

FORCE & MARRIAGE

FORCE & MARRIAGE

The criminalisation of forced marriage
in Dutch, English
and international criminal law

Iris HAENEN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd.
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Force & Marriage. The criminalisation of forced marriage in Dutch, English and international criminal law
Iris Haenen

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover design: Pjotr Design Studio
Editing: Steve Lambley Information Design

ISBN 978-1-78068-252-5
D/2014/7849/107
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In writing this book, I have had the support of many people, all of whom I owe much gratitude.

My supervisors Tijs Kooijmans and Anne-Marie de Brouwer: thank you for your guidance, support, feedback and belief in me – *I thought* I might finish my thesis; you *knew* I would. Your expertise has been invaluable and I have been very lucky to have had you as my supervisors. I hold you in the highest regard.

My current and former Tilburg Law School colleagues: you have made working on this book so much more enjoyable. I am truly grateful to be surrounded by such fantastic people, many of whom I have come to regard as my dear friends. Thank you for making me laugh until it hurts. Let's just pray that no one ever hacks into our email accounts.

My hosts at King's College London and KU Leuven: thank you for making me feel so very welcome and at home, with particular thanks to all those who took the time to comment on my research.

My paranymphs Jannemieke and Lachezar: Laz, thank you for being an awesome roomie and for always giving sound advice. Jannemieke, you rock. Seriously. In ten years' time, you will be the Dean of a law school.

The reading committee: Professors Marc Groenhuijsen, Paul Vlaardingerbroek, Jeremy Horder and Robert Cryer, thank you very much for taking the time to read my manuscript and for providing feedback.

Finally, my mother: thank you for everything.

Iris Haenen,
May 2014

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xvii

General introduction	1
1. The topic and the central question	1
1.1. The central question	1
1.2. National criminal law: a comparison between the Netherlands and England	2
1.3. International criminal law: a specific focus on Sierra Leone and Cambodia	3
1.4. Comparison between the national and international level of criminalisation	5
2. Outline and methodology	5
2.1. Outline	5
2.2. Methodology	6
3. Evaluative framework: a tale of two theories	7
4. Scope and limitations	9
4.1. The scope of ‘forced marriage’	9
4.2. The scope of ‘international criminal law’	9

PART I. FORCE AND MARRIAGE

Description and definition of forced marriage

Chapter 1. <i>Consensus facit nuptias</i>	13
1. Introduction	13
2. Marriage	14
2.1. The sociology of marriage	14
2.2. Definition of marriage	17
3. <i>Consensus facit nuptias</i> : coercion, consent and human rights	19
3.1. Human rights instruments	19
3.1.1. Introduction: the legal effects of human rights instruments	19
3.1.2. Universal human rights instruments	20
3.1.3. Regional human rights instruments	23
3.2. Coercion and force	27
3.3. Consent	29

4.	A (preliminary) definition of forced marriage	31
4.1.	Forced marriage: a (working) definition	31
4.2.	Arranged marriage.....	33
4.3.	Notions of shame and honour.....	35
4.4.	Forced arranged marriages	37
4.5.	An example: forced marriages in Dutch orthodox Protestant communities	39
4.6.	Distinguishing arranged marriages from forced marriages	41
5.	Concluding remarks.....	45
Chapter 2. Forced marriages in the Netherlands and England.....		47
1.	Introduction	47
2.	Forced marriage in the Netherlands	47
2.1.	Prevalence.....	47
2.2.	Background of forced marriages in the Netherlands	50
2.3.	Victims and perpetrators	52
2.4.	Causes	52
2.5.	Consequences	53
2.6.	Transnational dimensions	54
3.	Forced marriages in England.....	56
3.1.	Prevalence.....	56
3.2.	Victims and perpetrators	59
3.3.	Causes	60
3.4.	Consequences	61
3.5.	Transnational dimensions	62
4.	Concluding remarks.....	62
Chapter 3. Forced marriages in conflict situations.....		65
1.	Introduction	65
2.	Forced marriages during the conflicts in Rwanda and the former Yugoslavia	66
2.1.	Rwanda	66
2.2.	The former Yugoslavia.....	68
3.	Forced marriages and the situations before the ICC.....	69
3.1.	Côte d'Ivoire.....	69
3.2.	Kenya	70
3.3.	The Central African Republic	70
3.4.	Republic of Mali	71
3.5.	Democratic Republic of Congo.....	71
3.6.	Sudan	73
3.7.	Uganda.....	74
4.	Forced marriages during the civil war in Sierra Leone.....	80
4.1.	Contextualisation: the conflict in Sierra Leone	80

4.2.	Forced marriages during the civil war: ‘yu na mi wef’	80
4.2.1.	‘Bush wives’	80
4.2.2.	Women’s complex roles within rebel groups	82
4.2.3.	Reintegration and stigmatisation	85
5.	Forced marriages in Cambodia under the Khmer Rouge	88
5.1.	Contextualisation: the Khmer Rouge	88
5.2.	Khmer Rouge marriages in the context of the conflict	91
5.2.1.	Khmer Rouge marriage policy	91
5.2.2.	Marriage and the prescription of sexual intercourse	93
5.2.3.	Khmer Rouge marriages: forced or not?	95
5.2.4.	The marriages in post-conflict Cambodia	98
6.	Comparison: the bush marriages and the Khmer Rouge marriages	99
6.1.	Introduction	99
6.2.	The differences	100
6.2.1.	Policy as a similarity in disguise: state policy versus rebel policy	100
6.2.2.	Victim-victim versus perpetrator-victim	103
6.2.3.	Official versus unofficial	104
6.2.4.	Eradicated versus exacerbated gender roles	105
6.3.	Similarities	106
6.3.1.	Forced union of two people	106
6.3.2.	Compelled to remain in the union (conjugal association) for a certain period	107
6.3.3.	Union created certain obligations and/or rights between spouses	108
6.3.4.	The forced marriages served specific (but different) purposes	109
6.3.5.	Elements of control and ownership	110
7.	Comparison: Forced marriages in conflict situations and forced marriages in the Netherlands and England	112
8.	Concluding remarks	114

PART II. A TALE OF TWO THEORIES

Criminalisation on the level of national law and international law

Chapter 4.	National criminalisation	119
1.	Introduction	119
2.	Primary criteria: threshold principles	122
2.1.	A dual-element threshold	122
2.2.	Harm	123
2.3.	Wrong	125
3.	Secondary criteria: moderating principles	127
3.1.	Proportionality	128

3.2.	Subsidiarity.....	129
3.2.1.	External subsidiarity.....	129
3.2.2.	Internal subsidiarity.....	131
3.3.	Effectiveness.....	131
4.	Legality: <i>lex certa</i> (maximum certainty).....	132
5.	Concluding remarks.....	134
Chapter 5.	International criminalisation.....	137
1.	Introduction.....	137
2.	Doctrinal foundations of international (and supranational) criminalisation.....	139
2.1.	The advancement of the core crimes: a short overview.....	139
2.2.	An inductive, a descriptive and a normative approach: Bassiouni, Cassese and May.....	141
3.	Taxonomy of international criminalisation: the core crimes of the Rome Statute.....	145
3.1.	Legislative history of the ICC in a nutshell: the absence of a legal method.....	145
3.2.	Codifying ‘new’ crimes during the Rome Conference: the importance of material distinctiveness.....	146
3.3.	Codifying ‘new’ crimes after the Rome Conference: amending the Rome Statute.....	150
3.3.1.	Article 121 Rome Statute: amendments.....	150
3.3.2.	Principle of legality.....	151
3.4.	The structure of the core crimes.....	155
4.	Criminalisation and crimes against humanity.....	157
4.1.	Introduction: options for criminalisation.....	157
4.2.	Material distinctiveness: The conduct is subsumed under specific inhumane acts listed in Article 7(1) Rome Statute.....	160
4.3.	The conduct constitutes an ‘other inhumane act’.....	162
4.3.1.	Great suffering, or serious injury to body or to mental or physical health.....	163
4.3.2.	Determining the scope of ‘inhumane’ acts.....	164
5.	Criminalisation and war crimes.....	168
5.1.	Introduction and options for criminalisation.....	168
5.2.	Preliminary remark: qualifying the importance of customary international law.....	172
5.3.	The crime is materially distinct from serious violations of customary international law listed in the Rome Statute.....	174
5.4.	The conduct amounts to a war crime which is not codified in the Rome Statute.....	174
5.4.1.	The conduct is a breach of a rule of customary international humanitarian law.....	174

5.4.2.	The violation can be qualified as ‘serious’.....	175
5.4.3.	The breach gives rise to individual criminal responsibility under customary international law	176
6.	Criminalisation and genocide	178
6.1.	Introduction.....	178
6.2.	Expanding the definition of genocide?.....	179
7.	Concluding remarks.....	182

Chapter 6. Comparing national and international criminalisation 185

1.	Introduction	185
2.	Harm and wrong: a higher threshold	186
3.	Proportionality and external subsidiarity: side-lined.....	186
4.	Internal subsidiarity: equally important.....	187
5.	Effectiveness: no deal breaker	189
6.	Legality: equally important	191
7.	Concluding remarks.....	191

PART III. THE LAW AND FORCED MARRIAGE

Legal frameworks concerning forced marriage in Dutch,
English and international criminal law

Chapter 7. Dutch and English law and forced marriage 195

1.	Introduction	195
2.	The Dutch legal landscape	197
2.1.	Civil law: the legal requirements for marriage	197
2.1.1.	Interruption of an intended marriage	199
2.1.2.	Annulment of marriage.....	200
2.1.3.	Divorce and judicial separation.....	204
2.1.4.	Private international law	205
2.1.5.	Marital Coercion (civil law) Bill	207
2.1.6.	Analysis of the Bill	211
2.2.	Coercive measures: civil, criminal and administrative protection orders.....	213
2.3.	Criminal law	217
2.3.1.	Influencing someone’s legal statement.....	217
2.3.2.	(Criminal) coercion	218
2.3.3.	Abduction of a women/girl (schaking)	221
2.3.4.	Threatening to commit serious criminal offences	222
2.3.5.	Stalking	222
3.	The Dutch criminalisation debate	224
3.1.	Marital Coercion (criminal law) Act.....	224
3.2.	Analysis of the Marital Coercion (criminal law) Act	227

4.	The English legal landscape before criminalisation.....	228
4.1.	Civil law: the legal requirements for marriage.....	228
4.2.	The Forced Marriage (Civil Protection) Act 2007.....	231
4.3.	Amendments to the FMCPA proposed by the Anti-Social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Bill 2013.....	234
4.4.	Annulment of forced marriage.....	235
4.4.1.	Duress.....	235
4.4.2.	Mistake, unsoundness of mind or otherwise.....	240
4.5.	Divorce and judicial separation.....	241
4.6.	Coercive measures: restraining orders and other remedies for dealing with forced marriages.....	243
4.7.	Private international law.....	246
5.	The English criminalisation debate.....	247
5.1.	A polarised debate.....	247
5.1.1.	Arguments against criminalisation.....	248
5.1.2.	Arguments in favour of criminalisation.....	251
5.1.3.	Discussion of arguments.....	253
5.2.	Three offences of forced marriage: the Anti-Social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Bill 2013.....	256
5.3.	(Non-) specific criminal offences.....	258
6.	Concluding remarks.....	259
 Chapter 8. International criminal law and forced marriage.....		263
1.	Introduction.....	263
2.	The case law of the Special Court for Sierra Leone.....	264
2.1.	Trying those who bear greatest responsibility: the Special Court for Sierra Leone.....	264
2.2.	The AFRC case.....	265
2.2.1.	The trial.....	265
2.2.2.	The separate concurring opinion of Justice Sebutinde....	269
2.2.3.	The partly dissenting opinion of Justice Doherty.....	270
2.2.4.	The appeal.....	271
2.2.5.	Appraisal of the AFRC judgements.....	273
2.3.	The RUF case.....	275
2.3.1.	Pre-trial proceedings and the trial.....	275
2.3.2.	The appeal.....	277
2.3.3.	Appraisal of the RUF judgements.....	277
2.4.	The Taylor case.....	279
2.4.1.	The trial.....	279
2.4.2.	The appeal.....	281
2.4.3.	Appraisal of the Taylor judgements.....	281

3.	The case law of the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia	282
3.1.	Trying those who were most responsible: the ECCC	282
3.2.	Case 002: Nuon Chea and Khieu Samphan.....	282
4.	Concluding remarks.....	284
Chapter 9.	Two-level legal comparison.....	287
1.	Introduction	287
2.	Level 1: Comparing Dutch and English law.....	288
2.1.	The starting point: a different policy and different legislation....	288
2.2.	Restraining and protection orders.....	291
2.3.	Interruption, divorce and annulment.....	293
2.3.1.	Interruption.....	293
2.3.2.	Divorce.....	294
2.3.3.	Annulment	298
2.4.	Criminal law	302
3.	Level 2: Comparing international and national law.....	303
4.	Concluding remarks.....	304

PART IV. ANALYSIS AND CONCLUSIONS

Chapter 10.	The criminalisation of forced marriage under Dutch law and in the Rome Statute.....	309
1.	Introduction	309
2.	The criminalisation of forced marriage and Dutch law	310
2.1.	Introduction.....	310
2.2.	The harms and wrongs of forced marriages	311
2.2.1.	The many harms of forced marriage	311
2.2.2.	The specific harm of forced marriage.....	312
2.2.3.	The wrongs of forced marriage	314
2.3.	Proportionality	315
2.4.	Subsidiarity.....	316
2.4.1.	External subsidiarity	316
2.4.2.	Internal subsidiarity and material distinctiveness.....	318
2.5.	Effectiveness.....	320
2.5.1.	The detection of the hidden crime of forced marriage	321
2.5.2.	Whom to prosecute?.....	321
2.5.3.	How to prove coercion was used?	322
2.6.	Conclusion: a separate offence of forced marriage... ..	324
2.6.1.	...is not required in Dutch criminal law.....	324
2.6.2.	The principle of legality	326
2.6.3.	Dealing with a legal anomaly: Article 284 versus Article 285a CriC.....	327

3.	The criminalisation of forced marriage and the Rome Statute	328
3.1.	Introduction	328
3.2.	The harms of forced marriage in conflict situations	329
3.2.1.	Introduction	329
3.2.2.	Sierra Leone (as a blueprint for many other African conflicts).	330
3.2.3.	Cambodia	331
3.2.4.	The specific harms of forced marriage in conflict situations	332
3.3.	Forced marriage as a (distinct) crime against humanity	333
3.3.1.	Introduction	333
3.3.2.	Internal subsidiarity: is forced marriage caught by listed crimes against humanity?	334
3.3.2.1.	Introduction	334
3.3.2.2.	Forced marriage as a form of persecution.	335
3.3.2.3.	Forced marriage as a form of enslavement.	336
3.3.3.	Conclusion: forced marriage as a new, distinct crime against humanity?	339
3.3.3.1.	Great suffering, or serious injury to body or to mental or physical health	339
3.3.3.2.	Similar in nature and gravity to other inhumane acts	341
3.3.3.3.	Forced marriages taking place in conflicts currently before the ICC	342
3.3.3.4.	Forced marriages comparable to Khmer Rouge marriages	344
3.4.	Forced marriage as a (distinct) war crime	346
3.4.1.	Introduction	346
3.4.2.	Internal subsidiarity: is forced marriage caught by listed war crimes?	346
3.4.2.1.	Introduction	346
3.4.2.2.	The war crimes of inhuman treatment, cruel treatment and wilfully causing great suffering	347
3.4.2.3.	The war crime of committing outrages upon personal dignity	348
3.4.3.	Conclusion: forced marriage as a new, distinct war crime?	349
3.5.	Forced marriage as a (distinct) genocidal act	352
3.5.1.	Introduction	352
3.5.2.	Internal subsidiarity: is forced marriage caught by listed genocidal acts?	352
3.5.3.	Conclusion: forced marriage as a new, distinct genocidal act?	354

3.6. Concluding remarks: a separate crime of forced marriage is not required	355
<i>Summary</i>	357
<i>Bibliography</i>	373
<i>Table of cases</i>	391
<i>Curriculum vitae</i>	399
<i>Index</i>	401

ABBREVIATIONS

ABCP	Anti-social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Bill 2013–14
ACVZ	Dutch Advisory Committee on Migration Affairs
AFRC	Armed Forced Revolutionary Council
CDF	Civil Defence Forces
CFREU	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CPK	Communist Party of Kampuchea
CPS	Crown Prosecution Service
CivC	(Dutch) Civil Code
CriC	(Dutch) Criminal Code
CCriP	(Dutch) Code of Criminal Procedure
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECLI	European Case Law Identifier
ECTHR	European Court of Human Rights
EoC	Elements of Crimes
FMCPA	Forced Marriage (Civil Protection) Act 2007
FLA	Family Law Act 1996
FMPO	Forced marriage protection order
FMU	Forced Marriage Unit
GAOR	General Assembly Official Records
GBV	Gender-based violence
HRW	Human Rights Watch
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IHL	International humanitarian law
IKWRO	Iranian Kurdish Women’s Rights Organisation
ILC	International Law Commission
LRA	Lord’s Resistance Army
MCA	Matrimonial Causes Act 1973
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NJ	Nederlandse Jurisprudentie (Dutch case law)

Abbreviations

PPS	Prosecution Service
RPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
RUF	Revolutionary United Front
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
STD	Sexually transmitted disease
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNGA	General Assembly of the United Nations
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNSC	United Nations Security Council