



The Role of EU State Aid Law in Promoting a Pro-Innovation Policy

A Review from the Perspective of University-
Industry R&D Cooperation

The Role of EU State Aid Law in Promoting
a Pro-Innovation Policy

A Review from the Perspective of
University-Industry R&D Cooperation

DISSERTATION

to obtain the degree of Doctor
at the Maastricht University,
on the authority of the Rector Magnificus,
Prof. dr. L.L.G. Soete
in accordance with the decision of the Board of Deans,
to be defended in public
on Wednesday 2 April 2014, at 14.00 hours

by

Mario Cisneros

Supervisor:

Prof. dr. M.G. Faure

Co-Supervisor:

Dr. N.J. Philipsen

Assessment Committee:

Prof. dr. H.E.G.S. Schneider (Chair)

Prof. dr. P.A. Nicolaides

Prof. dr. R.H.C. Luja

Cover photograph © ruskpp – Shutterstock.com

Layout by Marina Jodogne.

A commercial edition of this PhD thesis will be published by Intersentia in the Ius Commune Europaeum Series, No. 127 under ISBN 978-1-78068-234-1.



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my supervisors, Prof. Michael Faure and Dr. Niels Philipsen, for their support, commitment and confidence in my work. To the evaluation committee, for their comments and suggestions on the final draft.

To Prof. H. Goddar, Prof. J. Drexl and Prof. R. Hilty for their guidance at the early stages of the project. To A. Wechsler and S. Nerisson, for their assistance during my work at the International Max Planck Research School for Competition and Innovation.

To N. Pessareci, C. Tenreiro, B. Von Wendland and M. Engstrom for the valuable discussions during my research stay at the European Commission. To Marina Jodogne, Roger Snijders and Yleen Simonis for editing and research support.

This work has been done with the assistance of a Max Planck Society Scholarship.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v

TABLE OF CONTENTSvii

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS xi

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES.....xiii

INTRODUCTION..... 1

1. Objectives and Limits of this Research..... 1

2. Summary of the Literature Review 3

3. Approach to the Research Questions 5

4. Hypothesis and Research Questions 7

5. Structure and Methodology..... 7

CHAPTER 1

EU STATE AID LAW IN THE CONTEXT OF PUBLIC-PRIVATE R&D COOPERATION 11

1. Introduction 11

2. State Aid Modernization 12

2.1. Definitions and Scope..... 13

2.2. Architecture 13

2.3. Compatibility Criteria 14

3. State Aid within Article 107(1) TFEU 15

3.1. The Primary Incompatibility of Aid with the Internal Market 15

3.2. The Notion of Aid 17

3.3. Direct and Indirect Types of Aid 26

4. State Aid Compatible with the Internal Market 28

4.1. Aid that Shall be Compatible: Automatic Exemptions Pursuant
Article 107(2) TFEU..... 28

4.2.	Aid that May be Compatible: Discretionary Exemptions Pursuant Article 107(3) TFEU.....	29
5.	Block Exemptions.....	30
5.1.	General Block Exemption Regulation – Reg (EC) No. 800-2008	31
5.2.	De Minimis Aid Policy	34
6.	State Aid Pursuant Article 107(3)(c): R&D and Innovation.....	35
7.	Conclusions.....	37

CHAPTER 2

ECONOMIC FOUNDATIONS OF R&D&I STATE AID – RULES FOR PUBLIC-PRIVATE R&D COOPERATION.....

		41
1.	Introduction	41
2.	State Aid Rules for Cooperation, Research Contracts and Research Services	42
2.1.	Research Organizations and Innovation Intermediaries as Recipients of State Aid	43
2.2.	Indirect State Aid through Publicly Funded Research Organizations.....	46
3.	The Economic Foundations of EU State Aid for R&D&I	52
3.1.	Justifications for State Aid Measures.....	54
3.2.	Justifications for State Aid Control	62
4.	The Balancing Test	65
4.1.	Positive Effects of the Measure	67
4.2.	Negative Effects – Distortion of Competition and Effects on Trade	70
5.	Conclusions.....	74

CHAPTER 3

INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS AND KNOWLEDGE DISSEMINATION FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF R&D STATE AID POLICY

		75
1.	Introduction	75
2.	Dynamic Efficiency and Systemic Failures.....	77
3.	Ownership of Intellectual Property Rights.....	80
3.1.	The Leipzig Halle Case.....	81
3.2.	Distortion of Competition and IPRs Ownership	82
3.3.	Selective Advantage and IPRs Ownership	85
3.4.	Adverse Effects on Trade and Allocation of IPRs.....	86
4.	Knowledge Dissemination.....	87
4.1.	Existence of State Aid as a Consequence of Limitations to Knowledge Dissemination.....	89
4.2.	Distortion of Competition as a Result of Limitations in Knowledge Dissemination.....	90
4.3.	The Grant of an Advantage and Knowledge Dissemination Restrictions....	92

5.	Use and Licensing of IPRs	93
5.1.	Limitations of Dynamic Incentives and IPRs Use	95
5.2.	Selective Advantage and the Use of IPRs	96
5.3.	Distortion of Competition by Limiting the Use of IPRs to Third Parties	98
5.4.	Distortion of Competition by the Enforcement of IPRs	98
6.	Conclusions.....	99
CHAPTER 4		
STATE AID LAW FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF MODEL AGREEMENTS AND THE VIEWS		
OF STAKEHOLDERS..... 101		
1.	Introduction	101
2.	Model Agreements for R&D Cooperation	102
2.1.	The Lambert Agreements for Collaborative Research	103
2.2.	BMW Model Agreements	111
2.3.	The European Commission Position on Model Agreements	115
3.	Public Consultation on the R&D&I State Aid Framework	121
3.1.	Agreements on Ownership and Transfer of IPRs	122
3.2.	Compensation Equivalent to Market Price for the Transfer of IPRs	124
4.	Conclusions.....	128
CHAPTER 5		
CONCLUSIONS..... 133		
1.	Summary and Main Results	133
2.	Limits and Further Research	139
SUMMARY		
141		
SAMENVATTING.....		
143		
TABLE OF CASES.....		
145		
BIBLIOGRAPHY		
151		
CURRICULUM VITAE.....		
165		

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AIAD	Italian Federation for Aerospace, Defense and Security Industry
BMWi	Federal Ministry of Economics and Technology
CFI	Court of First Instance
DG	Directorate General
EC	European Commission
ECJ	The Court of Justice of the European Union
<i>e.g.</i>	<i>exempli gratia</i> , for example
EPC	European Patent Convention
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro
FEC	Full Economic Cost
FP7	Seventh Framework Program for Research and Technological Development
GBER	General Block Exemption Regulation
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HEIF	Higher Education Innovation Fund (UK)
IAS	International Accounting Standard
<i>i.e.</i>	<i>id est</i> ; that is
IP	Intellectual Property
IPRs	Intellectual Property Rights
IRR	Internal Rate of Return
LBG	Ludwig Boltzmann Institut für Krebsforschung
MEIP	Market economy investor principle
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
p.	Page
pp.	Pages
para.	Paragraph
paras.	Paragraphs
pers. comm.	Personal communication
PRO	Public Research Organization
RCN	Research Council of Norway
RO	Research Organization
R&D	Research and Development

List of Abbreviations

R&D&I	Research and Development and Innovation
SAM	State Aid Modernisation
SGEI	Services of general economic interest
SMEs	Small and medium-sized enterprises
TAFIE	European Network of Innovation Agencies
TEC	Treaty establishing the European Community
Tekes	Finnish Funding Agency for Technology and Innovation
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TTO	Technology Transfer Office
VINNOVA	Sweden's Innovation Agency
WTO	World Trade Organization



LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 1. Decisive Elements of State Aid	39
Figure 2. Symmetric Game for State Aid Decisions	64
Figure 3. The Balancing Test and Detailed Assessment of State Aid Measures.	66
Table 1. GBER Aid Intensities for R&D	38
Table 2. IPRs and Publication Terms for Lambert Model Research Collaboration Agreements.....	131

