peace Keeping Operations
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization
GTZ	Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
INGO	international non-governmental organisation
IRCSL	Inter-Religious Council of Sierra Leone
NGO	non-governmental organisation
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OECD-DAC	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development – Development Assistance Committee
PRI	Penal Reform International
RCN Justice & Démocratie	Réseau des Citoyens – Citizens' Network for Justice & Democracy
RPF	Rwandan Patriotic Front
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
TRC	truth and reconciliation commission
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women
UNOHCHR	United Nations Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
UN	United Nations
WLSA	Women and Law in Southern Africa