

COMMITTED TO REFORM?

## EUROPEAN STUDIES IN LAW AND ECONOMICS SERIES

1. *Group Litigation in European Competition Law. A Law and Economics Perspective*, Sonja E. Keske
2. *Behavioural Economics in Consumer Policy*, Hanneke Luth
3. *Ex-Post Liability Rules in Modern Patent Law*, Rosa Castro Bernieri
4. *Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals: The Case of Parallel Trade*, Claudia Desogus
5. *The Law and Economics of Organ Procurement*, Firat Bilgel
6. *Law and Economics in the RIA World. Improving the use of economic analysis in public policy and legislation*, Andrea Renda
7. *Regulatory Competition in European Corporate and Capital Market Law*, Lars Hornuf
8. *Economic Criteria for Criminalization: Optimizing Enforcement in Case of Environmental Violations*, Katarina Svatikova
9. *Definition of the Relevant Market. (Lack of) Harmony between Industrial Economics and Competition Law*, Hila Nevo
10. *Patents as Protection of Traditional Medical Knowledge? A Law and Economics Analysis*, Petra Ebermann
11. *Rethinking the New York Convention. A Law and Economics Approach*, Shen Wei
12. *Towards a Better Assessment of Pain and Suffering Damages for Personal Injuries*, Vaia Karapanou
13. *Comparative Analysis of Merger Control Policy. Lessons for China*, Jingyuan Ma
14. *Does Law Matter for Economic Growth? A Re-examination of the 'Legal Origin' Hypothesis*, Guangdong Xu

# COMMITTED TO REFORM?

## Pragmatic Antitrust Enforcement in Electricity Markets

Małgorzata SADOWSKA



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinerstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Committed to Reform? Pragmatic Antitrust Enforcement in Electricity Markets  
Małgorzata Sadowska

© 2014 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-250-1  
D/2014/7849/113  
NUR 823

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my sincere gratitude to people who saw me through this book; to all those who provided support, talked things over, read, offered comments and assisted in the editing, proofreading and design.

Particular thanks go to Massimo Motta, Klaus Heine, Bert Willems, Leigh Hancher, Ann-Sophie Vandenberghe, Hans Vedder, Roger Van den Bergh, Michael Faure, Luigi Franzoni, Firat Cengiz, Andrew Gabil, Natalia Fabra, Jan Bouckaert, Pierre Larouche, Niels Philipsen, Alexander Morell, Björn ter Bruggen, Paul Giesbertz, Martin Godfried, Lars Kjølbye, Peter Willis, Matti Supponen, Edouard Leduc, Marianne Breijer, Lisa Verniti, Adelio Garcia Alfisi, Meltem Bayramli, Vaia Karapanou, Alejandra Martinez Gándara, Firat Bilgel, Weiqiang Hu, Bernadeta Sadowska, Mieczysław Sadowski, Paulina Samsel, Anna Sadowska, Nicolas Klecha, Maksymilian Klecha, Marcin Klecha and Killian Kehoe.

The views expressed and all remaining errors are those of the author.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>List of Tables and Figures</i> .....	xi
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1. Problem Definition .....	2
1.2. Context .....	4
1.2.1. What Are Commitment Decisions? .....	4
1.2.2. Potential Benefits of Commitment Procedure and Incentives to Engage in Negotiations .....	6
1.2.3. Making the Link with Electricity Markets .....	10
1.2.4. What's at Stake? The EU Internal Market for Electricity .....	17
1.2.4.1. Early Legislative Reforms: the 1 <sup>st</sup> and the 2 <sup>nd</sup> Energy Package .....	19
1.2.4.2. The Use of Competition Toolbox: the Energy Sector Inquiry and the Follow-Up Actions .....	21
1.2.4.3. Where Do We Stand Now? The 3 <sup>rd</sup> Energy Package .....	24
1.2.4.4. Actions for Non-Compliance .....	25
1.2.4.5. On the Home Straight? .....	26
1.3. Energy Policy and Competition Policy: Definitions .....	27
1.4. Dealing with Gap Cases: Some Comments on the <i>Greek Lignite Case</i> ...	29
1.4.1. The Case .....	30
1.4.2. Discussion .....	33
1.5. Literature Review .....	34
1.5.1. Debate on Commitments .....	36
1.5.1.1. Optimal Use of Commitment Decisions .....	38
1.5.1.2. Suboptimal Use of Commitment Decisions .....	42
1.5.2. Debate on the Use of Commitments for Regulatory Purposes: Instrumentalisation .....	43
1.5.2.1. Suboptimal Outcomes and the Risks of Instrumentalisation .....	44
1.5.2.2. Formlessness of Article 9 and the Opportunities It Creates .....	48
1.5.2.3. Some Final Remarks .....	55
1.5.3. Research Justification .....	57

1.6. Research Question and Methodology .....	59
1.6.1. Why Electricity Markets? .....	60
1.6.2. Why the <i>E.ON</i> and <i>SvK</i> Cases? .....	61
1.7. Chapter Overview .....	63
1.7.1. Chapter 2 .....	64
1.7.2. Chapter 3 .....	66
1.7.3. Chapter 4 .....	70
1.7.4. Chapter 5 .....	74
<b>Chapter 2. Energy Liberalisation: Excessive Pricing Actions Dusted Off? ...</b>	<b>79</b>
2.1. Chapter Summary .....	79
2.2. Introduction .....	79
2.3. The Paradox .....	81
2.4. Invalidating the Criticism .....	82
2.4.1. Intervention might be Superfluous or Even Harmful. ....	82
2.4.2. Assessment Problems .....	84
2.4.2.1. Sector Inquiry Opens the Case... ..	84
2.4.2.2. ... And a Commitment Decision Closes It.....	87
2.4.3. Price Regulation .....	89
2.4.3.1. ... With a Structural Solution. ....	89
2.5. Conclusions .....	90
<b>Chapter 3. Energy Liberalisation in an Antitrust Straitjacket: A Plant Too Far? .....</b>	<b>93</b>
3.1. Chapter Summary .....	93
3.2. Introduction .....	93
3.3. Far-Fetched Concerns .....	96
3.3.1. Dominance .....	98
3.3.2. Abuse .....	100
3.4. Far-Reaching Remedies .....	103
3.4.1. Step 1: Alternative Behavioural Commitments? .....	107
3.4.2. Step 2: Appropriate and Necessary Structural Commitments? ..	108
3.4.3. Commitments and Exploitative Concerns .....	111
3.4.4. Commitments and Exclusionary Concerns .....	115
3.5. Conclusions .....	116
3.6. Annex 1 .....	117
3.7. Annex 2 .....	122
3.7.1. Spain .....	122
3.7.2. Denmark .....	123
3.7.3. Germany .....	125
3.7.4. The UK .....	126



3.7.5. Italy . . . . .	128
3.7.6. Belgium . . . . .	129
3.7.7. Discussion . . . . .	130
<b>Chapter 4. Market Integration and Economic Efficiency in Conflict?</b>	
<b>Commitments in the <i>Swedish Interconnectors Case</i> . . . . .</b>	<b>135</b>
4.1. Chapter Summary . . . . .	135
4.2. Introduction . . . . .	136
4.3. Model . . . . .	138
4.3.1. Set-Up . . . . .	138
4.3.2. First-Best . . . . .	140
4.3.3. Scenarios . . . . .	143
4.4. Results . . . . .	146
4.4.1. Counter-Trading with Full Congestion Shifting (Alleged Abuse) . . . . .	146
4.4.2. Counter-Trading without Congestion Shifting (Interim Remedy as Implemented) . . . . .	151
4.4.3. Counter-Trading with Partial Congestion Shifting (Optimal Interim Remedy) . . . . .	154
4.4.4. Market Splitting (Final Remedy) . . . . .	157
4.4.5. Comparison of Four Scenarios . . . . .	160
4.5. Conclusions . . . . .	163
<b>Chapter 5. Power Markets Shaped by Antitrust . . . . .</b>	<b>169</b>
5.1. Chapter Summary . . . . .	169
5.2. Introduction . . . . .	169
5.3. The Case and Its Context . . . . .	171
5.4. Internal Market Objective Reached with Competition Policy . . . . .	174
5.4.1. Political Climate and Legal Concerns Likely Delayed the Case . . . . .	175
5.4.1.1. Political Climate . . . . .	175
5.4.1.2. Legal Concerns . . . . .	177
5.4.2. Commitment Procedure Simplifies the Case . . . . .	179
5.4.3. Promotion of Market Integration as a Key Objective in the SvK Case . . . . .	180
5.4.4. Neglecting Objective Justification . . . . .	183
5.4.4.1. Objective Justification and Commitment Procedure . . . . .	183
5.4.4.2. Objective Justification Based on Efficiencies . . . . .	186
5.4.4.3. Objective Justification Based on Public Interest . . . . .	187
5.4.5. Proportionality of the Final Remedy . . . . .	189
5.5. SVK's Commitments in the Light of the Nordic Debate . . . . .	191

5.6. European Rules on Congestion Management .....	197
5.6.1. Existing EU Rules on Congestion Shifting.....	198
5.6.2. Existing EU Rules on Congestion Shifting: What Do They Mean for the TSOs? .....	200
5.6.3. The New CACM Network Code and Its Impact on Congestion Shifting.....	203
5.6.4. Limits of the EU Regulation .....	207
5.7. Conclusions .....	209
<b>Chapter 6. Conclusions .....</b>	<b>213</b>
6.1. Energy Policy Dimension .....	213
6.1.1. Regulatory Objectives Pursued by the Commission.....	213
6.1.2. Overcoming the Limits of Sector-Specific Regulation .....	214
6.1.3. Overcoming Political Opposition .....	216
6.1.4. The Commission’s Bigger Toolbox for Regulatory Purposes.....	217
6.2. Competition Policy Dimension .....	218
6.2.1. Suboptimal Case Selection and Prioritisation (1a) .....	219
6.2.2. Suboptimal Antitrust Response (1b) .....	221
6.2.3. Pro-Article 9 Bias (2) .....	222
6.2.4. The Commission’s Smaller Toolbox for Regulatory Purposes ...	222
6.3. Addressing the Research Question .....	223
6.4. Scope for Further Research.....	224
<b>Chapter 7. Summary.....</b>	<b>227</b>
<i>References .....</i>	<i>231</i>

# LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

## TABLES

Table 1.	Overview of antitrust cases closed by commitment decisions between 2004 and 2014. . . . .	13
Table 2.	Energy antitrust investigations launched by the Commission between 2004 and 2014 . . . . .	15
Table 3.	E.ON's generation capacity by sources: Germany, 2007. . . . .	109
Table 4.	E.ON's divested capacity by sources: November 2008 . . . . .	110
Table 5.	E.ON's generation portfolio post- versus pre-divestiture. . . . .	111
Table 6.	Data for the numerical illustration . . . . .	140
Table 7.	Four scenarios. . . . .	145
Table 8.	Numerical results for four scenarios . . . . .	149

## FIGURES

Figure 1.	Well-functioning and competitive electricity markets according to my nephews and my sister . . . . .	27
Figure 2.	Positioning the research topic in the context of current scholarly debates. . . . .	35
Figure 3.	The concept of proportionality under Article 7 and Article 9 of EC Regulation 1/2003: comparison. . . . .	105
Figure 4.	Merit order curve for Germany, 2008 . . . . .	112
Figure 5.	Price formation on a short-term competitive electricity market . . . . .	117
Figure 6.	The effect of capacity withdrawal on price formation in a competitive short-term electricity market . . . . .	119
Figure 7.	Set-up of the model. . . . .	139
Figure 8.	First-best outcome . . . . .	142
Figure 9.	First-best: gross consumer surplus and production costs . . . . .	142
Figure 10.	Counter-trading with full congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities . . . . .	148
Figure 11.	Counter-trading with full congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus . . . . .	150
Figure 12.	Counter-trading without congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities . . . . .	152

Figure 13. Counter-trading without congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus . . . . . 153

Figure 14. Counter-trading with partial congestion shifting: regional prices, import and export quantities. . . . . 155

Figure 15. Counter-trading with partial congestion shifting: producer surplus and consumer surplus . . . . . 156

Figure 16. Market splitting: regional prices, import and export quantities. . 158

Figure 17. Market splitting: producer surplus and consumer surplus . . . . . 158

Figure 18. Market splitting with strategic congestion: regional prices, import and export quantities . . . . . 159