

THE PERFORMANCE OF MEMORY AS TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within this Series:

7. Richard Zajac Sannerholm, *Rule of Law after War. Ideologies, Norms and Methods* (2012), 978-1-78068-008-8
8. Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark and Danielle Granville (chief editors), *Critical Perspectives in Transitional Justice* (2011), 978-1-78068-035-4
9. Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (eds.), *International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-conflict States* (2012), 978-1-78068-041-5
10. Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds.), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012), 978-1-78068-044-6
11. Ilse Derluyn, Cindy Mels, Stephan Parmentier and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.), *Re-Member. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation of War-Affected Children* (2012), 978-94-000-0027-4
12. Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and Larissa van den Herik (eds.), *Sexual Violence as an International Crime: Interdisciplinary Approaches* (2012), 978-1-78068-002-6
13. Estelle Zinsstag and Martha Albertson Fineman (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice: From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-142-9
14. Josep M. Tamarit Sumalla, *Historical Memory and Criminal Justice in Spain. A Case of Late Transitional Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-143-6
15. Catherine Jenkins (ed.), Max du Plessis (ed.), *Law, Nation building and Transformation The South African experience in perspective* (2014), 978-1-78068-184-9
16. Susanne Buckley-Zistel and Stefanie Schäfer (eds.), *Memorials in Times of Transition* (2014), 978-1-78068-211-2
17. Nico Wouters (ed.), *Transitional Justice and Memory in Europe (1945–2013)*, 978-1-78068-214-3
18. Agata Fijalkowski and Raluca Grosescu (eds.), *Transitional Criminal Justice in Post-Dictatorial and Post-Conflict Societies*, 978-1-78068-260-0

For previous volume in the series, please visit <http://tj.intersentia.com>

THE PERFORMANCE OF
MEMORY AS TRANSITIONAL
JUSTICE

Edited by

S. Elizabeth BIRD
Fraser M. OTTANELLI



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

The Performance of Memory as Transitional Justice
S. Elizabeth Bird and Fraser M. Ottanelli (eds.)

© 2015 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaen, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999.
From the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio*,
Article 5, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999.

ISBN 978-1-78068-262-4
D/2015/7849/4
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

CONTENTS

Introduction

S. Elizabeth BIRD and Fraser M. OTTANELLI.	1
---	---

PART I. THE LIMITS AND POTENTIAL OF TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE MECHANISMS

Chapter 1. Troubles with Truth Commissions: Putting the Moral Aims of Truth Commissions to the Fore

Margaret URBAN WALKER.	7
1. Truth Scepticism(s)	10
2. Different Kinds of Questions	15
3. Truth Takes Time.	19
4. Conclusion.	21

Chapter 2. Legalising Collective Remembrance after Mass Atrocities

Rachel LÓPEZ.	23
1. Collective Memory Defined	24
1.1. The Healing Power of Collective Memory	26
1.2. Collective Memory after Mass Atrocities.	27
2. Relationship between Justice and Collective Memory.	29
2.1. Law and the Collective Conscience.	29
2.2. The Role of Trials in Establishing Collective Memory.	30
2.3. The Slow Death of Impunity.	33
2.4. Can Judicial Proceedings be Harmful to Collective Memory?	35
3. The Inclusion of Collective Memory in Judicial Mechanisms	37
4. Conclusion.	41

Chapter 3. The Politics of Reparations and Apologies: Historical and Symbolic Justice within the Rwandan Context

Stephanie WOLFE	43
1. Symbolic and Historical Redress.	45
2. Formal Mechanisms	48

3. Informal Mechanisms	52
4. Conclusion	56

PART II. THE WORK OF NARRATIVE IN RECALIBRATING NATIONAL MEMORY

Chapter 4. Stories Told and Untold: Reparation, Recognition and Reshaping National Memories in Australia

Danielle CELERMAJER	61
1. The Critical Role of Narrative Justice in the Settler Colonial Nation	62
2. Contemporary Suffering and the Turn to Historical Justice	65
3. Family Histories, National Histories: Telling Personal Stories	68
4. Response as Recognition: Reparation as a Form of Narrative Justice	76
5. Conclusion	79

Chapter 5. Competing Narratives in Rwandan Reconciliation

Annelisa LINDSAY	81
1. Narrative, Violence, and Reconciliation	81
2. Narrative and the Rwandan Genocide	83
2.1. Pre-Colonial Period	83
2.2. Colonial Period	84
2.3. Independence	85
3. Narrative and Reconciliation in Rwanda	87
3.1. An Official Narrative	87
3.2. Culture and Education	89
3.3. Political Reform	90
3.4. Reconciliation Mechanisms	92
3.5. Cooperation and Development	93
4. A Lasting Peace?	94

Chapter 6. Where Is My Grandfather? Impunity and Memory in Spain

Olga MARTIN-ORTEGA and Rosa Ana ALIJA-FERNÁNDEZ	97
1. The Spanish Civil War and the Dictatorship: the Winners' 'Official Memory'	98
2. The Transition: Amnesty and the Pact of Silence	101
3. Opening the Graves, Opening the Memory	103
4. Institutional Responses: the Historical Memory Law	105
5. Searching for the Dead through the Courts	108
6. Official Memory, Historical Memory and Collective Identity	109
7. Conclusion	113

Chapter 7. The Role of Direct-Experience People in Promoting Transitional Justice: The Israeli Case

Rafi NETS-ZEHNGUT.....	115
1. Literature Review	116
2. The 1948 Palestinian Exodus and its Memory in Israel.....	118
3. Methodology.....	120
4. Israeli 1948 War Veterans Addressing the Exodus.....	121
4.1. Memoirs.....	121
4.2. Newspaper Articles	122
4.3. Interviews by Scholars.....	123
5. The Impacts of the Critical Activity of the Veterans	123
5.1. Directly Reducing the Extent of Taboo regarding the Critical Narrative	123
5.2. Providing Evidence for the Expulsions.....	124
6. Discussion	126
6.1. Transitional Justice and Ongoing Conflicts.....	126
6.2. Causes of the Veterans' Behaviour.....	127
6.3. Informal Activity that is not Motivated by Justice/Peace Considerations	128
6.4. Comparing Formal Peace-Motivated Activity to Informal Non-Peace-Motivated Activity.....	129
6.5. Relations between Formal Peace-Motivated Activity and Informal Non-Peace-Motivated Activity	130
6.6. Other Non-Peace-Motivated Transitional Justice Activities.....	131
7. Conclusion.....	131

PART III. MEMORY WORK AS TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

Chapter 8. The Asaba Memorial Project: Negotiating a Community Collaboration

S. Elizabeth BIRD and Fraser M. OTTANELLI.....	135
1. Introduction	135
2. The Asaba Memorial Project	137
2.1. The Legacy of the War	138
2.2. The Complexity of Memory	142
2.3. Forms of Memory Work	146
2.4. The Collaborative Process.....	147
3. Conclusion: Practical Memorialisation	149

**Chapter 9. Testimonies of Violence in Post-Conflict Guatemala:
Circulation and the Transnational Politics of Misrecognition**

Brigittine M. FRENCH 153

1. Social Identities: Locating Difference and Violence in Narrativity 155
2. Temporal Reification of Political Violence 158
3. The Politics of Erasure and Misrecognition 161
4. Conclusion: Communicability, Violence, and Impunity in Latin
America 163

**Chapter 10. Conceptualising Alternative Forms of Justice: The Politics
of Memorialisation in Rwanda**

Jessica AUCHTER 167

1. Memorials and Memorialisations 171
 - 1.1 Contested Memorial: Murambi 173
2. Representing the Unrepresentable: Rethinking Justice 176
3. Conclusions 179

**Chapter 11. Memories of Violence: Literature and Transitional Justice
in Argentina**

Oscar HEMER 181

1. Conceptual Repertoire 182
2. Museum of Memory 184
3. Memory Boom 188
4. The National Body 190
5. The Grand Illusion 192
6. The Distance 193
7. By Way of Conclusion 194

Chapter 12. Majdanek: The Work of Memory

Hunt HAWKINS 197

About the Authors 199