

The Privatized Art of War
Private Military and Security Companies
and State Responsibility for Their
Unlawful Conduct in Conflict Areas

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 67

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The Privatized Art of War
Private Military and Security Companies
and State Responsibility for Their
Unlawful Conduct in Conflict Areas

Evgeni Moyakine



Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

This publication is based on a doctoral dissertation defended at Tilburg University in November 2014. The research was supported by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO) under project number 017.007.045.

Evgeni Moyakine
The Privatized Art of War. Private Military and Security Companies and State Responsibility for Their Unlawful Conduct in Conflict Areas

ISBN 978-1-78068-281-5
D/2015/7849/19
NUR 828

Cover illustration © Evgeni Moyakine

© 2015 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TO MY FAMILY

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Writing a doctoral dissertation might seem to some as a lonely enterprise, and this process – at certain points – definitely involves days, weeks, and even months of hard work isolated from civilization. As a whole, however, it can better be described as a collaborative project or joint effort in which you courageously and persistently collect pieces of the puzzle trying to create the complete picture and to enjoy it in its full and undisturbed glory.

Undoubtedly, I am blessed that on my unforgettable journey I was assisted by my supervisors who were always there when I needed them the most. Snežana Trifunovska from Radboud University Nijmegen deserves special thanks as my first mentor, who supervised my Master's thesis five years ago. She took over this role during my PhD research and was always on my side like a caring mother and my greatest role model. Thank you. The words of thanks and appreciation also go to my Tilburg-based supervisors, Willem van Genugten and Nicola Jägers, with whom I spent four fruitful years of research at Tilburg Law School and who have also been my inexhaustible sources of inspiration, constantly offering me assistance and support. I owe my sincere gratitude to all of you.

Furthermore, I am indebted to my friends, colleagues, and professors at Tilburg University, with whom I had incredible time participating in stimulating discussions, sharing nice moments with a warm cup of tea in the hands, and pumping iron in the gym late at night. Bert van Roermund opened my eyes during his fascinating Principles Classes and our conversations and I will never be blind again: "ieder tsèn". Péter Cserne, Angelos Dimopoulos, and Matteo Negrinotti, it is a pleasure to consider you my friends – I have learnt from you more than you would believe. I cannot omit mentioning my two paranymps, Dražan Djukic and Zlatina Georgieva, who were watching my back as my own private security guards and trustworthy allies during the PhD defense. I am glad that such wonderful friends and roommates still exist and that our paths have crossed. Thank you, Melissa Lewis. Without your birds-eye view and your help that seemed just as a duck takes to water I would have probably laid an egg. Thanks are also due to Ian Curry-Sumner who played a crucial role as my advisor in the tough competition for the NWO Mosaic grant and contributed to my success in obtaining it. Benjamin Biebl, our long-lasting friendship flavored by endless debates and unforgettable adventures in the Netherlands and abroad made me realize what having a real friend actually means – thank you.

Acknowledgments

I am especially grateful to the members of the PhD Committee – Cedric Ryngaert, Jonathan Verschuuren, Sorcha MacLeod, and Antenor Hallo de Wolf – for reading my work and providing their invaluable insights. My appreciation further extends to Steve Lambley from Steve Lambley Information Design who took up the challenge of editing and typesetting my manuscript and has delivered outstanding work. I also thank his colleague Max Denyer-Green from Penguin Proofing and Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen from Intersentia for their assistance.

Above all, my deepest gratitude goes out to my family. Without pure and infinite love of my thoughtful and gentle mother, wise and talented father, always cheerful and industrious brother and his wife, I would have never been able to be who I am and where I am now. Finally, I am thankful beyond words to Evgenia, the true love of my life, who has been very supportive of all my endeavors and keeps inspiring me all over again and giving a meaning to my existence. This book is dedicated to you... my family.

*Evgeni Moyakine
Tilburg, November 2014*

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv
Chapter I	
General Introduction	1
1. Introduction	1
2. Research aims and methodology	3
3. Misconduct of PMSCs and their personnel	7
Indiscriminate shootings and civilian casualties	8
Intentional killings	19
Property damage	20
Torture and other cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment	20
Sex trafficking, sex slavery, and running prostitution networks	26
Drug running, profiteering in transnational criminal networks, and weapons violations	27
Mercenary activities	29
Interim conclusion	32
4. Moral implications	33
5. Structure of the study	42
Chapter II	
Privatization of War and Security – War is Business and Vice Versa	45
1. Introduction	45
2. Historical origins of PMSCs	47
2.1 Ancient Times	49
2.2 The Middle Ages	50
2.3 The Peace of Westphalia and the Age of Reason	55
2.4 Modern times and the rise of PMSCs	58
2.5 PMSCs and mercenaries of the past	65

3. Private military and security companies as non-State business entities	69
3.1 Industry	70
3.2 Definition of a PMSC	78
3.3 Clients of PMSCs	88
3.4 Legal status	96
3.4.1 Legal status under national law	96
3.4.2 Legal status under international law	98
4. Conclusion	101
Chapter III	
Existing Legal Framework of PMSC Operation	105
1. Introduction	105
2. International legal order	106
2.1 General rules of public international law	107
2.2 Specific legal instruments focused on PMSCs	108
2.3 International human rights law	111
The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	118
The European Convention on Human Rights	122
The American Convention on Human Rights	125
The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	127
The UN Convention Against Torture	128
The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child	129
The UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women	130
Interim conclusion	130
2.4 International humanitarian law	131
2.5 International regulatory initiatives on business and human rights	132
3. Domestic legal order	136
4. Self-regulation and transnational private regulatory regimes	139
5. Hiring contracts	146
6. Standard operating procedures, rules of engagement, and status of forces agreements	151
7. Conclusion	155
Chapter IV	
Legal Status of PMSC Employees	157
1. Introduction	157
2. Legal status of PMSC personnel and State responsibility	157
3. Definition of PMSC employees	160
4. Legal status under international humanitarian law	161

4.1	International armed conflicts	161
4.1.1	Combatants with prisoner-of-war status	163
4.1.2	Non-combatants with prisoner-of-war status	179
4.1.3	Civilians	185
4.1.4	Mercenaries	186
4.2	Non-international armed conflicts	195
4.2.1	Armed forces of the legitimate government	195
4.2.2	Armed opposition groups	196
4.2.3	Civilians	197
4.2.4	Mercenaries	198
5.	Conclusion	199

Chapter V
State Responsibility under the Draft Articles on State Responsibility **201**

1.	Introduction	201
2.	History, framework, and legal status of the Draft Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts	203
2.1	Historical developments	203
2.2	The Draft Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts	204
2.3	Legal status of the Draft Articles	208
3.	Conditions for engaging State responsibility	210
4.	Implementation of State responsibility, circumstances precluding wrongfulness, and legal consequences	214
5.	State responsibility and institutional responsibility	221
6.	Attribution of unlawful conduct to States	223
6.1	Article 4 DARS	227
6.1.1	General application of the provision	227
6.1.2	Application of Article 4 DARS with regard to PMSCs	229
6.2	Article 5 DARS	234
6.2.1	General application of the provision	234
6.2.2	Application of Article 5 DARS with regard to PMSCs	237
6.3	Article 8 DARS	251
6.3.1	General application of the provision	251
6.3.2	Application of Article 8 DARS with regard to PMSCs	255
6.3.2.1	The “effective control” test established in the ICJ <i>Nicaragua</i> case	257
6.3.2.2	The “overall control” test established in the ICTY <i>Tadić</i> case	260
6.3.2.3	Reaffirmation of the “effective control” test in the ICJ <i>Bosnian Genocide</i> case	263

6.3.2.4 Other types of control	266
6.3.2.5 Which test to apply?	269
6.4 Article 11 DARS	282
6.4.1 General application of the provision	282
6.4.2 Application with regard to PMSCs	283
7. Breaches of international obligations of States	284
Indiscriminate shootings and civilian casualties	284
Intentional killings	289
Property damage	289
Torture and other cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment	290
Sex trafficking, sex slavery, and running prostitution networks	297
Drug running, profiteering in transnational criminal networks, and weapons violations	297
Mercenary activities	298
8. Conclusion	301

Chapter VI

State Responsibility for Non-Compliance with Positive International Law Obligations

	303
1. Introduction	303
2. Indirect responsibility	305
3. Positive State obligations of result	310
3.1 General analysis	310
3.2 Application to hiring States, host States, and home States	311
International humanitarian law	311
International human rights law	316
4. Positive State obligations of diligent conduct	317
4.1 General analysis	317
4.2 Application to hiring States	328
4.2.1 Positive State obligations under international humanitarian law	329
Common Article 1 of the 1949 Geneva Conventions	329
State intervention	333
Protection of certain groups of people	334
Suppressing and repressing violations of the law of armed conflict	336
Obligations of occupying powers	338
Specific positive measures to comply with positive obligations	339
4.2.2 Positive State obligations under international human rights law	340
4.2.2.1 Obligation to prevent	341

State intervention	341
Preventive regulation	349
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to prevent	352
4.2.2.2 Obligation to punish	354
Reactive regulation	354
Investigation, prosecution, and punishment	355
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to punish	360
4.3 Application to host States	362
4.3.1 Positive State obligations under international humanitarian law	362
Common Article 1 of the 1949 Geneva Conventions	363
State intervention	364
Protection of certain groups of people	365
Suppressing and repressing violations of the law of armed conflict	365
Obligations of occupying powers	365
Specific positive measures to comply with positive obligations	366
4.3.2 Positive State obligations under international human rights law	367
4.3.2.1 Obligation to prevent	368
State intervention	369
Preventive regulation	370
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to prevent	370
4.3.2.2 Obligation to punish	371
Reactive regulation	371
Investigation, prosecution, and punishment	372
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to punish	372
4.4 Application to home States	373
4.4.1 Positive State obligations under international humanitarian law	374
Common Article 1 of the 1949 Geneva Conventions	374
State intervention	375
Suppressing and repressing violations of the law of armed conflict	375
Specific positive measures to comply with positive obligations	376
4.4.2 Positive State obligations under international human rights law	377
4.4.2.1 Obligation to prevent	378
State intervention	378

Preventive regulation	379
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to prevent	380
4.4.2.2 Obligation to punish	382
Reactive regulation	382
Investigation, prosecution, and punishment	382
Specific positive measures to comply with the obligation to punish	383
5. State compliance with positive obligations	383
6. Conclusion	391
Chapter VII	
Summary, Overall Conclusions, and Final Observations	393
Introduction	393
Misconduct and moral implications	394
The phenomenon of PMSCs	394
Legal framework of PMSC activities	395
Legal status of PMSC employees	396
The ILC's Draft Articles and attribution	397
Positive State obligations	401
Final observations	407
<i>Dutch Summary – Nederlandse Samenvatting</i>	409
<i>Russian Summary – Краткое Содержание Книги на Русском Языке</i>	417
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	427
<i>Table of Cases</i>	457
<i>Selected United Nations Documents</i>	463
<i>Index</i>	469
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i>	477

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
ACHPR	African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights
AECA	Arms Export Control Act
ANSI	American National Standards Institute
AU	African Union
BAPSC	British Association of Private Security Companies
CAT	UN Convention Against Torture
CEDAW	UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CRC	UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
DARIO	Draft Articles on the Responsibility of International Organizations
DARS	Draft Articles on Responsibility of States for Internationally Wrongful Acts
DCAF	Geneva Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces
DSS	US Department of State's Diplomatic Security Service
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EU	European Union
FAIR Act	Federal Activities Inventory Reform Act
FAR	Federal Acquisition Regulation
FBI	Federal Bureau of Investigation
IACommHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICoC	International Code of Conduct for Private Security Service Providers

List of Abbreviations

ICoCA	International Code of Conduct Association
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
ILC	International Law Commission
ISOA	International Stability Operations Association
ITAR	International Traffic in Arms Regulation
MEJA	US Military Extraterritorial Jurisdiction Act
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
OAS	Organization of American States
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
OMB Circular	Office of Management and Budget Circular A-76
OSCE	Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe
PCIJ	Permanent Court of International Justice
PMC	Private military company
PMF	Private military firm
PMSC	Private military and security company
PSC	Private security company
SCEG	Security in Complex Environments Group
SOFA	Status of forces agreement
SSR	Security Sector Reform
TNC	Transnational Corporation
TRNC	Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus
UCMJ	Uniform Code of Military Justice
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UN Doc.	United Nations document
US DoD	US Department of Defense
VPs	Voluntary Principles on Security and Human Rights