

## Access to Medicines

The Interface between Patents and Human Rights. Does one size fit all?

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 64

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Access to Medicines  
The Interface between Patents and Human Rights.  
Does one size fit all?

Jennifer Anna Sellin



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: [mail@intersentia.co.uk](mailto:mail@intersentia.co.uk)

Jennifer Anna Sellin  
Access to Medicines. The Interface between Patents and Human Rights. Does one  
size fit all?

ISBN 978-1-78068-247-1  
D/2014/7849/109  
NUR 828

Cover photograph © Vasabii – iStock/Thinkstock

© 2014 Intersentia  
[www.intersentia.com](http://www.intersentia.com) | [www.intersentia.co.uk](http://www.intersentia.co.uk)

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is  
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any  
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*Dedicated to W.T. Mugwiji*



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When I started working at the Faculty of Law of Maastricht University in the fall of 2007, I did not know what to expect. It turned out to be a life-changing decision. Above all it was a learning-experience, leading to the writing of this dissertation.

At last my name is on the cover of this book, but there are many people that have had a part in its progress and completion.

The process of writing a PhD is both wonderful and terrifying. The freedom to go wherever your research leads you is wonderful, the knowledge that you are the primary source material is terrifying. First and foremost, I have to thank my supervisors, Prof. Fons Coomans and Prof. Anselm Kamperman Sanders, for carefully reading and commenting upon the various drafts of the chapters of this dissertation. The combination of their respective areas of expertise and the confidence they showed in this endeavour have been crucial in getting this dissertation completed.

It was Fons who asked me to consider taking on this task when I was only a student-assistant for the Maastricht Centre for Human rights. And he has been a constant guide to me through this entire process. I thank him for sharing his knowledge and expertise and, especially, for taking the time to listen. I really appreciate him as a supervisor and colleague.

This research benefited from interviews with various people, all of whom, provided me information, shared their knowledge and answered my queries without hesitation. Special thanks to Moses Mulumba who was indispensable to making the most out of my short trip to Uganda, dr. Maheshwar Singh who made my trip to New Delhi successful on both a legal and culinary level and Leena Menghaney, who was a life saver at a moment of real crisis.

I also thank the members of the Assessment Committee who kindly agreed to read and evaluate the dissertation: Prof. Menno Kamminga, Prof. Peter van den Bossche, Prof. Paul Hunt, Prof. Duncan Matthews and Prof. David Townend.

Writing a PhD can be a lonely experience. My colleagues at the Faculty, many of whom have become dear friends, have really helped to make it seem less so. Thanks to all of you who have read, commented and discussed with me various aspects of my research and, maybe even more importantly, for the coffee breaks, dinners and nights out which made my time at the faculty enjoyable. In particular to:

## Acknowledgements

Martine, with whom I shared the many highs and lows of doing a PhD (and attended too many conferences, lectures, seminars to count). Jasper, for being my trusty “sounding board”! Emanuel and Anja, for being easy-going roommates. Dyebo, who patiently listened to my ramblings and made sure I was okay when I did not turn up at the office. Carol, who shared with me some of life’s lessons and for carefully proofreading this dissertation. And Anke, who taught me so much about doing research, managing the stress of a PhD, and for her personal support, along with Adela, Birsen, and Phyllis.

A very special thank you to my paranymphs Eliza and Tamara, for their support and friendship. Ineke, my best friend, and constant inspiration. And, Whitlaw, for being a distraction (both good and bad), always being able to calm me down and loving me just the way I am, flaws and all included. I couldn’t have done it without you!

And finally, my profound thanks to all my family, friends and colleagues for making sure I kept going, when giving up sometimes seemed the easier option. In particular to my parents, who taught me the most important lesson of all: that my family will always support me.

The sense of pride and satisfaction that comes from completing my dissertation is down to you.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....	xv

## **Part I**

<b>Method and Problem Statement</b> .....	1
---	---

### Chapter 1

Introduction & Methodology .....	3
1. Introduction .....	3
2. The Aim of This Research .....	4
3. The Research Questions .....	5
4. The Method .....	7
4.1. Sources .....	10
4.2. Manner of Interpretation .....	13
4.3. The Selection of Countries .....	16
4.4. Limitations of the Study .....	19

### Chapter 2

Access to Medicines: the Problem .....	21
1. Introduction .....	21
2. Access to Essential Medicines .....	24
2.1. Defining Essential Medicines .....	24
2.2. Access .....	27
2.3. Availability and Affordability in Developing Countries .....	29
2.4. Conclusion .....	32
3. The Pharmaceutical Market .....	32
3.1. Regulatory Review: Marketing Approval for Medicines .....	36
3.2. Conclusion .....	38
4. Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals .....	38
4.1. What Are Patents? .....	38
4.1.1. Brief History of Patent Law .....	39
4.1.2. Why We need Patents: Rationales of Patent Protection .....	44
4.2. Research and Development .....	47
4.2.1. An Incentive to innovate? Neglected Diseases .....	49
4.3. Conclusion .....	54
5. Patents – Access: Interference? .....	55
6. Conclusion .....	60

**Part II**  
**International Framework** ..... 63

Chapter 3

A Human Right of Access to Medicines?..... 65

1.	Introduction.....	65
2.	The International Human Rights Framework.....	66
2.1.	Brief History of the Concept of Human Rights.....	66
2.2.	Civil & Political Rights vs. Economic, Social & Cultural Rights.....	69
2.3.	The UN Human Rights Framework.....	71
3.	The Human Right to Health: Introduction.....	76
3.1.	Treaty Law: Article 12 ICESCR.....	78
3.1.1.	The Principle of Non-Discrimination.....	80
3.1.2.	Limitations.....	81
3.2.	Soft Law: The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	82
3.2.1.	Scope of the Right to Health.....	82
3.2.2.	States Parties' Obligations.....	84
3.3.	Other Treaties protecting the Right to Health.....	93
3.4.	Monitoring and Accountability.....	98
3.4.1.	Violations of the Right to Health.....	100
3.4.2.	Justiciability.....	102
3.4.3.	Case Law.....	107
3.4.4.	Conclusion.....	116
3.5.	Special Rapporteur on the Right to Health.....	117
3.6.	Conclusion: Is there a Right of Access to Essential Medicines within the Right to Health?.....	121
4.	The Human Right to Life: Article 6 ICCPR.....	122
5.	The Human Right to the Benefits of Science: Article 15 ICESCR.....	125
6.	Access to Medicines under Customary International Law.....	128
6.1.	The International Bill of Rights.....	131
6.2.	A Customary Right of Access to Medicines?.....	132
7.	Conclusion: A Human Right of Access to Medicines?.....	141

Chapter 4

The TRIPS Agreement: Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals ..... 143

1.	Introduction.....	143
2.	The World Trade Organization.....	144
2.1.	Negotiation Process of the TRIPS Agreement.....	146
2.2.	Dispute Settlement.....	151
3.	The Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights.....	159

3.1. General Provisions and Basic Principles . . . . .	161
3.2. Objectives and Principles . . . . .	167
3.3. Transitional Arrangements . . . . .	170
3.4. Patents . . . . .	176
3.4.1. Article 27 TRIPS: Patentable Subject Matter . . . . .	176
3.4.2. Article 28: Rights Conferred . . . . .	188
3.4.3. Article 33 TRIPS: Patent Term . . . . .	192
3.4.4. Articles 30 & 31 TRIPS: Exceptions . . . . .	193
3.4.5. Article 32 TRIPS: Revocation . . . . .	211
3.5. Protection of Undisclosed Information . . . . .	213
3.6. Enforcement of Intellectual Property Rights . . . . .	216
4. Conclusion . . . . .	222

**Chapter 5**

The Interface between Patents and Human Rights in the Context of Access to Medicines . . . . .	225
---	-----

1. Introduction . . . . .	225
2. ICESCR – TRIPS: Conflict? . . . . .	230
2.1. Narrow Definition of Conflict: Inconsistent Obligations? . . . . .	233
2.2. Broad Definition of Conflict: Tension? . . . . .	234
3. How to Resolve the Tension? . . . . .	238
4. The Principle of Human Rights Primacy . . . . .	242
4.1. The Right to Health as a Superior Norm in International Law? . . . . .	245
5. Harmonious Interpretation: The Principle of Systemic Integration . . . . .	252
5.1. The Doha Declaration on the TRIPS Agreement and Public Health & Article 31 <i>bis</i> TRIPS . . . . .	258
5.2. WTO Dispute Settlement Mechanism: Interpreting TRIPS in Light of Human Rights Standards? . . . . .	270
6. TRIPS-plus Developments . . . . .	281
7. Conclusion . . . . .	288

**Part III**

<b>Country Studies . . . . .</b>	<b>291</b>
----------------------------------	------------

**Chapter 6**

Access to Medicines in South Africa . . . . .	293
1. Introduction . . . . .	293
2. HIV/AIDS and Access to Medicines . . . . .	294
3. A Human Right of Access to Medicines? . . . . .	299
3.1. The South African Constitution of 1996 . . . . .	300
3.2. Cases before the Constitutional Court . . . . .	306
3.3. Conclusion . . . . .	313

4.	Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals: Standards & Flexibilities . . . . .	315
4.1.	The Patents Act No. 57 of 1978 . . . . .	315
4.1.1.	Patent standards . . . . .	316
4.1.2.	Exceptions . . . . .	319
4.1.3.	Conclusion . . . . .	327
4.2.	The Medicines and Related Substances Act No. 101 of 1965 . . . . .	329
4.2.1.	Section 15C: Measures to Ensure the Supply of Affordable Medicines . . . . .	330
4.2.2.	Further Measures under the Medicines Act . . . . .	333
4.2.3.	Conclusion . . . . .	335
4.3.	The Competition Act No. 89 of 1998 . . . . .	336
4.3.1.	Abuse of Dominance . . . . .	338
4.3.2.	Competition Cases . . . . .	341
4.3.3.	Conclusion . . . . .	343
5.	Conclusion: Striking a Balance? . . . . .	345

## Chapter 7

	Access to Medicines in India . . . . .	347
1.	Introduction . . . . .	347
2.	The Generic Pharmaceutical Industry and Access to Medicines . . . . .	348
3.	A Human Right of Access to Medicines? . . . . .	352
3.1.	The Indian Constitution of 1949 . . . . .	352
3.2.	Cases before the Supreme Court . . . . .	355
3.3.	Conclusion . . . . .	358
4.	Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals: Standards & Flexibilities . . . . .	360
4.1.	The Patents Act of 1970 . . . . .	360
4.1.1.	Transitional Periods TRIPS . . . . .	362
4.1.2.	Patent Standards . . . . .	367
4.1.3.	Procedural Mechanisms: Opposition Proceedings & Revocation . . . . .	378
4.1.4.	Exceptions . . . . .	381
4.2.	Conclusion . . . . .	394
5.	TRIPS-plus Developments . . . . .	396
6.	Conclusion . . . . .	397

## Chapter 8

	Access to Medicines in Uganda . . . . .	399
1.	Introduction . . . . .	399
2.	Least-Developed Countries and Access to Medicines . . . . .	400
3.	A Human Right of Access to Medicines? . . . . .	405
3.1.	The Ugandan Constitution of 1995 . . . . .	405
3.2.	Health Legislation and Policy . . . . .	413

3.3. Conclusion .....	415
4. Patent Protection for Pharmaceuticals: Standards & Flexibilities .....	415
4.1. The Patents Act of 1993 .....	416
4.2. Uganda's Law Reform: The Draft Industrial Property Bill of 2009 .....	423
4.2.1. Patent standards .....	424
4.2.2. Exceptions .....	428
4.3. Conclusion .....	432
5. Conclusion .....	434
 Chapter 9	
Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations .....	437
1. Patents – Access: Interference .....	437
2. A Human Right of Access to (Essential) Medicines .....	438
3. TRIPS Minimum Standards for Patent Protection .....	444
4. The Interface between Patents and Access: Tension? .....	446
5. Striking a Balance .....	449
6. Conclusion & Recommendations .....	457
 <i>Bibliography</i> .....	 461
<i>Curriculum Vitae</i> .....	491



## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AB	Appellate Body (World Trade Organisation)
ALP	Aids Law Project
ARVs	antiretrovirals
BI	Boehringer Ingelheim
BITs	bilateral investment treaties
CEDAW	Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CRC	Committee on the Rights of the Child
DPSP	Directive Principles of State Policy (India)
DSB	Dispute Settlement Body (World Trade Organisation)
DSU	Understanding on Rules and Procedures for the Settlement of Disputes
ECOSOC	UN Economic and Social Council
EFPIA	European Federation of Pharmaceutical Industries and Associations
EMRs	exclusive marketing rights
ESC rights	economic, social and cultural rights
FDA	US Food and Drug Administration
FDI	foreign direct investment
FTAs	free trade agreements
GA	UN General Assembly
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
GDP	gross domestic product
GNI	gross national income
GSK	GlaxoSmithKline
HAI	Health Action International
HIV/AIDS	human immunodeficiency virus/acquired immune deficiency syndrome
HRC	UN Human Rights Council
HRCee	Human Rights Committee
HRCion	UN Commission on Human Rights
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
IFPMA	International Federation of Pharmaceutical Manufacturers & Associations

List of Abbreviations

IIPA	International Intellectual Property Alliance
ILC	International Law Commission
IP	intellectual property
IPRs	intellectual property rights
LDCs	least-developed countries
MFN	most-favoured nation treatment principle
NCE	new chemical entity
NDP	National Drug Policy
NGO	non-governmental organisation
NODPSP	National Objectives and Directive Principles of State Policy (Uganda)
PhRMA	Pharmaceutical Research and Manufacturers of America
PIL	Public Interest Litigation
PMA	Pharmaceutical Manufacturer's Association
R&D	research and development
SADC	Southern African Development Community
TAC	Treatment Action Campaign
TB	Tuberculosis
TRIPS	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
ULRC	Uganda Law Reform Commission
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USTR	United States Trade Representative
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WHA	World Health Assembly
WHO	World Health Organisation
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organisation
WTO	World Trade Organisation