

## CHILDREN'S RIGHTS IN INTERCOUNTRY ADOPTION

EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW SERIES

Published by the Organising Committee of the  
Commission on European Family Law

Prof. Katharina Boele-Woelki (Utrecht)

Prof. Frédérique Ferrand (Lyon)

Prof. Cristina Gonzalez Beilfuss (Barcelona)

Prof. Maarit Jänterä-Jareborg (Uppsala)

Prof. Nigel Lowe (Cardiff)

Prof. Dieter Martiny (Frankfurt/Oder)

Ass. Prof. Velina Todorova (Plovdiv)

CHILDREN'S RIGHTS IN  
INTERCOUNTRY ADOPTION

A European Perspective

Claire FENTON-GLYNN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd  
Sheraton House | Castle Park  
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*  
NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*  
Stämpfli Verlag AG  
Wölflistrasse 1  
Postfach 5662  
3001 Bern  
Switzerland  
Tel.: +41 31 300 66 77  
Email: verlag@staempfli.com

*Distribution for other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Children's Rights in Intercountry Adoption. A European Perspective  
Claire Fenton-Glynn

© 2014 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-228-0  
D/2014/7849/64  
NUR 822



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*To Dan and Catriona Simmonds*



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has developed from my doctoral thesis, completed at the University of Cambridge in 2013. During this time, I have benefited enormously from the advice, encouragement, comments and criticisms of many friends and colleagues, both on this manuscript, and in reaction to talks and papers that have been based on it.

In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to my doctoral supervisor, Dr Andrew Bainham, for his willingness to share his time and extensive expertise, and to Dr Jens Scherpe, for his advice and unwavering support in all aspects of academic life over the last four years. I would also like to thank Professor Jonathan Herring for his insightful comments and constructive discussions in examining the thesis.

The research in this book could not have been undertaken without invaluable assistance from many colleagues who helped me to find foreign texts or provided translations: Humberto Cantu Rivera, Tom Coppen, Philippe de Bonneval, Marco Devesas-Campos, Elena Kazamia, Demetrio Maltese, Nora Markard, Sergii Masol, Natasa Mavronicola, and Rumiana Yotova. Thank you for so generously sharing your knowledge and skills.

Finally, thanks must go to Shaun Berg, who gave me my first chance, and helped me to become the lawyer, academic and person I am today.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	xiii
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1. The Importance of Europe .....	6
1.2. Structure of the Book .....	7
<b>Chapter 2. Combating Abuses: International and Regional Regulation</b> .....	11
2.1. United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child .....	12
2.2. Hague Convention on Protection of Children and Co-operation in Respect of Intercountry Adoption .....	16
2.3. Revised European Convention on the Adoption of Children 2008 .....	18
2.4. Proposing Normative Guidelines .....	18
<b>Chapter 3. Intercountry Adoption and the Domestic Child Welfare System: The Principle of Subsidiarity</b> .....	21
3.1. Subsidiarity in Practice: Waiting Periods and Necessary Conditions ...	22
3.2. Continuity of Culture, Language, Religion and Ethnicity .....	30
3.3. The Place of Domestic Alternatives .....	34
3.3.1. Institutional Care: Can It Ever be Appropriate? .....	35
3.3.2. Foster Care: Alternative or Smoke-Screen? .....	41
3.4. Impact of Intercountry Adoption on the Domestic Child Welfare System .....	43
3.4.1. Sending Countries .....	43
3.4.2. Receiving Countries .....	47
3.5. Conclusion .....	48
<b>Chapter 4. Consenting Adults: Giving and Receiving Consent to Adoption</b> ..	51
4.1. Consent by the Birth Mother .....	53
4.1.1. How Soon Is Too Soon? The Timing of a Mother's Consent and its Revocation .....	54
4.1.2. Promoting Assistance during the Adoption Process .....	60
4.1.3. Conclusion .....	65

4.2.	Consent by the Father . . . . .	66
4.2.1.	The Importance of Establishing Paternity. . . . .	66
4.2.2.	Who Is Required to Give Consent to an Adoption Order?. . . . .	67
4.2.3.	Establishing Paternity: Registration, Acknowledgement and Court Order . . . . .	72
4.2.4.	Identifying the Father: Investigation and Determination . . . . .	75
4.3.	Conclusion . . . . .	80
<b>Chapter 5. Buying Babies: The Inducement of Consent . . . . .</b>		<b>81</b>
5.1.	International Instruments . . . . .	81
5.2.	Elements of Consent . . . . .	83
5.2.1.	“Free” Consent. . . . .	83
5.2.2.	Is Consent Ever Free? . . . . .	86
5.3.	Payments and Compensation . . . . .	89
5.4.	Improper Financial Gain in Adoption. . . . .	95
5.4.1.	“Approved Non-Accredited Bodies”. . . . .	99
5.4.2.	Independent and Private Adoption . . . . .	100
5.5.	Conclusion . . . . .	103
<b>Chapter 6. Compulsory Adoption: Adoption Without Consent. . . . .</b>		<b>105</b>
6.1.	Loss of Parental Rights and Parental Misconduct . . . . .	106
6.2.	Overriding a Refusal to Consent. . . . .	108
6.3.	Abandonment, Lack of Contact and Disinterest . . . . .	110
6.4.	Legal Assistance to Parents . . . . .	113
6.5.	Conclusion . . . . .	114
<b>Chapter 7. Child Participation: Autonomy and Protection . . . . .</b>		<b>117</b>
7.1.	International Instruments . . . . .	118
7.2.	Adoption in Europe. . . . .	121
7.3.	Autonomous Decision-Making. . . . .	122
7.3.1.	Strict Age Limits . . . . .	122
7.3.2.	Age Limits with Exceptions for Capable Children . . . . .	126
7.3.3.	Age Limits with Exceptions for Best Interests . . . . .	127
7.3.4.	No Age Limit or Laws on Consent . . . . .	128
7.3.5.	European Convention on Human Rights . . . . .	130
7.4.	Participation of Younger Children . . . . .	133
7.5.	Participation and the Protection of the Child's Welfare. . . . .	139
7.6.	Conclusion . . . . .	145

<b>Chapter 8. Adoptive Parents: Eligibility, Preparation, and Support</b> . . . . .	147
8.1. Adoptive Parents and the Rights of Children: Complementary or Contradictory? . . . . .	148
8.1.1. Intercountry Adoption: An Emerging Market . . . . .	148
8.1.2. A Right to a Child? . . . . .	151
8.2. Qualifications of Adoptive Parents . . . . .	154
8.2.1. International Instruments . . . . .	154
8.2.2. The Age of Adopters: How Old Is Too Old? . . . . .	155
8.2.3. Marital Status: Single Adoption . . . . .	163
8.2.4. Marital Status: Unmarried Couples . . . . .	166
8.2.5. Adoption by Same-Sex Couples: Changing Social Perceptions? . . . . .	169
8.2.6. Conclusion . . . . .	172
8.3. Facilitating the Adoption: Counselling, Contact, Monitoring and Support . . . . .	172
8.3.1. Counselling of Prospective Adoptive Parents. . . . .	173
8.3.2. Establishing a Pre-Adoption Relationship . . . . .	177
8.3.3. Post-Adoption Services. . . . .	179
8.4. Conclusion . . . . .	183
<b>Chapter 9. Who Am I? The Child’s Right to Identity.</b> . . . . .	185
9.1. International Instruments . . . . .	185
9.1.1. United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child . . . . .	185
9.1.2. Hague Convention on Intercountry Adoption. . . . .	188
9.1.3. Revised European Convention on the Adoption of Children . . . . .	189
9.2. The Right to Access Information? . . . . .	190
9.2.1. Why Is Access to Information Important for a Child? . . . . .	190
9.2.2. The Child’s Access to Information in Europe. . . . .	191
9.3. Secrecy and Birth Parents. . . . .	197
9.3.1. Must Information Be Recorded? . . . . .	197
9.3.2. Balancing the Rights of Biological Parents and Children. . . . .	207
9.4. Conclusion . . . . .	210
<b>Chapter 10. Conclusion</b> . . . . .	211
<i>List of Legislation</i> . . . . .	217
<i>Literature</i> . . . . .	223
<i>Index.</i> . . . . .	247



# TABLE OF CASES

## EUROPEAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

<i>B, R and J v Federal Republic of Germany</i> (Appl. No. 9639/82) Decision of 15 March 1984. ....	70
<i>Berrehab v the Netherlands</i> (Appl. No. 10730/84) Decision of 21 June 1988 ...	69
<i>ED v Ireland</i> (Appl. No. 25054/94) Decision of 18 October 1995. ....	33
<i>MB v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 22920/93) Decision of 6 April 1994. ....	69
<i>VS v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 4261/02) Admissibility Decision of 22 May 2007. ....	59
<i>X v Belgium and the Netherlands</i> (Appl. No. 6482/74) Decision of 10 July 1975. ....	152, 165, 166
<i>X v the Netherlands</i> (Appl. No. 8896/80) Decision of 10 March 1981 ...	162
<i>X v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 7626/76) Decision of 11 July 1977 ...	69

## EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS

<i>Airey v Ireland</i> (Appl. No. 6289/73) Judgment of 9 October 1979; [1979] ECHR 3 ...	114
<i>Anayo v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 20578/07) Judgment of 21 December 2010; [2010] ECHR 393 ...	69
<i>EB v France</i> (Appl. No. 43546/02) Judgment of 22 January 2008; [2008] ECHR 55 ...	162, 171
<i>Evans v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 6339/05) Judgment of 10 April 2008; [2007] ECHR 264. ....	151
<i>Fretté v France</i> (Appl. No. 36515/97) Judgment of 26 February 2002; [2002] ECHR 156. ....	162, 171
<i>Gas and Dubois v France</i> (Appl. No. 25951/07) Judgment of 15 March 2012 ...	168
<i>Gaskin v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 10454/83) Judgment of 7 July 1989; [1989] ECHR 13 ...	208
<i>Godelli v Italy</i> (Appl. No. 33783/09) 25 September 2012 ...	209
<i>Hokkanen v Finland</i> (Appl. No. 19823/92) Judgment of 23 September 1994; [1994] ECHR 32. ....	132

<i>Johansen v Norway</i> (Appl. No. 17383/90) Judgment of 7 August 1996; [1996] ECHR 31 .....	105, 110
<i>Kearns v France</i> (Appl. No. 35991/04) Judgment of 10 January 2008; [2008] ECHR 1 .....	59, 64
<i>Keegan v Ireland</i> (Appl. No. 16969/90) Judgment of 26 May 1994; [1994] ECHR 18 .....	22, 69
<i>Kutzner v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 46544/99) Judgment of 26 February 2002, [2002] ECHR 160 .....	87
<i>Marckx v Belgium</i> (Appl. No. 6833/74) Judgment of 13 June 1979; [1979] ECHR 2 .....	53, 69
<i>McMichael v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 16424/90) Judgment of 24 February 1995; [1995] ECHR 8 .....	71
<i>Neulinger and Shuruk v Switzerland</i> (Appl. No. 41615/07) Judgement of 6 July 2010; [2010] ECHR 1053 .....	111
<i>Nielsen v Denmark</i> (Appl. No. 10929/84) Judgment of 28 November 1988; [1988] ECHR 23 .....	130–131
<i>Odièvre v France</i> (Appl. No. 42326/98) Judgment of 13 February 2003; [2003] ECHR 86 .....	69, 194, 198, 199, 202, 203, 207–209
<i>Olsson v Sweden (No 2)</i> (Appl. No. 13441/87) Judgment of 27 November 1992; [1992] ECHR 75 .....	27, 143
<i>P, C and S v the United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 56547/00) Judgment of 16 July 2002; [2002] ECHR 604 .....	110, 114
<i>Pini and Others v Romania</i> (Appl. No. 78028/01) Judgment of 22 June 2004; [2005] ECHR 275 .....	22
<i>R and H v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 35348/06) Judgment of 31 May 2011; [2011] ECHR 844 .....	64, 110
<i>Raw and Others v France</i> (Appl. No. 10131/11) Judgment of 7 March 2013; [2013] ECHR 199 .....	144
<i>Rozanski v Poland</i> (Appl. No. 55339/00) Judgment of 18 May 2006; [2006] ECHR 545 .....	70, 73
<i>Sahin v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 19301/92) Judgment of 10 April 2001; [2001] ECHR 266 .....	125, 128, 136, 137
<i>Saviny v Ukraine</i> (Appl. No. 39948/06) Judgment of 18 December 2008 .....	87
<i>Schneider v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 17080/07) Judgment of 15 September 2011; [2011] ECHR 2416 .....	69, 70
<i>T v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 24724/94) Judgment of 16 December 1999; [1999] ECHR 170 .....	131
<i>Todorova v Italy</i> (Appl. No 33932/06) Judgment of 13 January 2009; [2009] ECHR 69 .....	57
<i>W v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 9749/82) Judgment of 8 July 1987; [1987] ECHR 17 .....	64
<i>Wagner and JMWL v Luxembourg</i> (Appl. No. 76240/01) Judgment of 28 June 2007 .....	164–166

<i>Wallova and Walla v Czech Republic</i> (Appl. No. 23848/04) Judgment of 26 October 2006. ....	88
<i>X and Others v Austria</i> (Appl. No. 19010/07) Judgment of 19 February 2013; [2013] ECHR 148. ....	168, 170
<i>X v Croatia</i> (Appl. No. 11223/04) Judgment of 17 July 2008; [2008] ECHR 641. ....	64
<i>X, Y and Z v United Kingdom</i> (Appl. No. 21830/93) Judgment of 22 April 1997; [1997] ECHR 20. ....	143
<i>Zaunegger v Germany</i> (Appl. No. 22028/04) Judgment of 3 December 2009; [2009] ECHR 1982. ....	71

## FRANCE

<i>Enfance et Familles v F et A</i> , Court of Appeal of Riom, 16 December 1997 (1998) JCP II 10147. ....	200
<i>TGI La Roche-sur-Yon</i> (29 July 1993) BICC 1 March 1994, No 302. ....	143

## NETHERLANDS

<i>Valkenhorst II</i> (HR 15 April 1994) NJ 1994. ....	194
--	-----

## NEW ZEALAND

<i>C v S and W</i> (2006) High Court Napier, CIV-2005–441–776. ....	140
---	-----

## SPAIN

Recurso de Casacion num. 2854/1994, Sentencia del TS de 21 septiembre 1999. ....	200
--	-----

## UNITED KINGDOM

<i>A Local Authority v GC</i> [2009] 1 FLR 299. ....	57
<i>Birmingham City Council v S</i> [2006] EWHC 3065 (Fam); [2007] 1 FLR 1223. ....	66
<i>Flintshire County Council v K</i> [2001] 2 FLR 476. ....	81
<i>M (A Minor)</i> [1997] EWCA Civ 2766. ....	41

*Mabon v Mabon* [2005] EWCA Civ 634; [2005] 2 FLR 1011 . . . . . 135, 143, 144  
*R (G) v Nottingham City Council* [2008] EWHC 152 (Admin);  
 [2008] 1 FLR 1660 . . . . . 54  
*R (Thomson) v Minister of State for Children* [2005] EWHC 1378 (Admin) . . . 151  
*Re C (A Child) v XYZ County Council* [2007] EWCA Civ 1206;  
 [2008] 1 FLR 1294 . . . . . 66, 79  
*Re C (Adoption: Legality)* [1999] 1 FLR 370 . . . . . 93, 100, 149  
*Re C (Foreign Adoption: Natural Mother's Consent: Service)* [2006] 1 FLR  
 318 . . . . . 86  
*Re D (Paternity)* [2006] EWHC 3545 (Fam); [2007] 2 FLR 26 . . . . . 74  
*Re E (A Minor) (Wardship: Medical Treatment)* [1993] 1 FLR 386 . . . . . 129  
*Re G (Foreign Adoption: Consent)* [1995] 2 FLR 534 . . . . . 86  
*Re H (Minors) (Local Authority: Parental Rights) (No 3)* [1991] Fam 151 . . . . . 68  
*Re H (Paternity: Blood Test)* [1996] 2 FLR 65 . . . . . 186  
*Re J (Abduction: Children's Objections)* [2011] EWCA Civ 1448;  
 [2012] 1 FLR 457 . . . . . 118  
*Re K (Adoption & Wardship)* [1997] 2 FLR 230 . . . . . 55  
*Re L (An Infant)* (1962) 106 SJ 611, CA . . . . . 109  
*Re M (Adoption or Residence)* [1998] 1 FLR 570 . . . . . 108, 109  
*Re P (Adoption: Unmarried Couple)* [2008] UKHL 38 . . . . . 168  
*Re R (A Minor) (Contact)* [1993] 2 FLR 762 . . . . . 192  
*Re W* [1971] AC 682 . . . . . 108  
*S v S* [1992] 2 FLR 31 . . . . . 129  
*S v S; W v Official Solicitor* [1972] AC 24 . . . . . 75  
*Watson v Nikolaisen* [1955] 2 QB 286 . . . . . 200  
*X and Y (Foreign Surrogacy)* [2008] EWHC 3030 (Fam); [2009]  
 1 FLR 733 . . . . . 55, 94, 97  
*X County Council v C* [2007] EWHC 1771 (Fam) . . . . . 78

UNITED STATES

*GP*, 842 So 2d 1062 (Florida) . . . . . 78  
*In re Baby Girl Clausen* (1993) 442 Mich. 648; 502 NW 2d 649 . . . . . 55  
*US v Focus on Children* US District Court of Utah, Sealed Indictment  
 (2007) <[www.brandeis.edu/investigate/adoption/docs/FOCindictment.pdf](http://www.brandeis.edu/investigate/adoption/docs/FOCindictment.pdf)> [1 February 2013] (Utah) . . . . . 61, 85, 91  
*US v Lauryn Galindo* No CR 03–0187 Z (Washington District Court) . . . . 85, 91