

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

VOLUME XLVI:

**SPECIAL COURT FOR SIERRA LEONE
(1 January 2008 – 18 March 2009)**

André KLIP, Steven FREELAND (eds.)

Anzinga LOW (assistant editor)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Fax: +44 1223 370 169
Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK and Ireland:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for Europe and all other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50 | Fax: +32 3 658 71 21
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free) | Fax: +1 503 280 8832
Email: info@isbs.com

Please cite as: SCSL, Judgment, *Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu*, Case No. SCSL-2004-16-A, A. Ch., 22 February 2008, Klip/Freeland, ALC-XLVI-169.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals

© André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor) 2016

The author has asserted the right under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, to be identified as author of this work.

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Intersentia, or as expressly permitted by law or under the terms agreed with the appropriate reprographic rights organisation. Enquiries concerning reproduction which may not be covered by the above should be addressed to Intersentia at the address above.

Cover illustration: Chiara Cauwenbergh

ISBN 978-1-78068-239-6
D/2016/7849/41
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	7
 Part I Preliminary Matters	
1. Indictment	
Decision on Urgent Defence Motion Regarding a Fatal Defect in the Prosecution’s Second Amended Indictment Relating to the Pleading of JCE, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03–1-T, T. Ch. II, 27 February 2009	9
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Richard Lussick	27
Decision on Defence Application for Leave to Appeal the Decision on Urgent Defence Motion Regarding a Fatal Defect in the Prosecution’s Second Amended Indictment Relating to the Pleading of JCE, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03–1-T, T. Ch. II, 18 March 2009	35
Commentary <i>Menno Dolman</i>	39
 Part II Procedural Matters	
2. Witnesses	
Decision on Sesay Application for Disclosure Pursuant to Rules 89 (B) and/or 66(A) (ii), <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 10 January 2008	47
Decision on Sesay Defence Motion and Three Sesay Defence Applications to Admit 23 Witness Statements Under Rule 92BIS, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 15 May 2008	55
Written Reasons Decision on the Admissibility of Certain Prior Statements of the Accused Given to the Prosecution, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 30 June 2008	69
Separate Concurring and Partially Dissenting Opinion of Hon. Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe . . .	85
Decision on Public Prosecution Application for Leave to Appeal Decision Regarding the Tender of Documents, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03–1-T, T. Ch. II, 10 December 2008	93
Separate Dissenting Opinion of Justice Julia Sebutinde	97
Decision on Prosecution Motion for Admission of Liberia Search Documents, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03–1-T, T. Ch. II, 18 February 2009	99
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Julia Sebutinde	109
Commentary <i>Hilde Farthofer</i>	110
 3. Subpoena of President Kabbah	
Written Reasoned Decision on Motion for Issuance of a Subpoena to H.E. Dr. Ahmad Tejan Kabbah, Former President of the Republic of Sierra Leone, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 30 June 2008	117

Separate Concurring Opinion of Hon. Justice Benjamin Mutanga Itoe	123
Commentary <i>Cedric Ryngaert and Yulia Bodrova</i>	131
4. Aspects of a Fair Trial	
Decision on the Sesay Defence Team’s Application for Judicial Review of the Registrar’s Refusal to Provide Additional Funds for an Additional Counsel as Part of the Implementation of the Arbitration Agreement of the 26 th of April 2007, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 12 February 2008	135
Written Decision on Sesay Defence Application for a Week’s Adjournment-Insufficient Resources in Violation of Article 17 (4) (b) of the Statute of the Special Court, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 5 March 2008	145
Decision on Confidential Prosecution Motion for Additional Protective Measures for the Trial Proceedings of Witnesses TF1–515, 516, 385, 539, 567, 388, and 390, <i>Prosecutor v. Taylor</i> , Case No. SCSL-03–1-T, T. Ch. II, 13 March 2008	157
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Justice Doherty	161
Commentary <i>Tessa Alleblas</i>	163
Part III Judgements	
5. Judgements	
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Brima, Kamara and Kanu</i> , Case No. SCSL-2004–16-A, A. Ch., 22 February 2008	169
Commentary <i>Inneke Onsea and Priyadarshini Narayanan</i>	243
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Fofana and Kondewa</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–14-A, A. Ch., 28 May 2008	251
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Honourable Justice George Gelaga King	373
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Honourable Justice Renate Winter	395
Partially Dissenting Opinion on Sentencing of Justice Jon Kamanda	416
Commentary <i>Miguel Lemos</i>	424
Judgment, <i>Prosecutor v. Sesay, Kallon and Gbao</i> , Case No. SCSL-04–15-T, T. Ch. I, 2 March 2009	439
Dissenting Opinion of Justice Pierre Boutet	861
Separate Concurring opinion of Justice Bankole	866
Commentary <i>Ousman Njikam, Amir Cengic and Yao Li</i>	950
Contributors and Editors	981

PREFACE

This is the forty-sixth volume in the series 'Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals' (ALC) and contains the most important decisions of the Special Court for Sierra Leone (SCSL) from 1 January 2008 up to and including 18 March 2009. It is the fourth volume in the series containing decisions of the SCSL. At the time of writing this preface, the SCSL has finalised all its trials in Freetown, Sierra Leone; the convicted persons were transferred very shortly after their convictions were upheld on appeal. It has also finalised its last trial, the Taylor case, in The Hague and has been followed up by the establishment of a Residual Special Court. We intend to cover all of these decisions in the near future in subsequent ALC volumes on the SCSL, ALC Volume 47 and ALC Volume 51.

The present volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the decisions and judgements, including separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with the previous volumes, the editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the SCSL Press and Information Office and which bears the signatures of the Judges. We are aware that most decisions are available on the internet. However, only the written decisions bearing the signatures of the Judges can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the internet version, if the latter is available at all. Much of our editorial efforts involve ensuring that the texts in this series are identical to the written original version. We could only include the full text of the decisions in this volume by reducing their original format. Still, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is throughout the text put in brackets [].

We are again very happy that a number of distinguished scholars in the field of international criminal law were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding the decisions.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions may give the user insight into our working method. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. Of course, we cannot publish all decisions. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a similar or identical way to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions published in this volume are presented in different parts and under different headings. Part 1, 'Preliminary Matters', includes decisions concerning the indictment (1). Part 2 deals with procedural matters. Under different headings it contains a wide array of procedural decisions: various decisions related to witnesses (2), a further decision on the subpoena of President Kabbah (3), and several decisions on aspects of a fair trial (4). Part 3, 'Judgement and Sentencing', contains three judgements.

We owe acknowledgements to many persons without whom we could not have completed this forty-sixth volume. These include the SCSL Press and Information Office, which offered generous assistance in obtaining all the necessary copies of decisions. Our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, facilitated our work. We also acknowledge the work of our assistant-editor, Anzinga Low, who assisted us and without whom we would not be able to publish this series. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research stimulated our work.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the SCSL and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students. As always, we welcome any comments or suggestions from readers in order to help us to ensure that the ALC series promotes a greater understanding of the jurisprudence of all of the major international criminal courts and tribunals.

André Klip and Steven Freeland

Maastricht/ Sydney, 2015