

THE BORDERLINES OF TORT LAW

THE BORDERLINES OF TORT LAW

Interactions with Contract Law

Edited by
Miquel MARTIN-CASALS

Intersentia Ltd
8 Wellington Street | Cambridge
CB1 1HW | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 736 170
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
Independent Publishers Group
Order Department
814 North Franklin Street
Chicago, IL 60610
USA
Tel.: +1 800 888 4741 (toll free) | Fax: +1 312 337 5985
Email: orders@ipgbook.com

The Borderlines of Tort Law. Interactions with Contract Law

© The editor and contributors severally 2019

The editor and contributors have asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as authors of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Artwork on cover: *Swinging*, Wassily Kandinsky 1866–1944 © Tate, London 2019

ISBN 978-1-78068-248-8
D/2019/7849/89
NUR 822

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

À notre collègue Suzanne Carval, *in memoriam*

PREFACE

This book by the European Group on Tort Law (EGTL) deals with the borderlines between tort and contract and, more specifically, with the distinctions between liability in contract and liability in tort established in the legal systems under analysis. By exploring the main differences between the tortious and contractual legal regimes when damage occurs, it aims to shed some light on where the respective borderlines are currently traced in the corresponding legal systems, and what trends there are to suggest the course of the future development of the distinction.

The book includes 15 national reports, a report giving the perspective of an economic analysis of law and, finally, a comparative report. The reports analyse the differences across legal systems as regards the rules that may be relevant to the issues at the borderline between contract and tort and the extent to which actions in tort and actions in contract are mutually exclusive and, when this is not the case, how their concurrence is regulated. The reports also devote some attention to specific situations, such as pre-contractual liability and professional liability, where the contractual or tortious nature of the claim is hotly debated in some legal systems, and end with an analysis of the borderline problems between tort and contract posed by 16 hypothetical case scenarios. Finally, the comparative report, based on the national reports and on other materials, provides a number of comparative conclusions.

The book has been made possible thanks to the ongoing financial and organisational support of the European Centre of Tort and Insurance Law (ECTIL) and the Institute for European Tort Law (ETL) in Vienna, as well as that of the Institute of European and Comparative Private Law (IECPL) at the University of Girona. The generosity of the National Research Program of the Spanish Ministry of Sciences, Innovation and Universities, through research grants (DER2013-40613-R and DER2016-77229-R) awarded to the IECPL in Girona over the last few years, has also been crucial in allowing the organisation of several meetings of the EGTL.

On behalf of the Group, I would like to thank the current director of the ECTIL and the ETL, Ernst Karner, and the former director of both institutions and one of the founding fathers of the EGTL, Helmut Koziol, from whom many of us have learned so much, for their ongoing support and encouragement. I would also like to thank the staff of the Institutions that have made this project possible, especially Lisa Zeiler, Donna Stockenhuber, Kathrin Karner and Andrew Bell at

the ECTIL and the ETL, in Vienna, and Maria Olivas and Maria Subirós at the IECPL in Girona. Our thanks are also owed to Ann-Christin Maak-Scherpe and Ahmed Hegazi at Intersentia.

As editor of this book, I would also like to thank personally my colleagues who have written the national and the economic perspective reports for their infinite patience with a project that has been ongoing for many years.

Finally, I would like to emphasise that at a meeting of the Group held in Girona in 2018, the European Group on Tort Law decided to dedicate this book to our late colleague, Suzanne Carval, whom we all miss very much and will never forget.

Miquel Martín-Casals
Girona, June 2019

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Preface</i> | vii |
| <i>List of Authors</i> | xi |
| Introduction | 1 |
| Questionnaire and Hypothetical Cases | 7 |
| Austria | |
| Ernst KARNER and Bernhard A KOCH | 13 |
| Czech Republic | |
| Luboš TICHÝ | 45 |
| England and Wales | |
| Ken OLIPHANT and Vanessa WILCOX | 69 |
| France | |
| Jean-Sébastien BORGHETTI | 131 |
| Germany | |
| Ulrich MAGNUS | 171 |
| Greece | |
| Eugenia DACORONIA | 213 |
| Israel | |
| Israel GILEAD | 253 |
| Italy | |
| Cristina AMATO and Giovanni COMANDÉ | 281 |
| The Netherlands | |
| Anne LM KEIRSE | 331 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Norway | |
| Bjarte ASKELAND..... | 383 |
| Poland | |
| Ewa BAGIŃSKA..... | 419 |
| South Africa | |
| Johann NEETHLING..... | 467 |
| Spain | |
| Miquel MARTÍN-CASALS and Albert RUDA-GONZÁLEZ..... | 507 |
| Switzerland | |
| Pierre WIDMER, Bénédicct WINIGER and Caroline DURET..... | 569 |
| United States | |
| W Jonathan CARDI and Michael D GREEN..... | 617 |
| Economic Perspectives | |
| Michael FAURE and Wenqing LIAO..... | 669 |
| Comparative Report | |
| Miquel MARTÍN-CASALS..... | 711 |

LIST OF AUTHORS

Cristina Amato

Professor of Comparative Law, University of Brescia, Italy

Bjarte Askeland

Appeal court judge, Gulating Lagmannsrett, Bergen; former, until 2019, Professor of Private Law, University of Bergen, Norway

Ewa Bagińska

Professor of Civil Law, University of Gdańsk, Poland

Jean-Sébastien Borghetti

Professor of Private Law, University Panthéon-Assas (Paris II), France

Jonathan Cardi

Professor of Law, Wake Forest School of Law, United States

Giovanni Comandé

Professor of Comparative Law, Sant'Anna School of Advanced Studies, Pisa, Italy

Eugenia Dacoronia

Associate Professor of Civil Law, University of Athens, Greece

Caroline Duret

Doctoral Candidate, Faculty of Law, University of Geneva, Switzerland

Michael Faure

Professor of Comparative and Environmental Law, Maastricht University; Professor of Comparative Private Law and Economics, Erasmus School of Law, Rotterdam, The Netherlands

Israel Gilead

Emeritus Professor of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem; Professor, Sha'arey Mada Umishpat Academic Center, Israel

Michael D Green

Williams Professor of Law, Wake Forest School of Law, United States

Ernst Karner

Professor of Civil Law, University of Vienna; Director of the Institute for European Tort Law and the European Centre of Tort and Insurance Law, Austria

Anne LM Keirse

Professor of Private Law, Utrecht University; Judge at the Court of Appeal, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Bernhard A Koch

Professor of Civil and Comparative Law, University of Innsbruck, Austria

Wenqing Liao

Legal Counsel Alter Domus; Doctorate in Law and Economics, Maastricht University, The Netherlands

Ulrich Magnus

Emeritus Professor of Law, University of Hamburg; Affiliate Researcher, Max Planck Institute for Comparative and International Private Law, Hamburg; Judge (retired) at the Court of Appeal, Hamburg, Germany

Miquel Martín-Casals

Professor of Civil Law, University of Girona, Spain

Johann Neethling

Research Fellow of Private Law, University of the Free State, Bloemfontein; Emeritus Professor, University of South Africa, Pretoria, South Africa

Ken Oliphant

Professor of Tort Law, University of Bristol, United Kingdom

Albert Ruda-González

Associate Professor in Civil Law, University of Girona, Spain

Luboš Tichý

Professor of European, International Private Law and Civil Law, Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic

Pierre Widmer

Emeritus Professor, Swiss Institute of Comparative Law, Lausanne/Berne, Switzerland

Vanessa Wilcox

Secretary General of the European Law Institute, Former Assistant to the European Group on Tort Law, Austria

Bénédict Winiger

Professor of Law, University of Geneva, Switzerland