

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME XLVII:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL
FOR SIERRA LEONE
2009–2011**

**André KLIP, Steven FREELAND (eds.)
Anzinga LOW (assistant editor)**



intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Please cite as: SCSL, Judgment, *Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao*, Case No. SCSL-04-15-A, A. Ch., 26 October 2009, Klip/ Freeland, ALC-XLVII-427.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals
© André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor) 2015

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Luca Cauwenbergh

ISBN 978-1-78068-285-3
D/2016/7849/???
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	9
1. Adjudicated Facts	
Decision on Defence Application for Judicial Notice of Adjudicated Facts from the AFRC Trial Judgement Pursuant to Rule 94(B), <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 23 March 2009	11
Separate and Partly Dissenting Opinion of Justice Teresa Doherty	27
Decision on Defence Application for Judicial Notice of Adjudicated Facts from the RUF Trial Judgement Pursuant to Rule 94(B) and Prosecution Motion for Judicial Notice of Adjudicated Facts from the RUF Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 17 June 2010 . . .	29
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Julia Sebutinde	37
Commentary <i>Jamil Ddamulira Mujuzi</i>	50
2. Joint Criminal Enterprise	
Decision on “Defence Notice of Appeal and Submissions Regarding the Majority Decision Concerning the Pleading of JCE in the Second Amended Indictment”, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-2003-01-A, A. Ch., 1 May 2009	57
Commentary <i>Elysa Vieira</i>	66
3. Disclosure	
Decision on Sesay Defence Motion Requesting the Appeals Chamber to Order the Prosecution to Disclose Rule 68 Material, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-A, A. Ch., 16 June 2009	77
Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King	86
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Honorable Justice Shireen Avis Fisher	90
Decision on Public with Annex A Defence Motion for Admission of Documents Pursuant to Rule 92bis – Newspaper Article, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 5 October 2010	93
Separate Dissenting Opinion of the Honorable Justice Julia Sebutinde	97
Decision on Public with Confidential Annexes A-D Defence Motion for Disclosure of Exculpatory Information Relating to DCT-032, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 20 October 2010	103
Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice Julia Sebutinde	113
Decision on Public with Confidential Annexes A-D Defence Motion for Admission of Documents and Drawing of an Adverse Inference Relating to the Alleged Death of Johnny Paul Koroma, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 11 November 2010	115
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Julia Sebutinde	125
Decision on Defence Appeal Regarding the Decision on the Defence Motion for Admission of Documents and Drawing of an Adverse Inference Relating to the Alleged Death of Johnny Paul Koroma, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, A. Ch., 25 January 2011	131
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King	144

Commentary <i>Tatiana Bachvarova</i>	147
--	-----

4. Preparation for the Defence, Fair Trial and Impartiality

Decision on ‘Defence Notice of Appeal and Submissions Regarding the 4 May 2009 Oral Decision Requiring the Defence to Commence its Case on 29 June 2009’, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, A. Ch., 23 June 2009.	167
Dissenting Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King	175
Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice Emmanuel Ayoola	181
Decision on the Urgent and Public with Annexes A-C Defence Motion to Reopen its Case in Order to Seek Admission of Documents Relating to the Relationship Between the United States Government and the Prosecution of Charles Taylor, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 27 January 2011	185
Declaration of Judge Sebutinde	190
Decision on Urgent and Public with Annexes A-N Defence Motion for Disclosure and/or Investigation of United States Government Sources within the Trial Chamber, the Prosecution and the Registry Based on Leaked USG Cables, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 28 January 2011	191
Declaration of Justice Julia Sebutinde	196
Decision on late filing of Defence final trial brief, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 7 February 2011	197
Dissenting Opinion of Honorable Justice Julia Sebutinde	199
Decision on Defence Motion Seeking Leave to Appeal the Decision on Late Filing of Defence Final Brief, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 11 February 2011	205
Separate Opinion of Justice Doherty	209
Dissenting Opinion of Justice R. B. Lussick	210
Separate Concurring Opinion of Judge Julia Sebutinde	214
Decision on Defence Notice of Appeal and Submissions Regarding the Decision on Late Filing of Defence Final Trial Brief, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, A. Ch., 3 March 2011	217
Separate Opinion of Justice George Gelaga King	232
Commentary <i>Regina Rauxloh</i>	236

5. Admissibility of Evidence

Decision on Prosecution Motion in Relation to the Applicable Legal Standards Governing the Use and Admission of Documents by the Prosecutor during Cross-Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, A. Ch., 30 November 2009	247
Decision on Public with Annex A and Confidential Annex B Urgent Application for Leave to Appeal Oral Decisions of 14 January 2010 on Use of Documents in Cross-Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 29 January 2010.	255
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Teresa Doherty	260

Decision on Urgent Applications for Leave to Appeal Oral Decisions of 18, 21, 25 and 26 January 2010 on Use of Documents in Cross-Examination, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 9 February 2010	261
Separate and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Teresa Doherty.....	268
Decision on the Defence Motion to Exclude Custodial Statements of Issay Sesay, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 12 August 2010	271
Separate Dissenting Opinion of the Honorable Justice Julia Sebutinde.....	274
Commentary <i>Iryna Marchuk</i>	279
6. Contempt	
Decision on Public Defence Notice of Appeal and Submissions Regarding the Decision on the Defence Motion Requesting an Investigation into Contempt of Court by the Office of the Prosecutor and its Investigators, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, A. Ch., 21 January 2011	287
Decision on Public with Confidential Annexes A to E & Public Annex F Urgent Prosecution Motion for an Investigation into Contempt of the Special Court for Sierra Leone and Public with Confidential Annexes A & B Urgent Prosecution Motion for an Investigation into Contempt of the Special Court for Sierra Leone, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 25 February 2011.....	299
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Julia Sebutinde.....	313
Decision on Confidential with Confidential Annexes A-E Prosecution Motion for the Trial Chamber to Summarily Deal with Contempt of the Special Court for Sierra Leone and for Urgent Interim Measures, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03-1-T, T. Ch. II, 24 March 2011	317
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Julia Sebutinde.....	324
Commentary <i>Nico Keijzer</i>	331
7. Judgements	
Sentencing Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-T, T. Ch. I, 8 April 2009	339
Separate and Dissenting Opinion of Justice Pierre G. Boutet	397
Separate Concurring and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Honorable Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe	398
Commentary <i>Barbora Hola</i>	414
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04-15-A, A. Ch., 26 October 2009	427
Separate Concurring Opinion of Justice Renate Winter.....	730
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Gelaga King and Justice Jon Kamanda	731
Separate Opinion of Justice Emmanuel Ayoola	738
Partially Dissenting and Concurring Opinion of Justice Shireen Avis Fischer.....	748
Commentary <i>Ana Maria Torres Chedraui</i>	778
Contributors and Editors	793

PREFACE

This is the forty-seventh volume in the series ‘Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals’ (ALC) and contains the most important decisions of the Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) from 18 March 2009 up to and including 31 December 2011. It is the fifth volume in the series containing decisions of the SCSL. At the time of writing this preface, the SCSL has finalised all its trials in Freetown, Sierra Leone; the convicted persons were transferred very shortly after their convictions were upheld on appeal. It has also finalised its last trial, the Taylor case, in The Hague and has been followed up by a Residual Special Court. We intend to follow up after this fifth volume on the SCSL with a special volume on the Taylor judgement (ALC Volume 51).

The present volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the decisions and judgements, including separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with the previous volumes, the editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the SCSL Press and Information Office and which bears the signatures of the Judges. We are aware that most decisions are available on the internet. However, only the written decisions bearing the signatures of the Judges can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the internet version, if the latter is available at all. Much of our editorial efforts involve ensuring that the texts in this series are identical to the written original version. We could only include the full text of the decisions in this volume by reducing their original format. Still, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is throughout the text put in brackets [].

We are again very happy that a number of distinguished scholars in the field of international criminal law were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding the decisions.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions may give the user insight into our working method. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. Of course, we cannot publish all decisions. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a similar or identical way to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions published in this volume are presented in different parts and under different headings. Part 1, ‘Procedural Matters’, includes decisions on adjudicated facts (1), a decision on the pleading of joint criminal enterprise (2), and various decisions relating to disclosure (3). Under different headings it contains a wide array of decisions concerning the preparation for the defence, fair trial and impartiality (4). There are also some decisions on the admissibility of evidence (5) and contempt (6). Part 2, ‘Judgement and Sentencing’, contains one judgement and one sentencing judgement.

We owe acknowledgements to many persons without whom we could not have completed this forty-seventh volume. These include the SCSL Press and Information Office, which offered generous assistance in obtaining all the necessary copies of decisions. Our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, facilitated our work. We also acknowledge the work of our assistant-editor, Anzinga Low, who assisted us and without whom we would not be able to publish this series. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research stimulated our work.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the SCSL and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students. As always, we welcome any comments or suggestions from readers in order to help us to ensure that the ALC series promotes a greater understanding of the jurisprudence of all of the major international criminal courts and tribunals.

André Klip and Steven Freeland
Maastricht/ Sydney, 2016