

TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE AND MEMORY IN EUROPE (1945-2013)

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within this Series:

5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), *Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict* (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2
6. Gaby Oré Aguilar and Felipe Gómez Isa (eds.), *Rethinking Transitions. Equality and Social Justice in Societies Emerging from Conflict* (2011), 978-1-78068-003-3
7. Richard Zajac Sannerholm, *Rule of Law after War. Ideologies, Norms and Methods* (2012), 978-1-78068-008-8
8. Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark and Danielle Granville (chief editors), *Critical Perspectives in Transitional Justice* (2011), 978-1-78068-035-4
9. Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (eds.), *International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-conflict States* (2012), 978-1-78068-041-5
10. Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds.), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012), 978-1-78068-044-6
11. Ilse Derluyn, Cindy Mels, Stephan Parmentier and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.), *Re-Member. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation of War-Affected Children* (2012), 978-94-000-0027-4
12. Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and Larissa van den Herik (eds.), *Sexual Violence as an International Crime: Interdisciplinary Approaches* (2012), 978-1-78068-002-6
13. Estelle Zinsstag and Martha Albertson Fineman (eds.), *Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice: From International and Criminal to Alternative Forms of Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-142-9
14. Josep M. Tamarit Sumalla, *Historical Memory and Criminal Justice in Spain. A Case of Late Transitional Justice* (2013), 978-1-78068-143-6
15. Catherine Jenkins (ed.), Max du Plessis (ed.), *Law, Nation building and Transformation The South African experience in perspective* (2014), 978-1-78068-184-9
16. Susanne Buckley-Zistel and Stefanie Schäfer (eds.), *Memorials in Times of Transition* (2014), 978-1-78068-211-2

For previous volume in the series, please visit <http://tj.intersentia.com>

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE, Volume 17

TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE AND
MEMORY IN EUROPE
(1945–2013)

Edited by
Nico WOUTERS



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Transitional Justice and Memory in Europe (1945–2013)
Nico Wouters (ed.)

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaan, title ‘Hurt’, medium Linocut, 1999.
From the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio*,
Article 5, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999.

ISBN 978-1-78068-214-3
D/2014/7849/31
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

CONTENTS

The Use of History in the Field of Transitional Justice: A Critical

Introduction

Nico WOUTERS	1
1. Is history useful?	4
2. The past as a guide for present and future	6
3. Closure and reconciliation: searching for a consensus on the past	10
4. Justice and (historic) truth	17
5. To conclude: how this book approaches history in transitional justice	22

West Germany: A Case of Transitional Justice *avant la lettre*?

Annette WEINKE	25
1. International law and 20 th Century Germany	25
1.1. The “ <i>longue durée</i> ” of the German “struggle to come to terms” ...	25
1.2. “A past that will not go away...” Continuity and rupture after 1945	29
1.3. The legacy of “Leipzig” and “Nuremberg”	32
2. National policies of “ <i>Vergangenheitsbewältigung</i> ”	37
2.1. Aporia of West German “ <i>Vergangenheitsbewältigung</i> ”	37
2.2. Return of the rule of law?	41
3. Justice, history, memory	48
4. Summary	52
Selective further reading	55

Changing Things so Everything Stays the Same: The Impossible “*épuration*” of French Society, 1945–2000

Marc Olivier BARUCH	63
1. The legacy of earlier experiences	63
2. Transitional justice in the making (1943–1947)	64
2.1. Type of preceding regime	64
2.2. Type of transition	66
2.3. Type and duration of key transitional justice period	67

2.3.1.	Before the liberation of mainland France (August 1943– August 1944)	67
2.3.2.	Judicial state-initiated and state-executed measures	68
2.3.3.	Quasi-judicial techniques	70
2.3.4.	Non-judicial	72
2.3.5.	Numbers of punished perpetrators	73
2.4.	Evaluation	74
3.	Transitional justice in the long run, a chronological approach	76
3.1.	1947–1954: A troubled time of changes in TJ policy	77
3.1.1.	Trials	77
3.1.2.	Reconciliation measures	78
3.1.3.	The domestic and international political context	79
3.1.4.	The national impact of international developments in the domain of TJ	80
3.1.5.	The role of academic research and of literary works	81
3.1.6.	Memory eruptions: the public debate	81
3.2.	1954–1970: a time overshadowed by General de Gaulle	82
3.2.1.	The domestic and international political context	82
3.2.2.	The influence of successive generations, the role of academic research, literary works and movies	83
3.2.3.	Memory eruptions: the public debate	85
3.3.	1970–1994: France’s troubled memories	86
3.3.1.	The political context	86
3.3.2.	The role of academic research and culture	87
3.3.3.	Memory eruptions: the public debate	88
3.4.	1995 and after	88
4.	A few words of conclusion	90
	Selective further reading	92

A Consensus of Differences. Transitional Justice and Belgium’s Divided War Memories (1944–2012)

	Nico WOUTERS and Dirk LUYTEN	95
1.	The central phase of transitional justice policies (1944–1951)	95
1.1.	The occupation regime	95
1.2.	Transitional justice measures	97
1.2.1.	Judicial policies: state-initiated and state-executed measures	97
1.2.2.	Judicial innovations	102
1.2.3.	Quasi-judicial techniques	105
2.	Towards mitigation and reintegration of convicted collaborators	107
3.	Policy for victims	113

4.	Long-term processes: on the effects of transitional justice on memory development	115
4.1.	Divided memories and the amnesty debate	115
4.2.	Patriotic memory communities and the Belgian state.	119
4.3.	The memories of war enter a period of transition (1971–1994) . . .	122
4.4.	The global human rights culture: an end to Belgium’s divided memories?	125
4.5.	On memory consensus	128
	Selective further reading.	130

Transitional Justice in the Netherlands after World War II

	Peter ROMIJN and Erik SCHUMACHER.	133
1.	Phase I (before 10 May 1940): pre-war legal framework.	133
2.	Phase II (between 10 May 1940 and 1 January 1952).	134
2.1.	Background.	134
2.2.	New legislation.	136
2.3.	Administration of justice	136
2.3.1.	Minor cases.	138
2.3.2.	Serious cases	140
2.4.	Reintegration	142
2.5.	Purging	143
2.5.1.	Purging in practice.	145
2.5.2.	Purges in the non-government sphere	147
2.6.	Compensation	148
2.7.	Evaluation	150
3.	Phase III (from 1 January 1952).	151
3.1.	Public memory.	151
3.2.	Clemency.	156
3.3.	Reintegration	159
3.4.	Compensation	162
3.5.	Commemorations	165
3.6.	Reconciliation?	167
	Abbreviations	169
	Selective further reading.	170

From Ruptured Transition to Politics of Silence: the Case of Portugal

	Filipa RAIMUNDO and António COSTA PINTO	173
1.	The antecedents: the authoritarian regime	173
2.	The Portuguese way to democracy: a transition by rupture.	176

3.	Transitional justice: trials and purges	178
3.1.	The first phase: transitional justice based on an alleged revolutionary legality (April 1974–December 1975)	178
3.1.1.	The purge of the military, the civil service, and the judiciary	179
3.1.2.	The political police	182
3.1.3.	The economic elites	183
3.2.	The second phase: the establishment of democratic legality (December 1975–1982)	185
3.2.1.	The military trials	185
3.2.2.	The reintegration of perpetrators	187
4.	The post-transitional justice period (1982–)	190
4.1.	The archives	190
4.2.	Reparation measures for victims	191
4.3.	Symbolic reparations	192
4.4.	Remembrance and truth telling	194
5.	Summary and conclusions	196
	Abbreviations	197
	Selective further reading	197

Amnesty and Reparations Without Truth or Justice in Spain

	Paloma AGUILAR and Clara RAMÍREZ-BARAT	199
1.	Historical antecedents of the current transitional justice policies in Spain	200
1.1.	Transitional justice in the pre-Franco period (September 1923–July 1936)	200
1.2.	The Civil War (July 1936–April 1939)	204
1.3.	The Franco regime (July 1939–20 November 1975)	205
2.	Transitional justice policies (1975–2000)	207
2.1.	The legacy of the Franco regime	207
2.2.	The ‘Spanish model’: reparations and amnesty without accountability and truth telling	208
3.	Post-transitional justice policies and memory irruptions (2000–2011) .	213
3.1.	Why has a post-transitional phase taken place in Spain?	214
3.2.	Measures approved from 2002 to 2012	217
3.3.	Judicial initiatives	232
3.4.	Social initiatives	238
4.	Memory and transitional justice in the political culture of the Spaniards	241
5.	Conclusions	247

Abbreviations	253
Selective further reading	254
Official websites and other private resources	257

**Transitional Justice after the Collapse of Dictatorship in Greece
(1974–2000)**

Stefanos KATSIKAS	259
1. Introduction	259
2. The colonels’ regime (1967–1974)	260
3. The first measures towards democratisation: “The Government of National Unity”	263
4. The junta trials	264
4.1. The trial of the instigators of the 21 April 1967 military coup	266
4.2. The verdict of the trial of the instigators of the 21 April 1967 military coup	268
5. The trial over the November 1973 events at the Polytechnic School of Athens	269
5.1. The verdict of the Trial over the November 1973 events at the Polytechnic School	272
6. The trials of the torturers	272
6.1. The verdict of the trials of the torturers	274
7. Incarceration	275
8. Reconciliation in the aftermath of the junta period (1974–1981)	277
9. Reconciliation in the post-junta period (1981–1989)	279
10. 1989 and reconciliation by fire	280
11. Epilogue	281
Abbreviations	286
Selective further reading	286

The Incomplete Transition in Hungary

Renáta UITZ	289
1. Introduction: The “three phases” in the Hungarian context	289
2. Phase 1: Repressions	291
2.1. From Admiral Horthy’s conservative nationalist to the national socialist regime	292
2.2. Establishing the communist regime: 1944–1948	297
2.3. 1949–1956: The years of communist dictatorship	299
2.4. From the suppression of the 1956 revolution to normalisation into the ‘happiest barrack’	300
3. Phase 2: Transitional justice measures	302

3.1.	A prelude to transitional justice measures in 1989: the first effort in doing justice about WWII?	302
3.2.	The legal framework for transitional justice after 1989	304
3.2.1.	Retroactive justice measures punishing perpetrators of past crimes	306
3.2.2.	Rehabilitation laws	308
3.2.3.	The files and activities of the communist Secret Services: Lustration and access to files	309
3.3.	The context of transitional justice measures following 1989	312
4.	Phase 3: Lasting impact.	312
4.1.	Reintegration of perpetrators.	312
4.2.	Measures for victims	313
4.2.1.	Compensation.	313
4.2.2.	Victims' organisations.	316
4.3.3.	A largely unfulfilled promise: access to files	316
4.3.	Remembering: the politics of memory.	320
5.	Conclusions.	323
	Selective further reading.	324

The Polish Paradox: Transition from and to Democracy

	Klaus BACHMANN.	327
1.	Transitional justice in Poland during and after World War II.	327
1.1.	Introduction	327
1.2.	Antecedents.	329
1.3.	The preparation of transitional justice measures	331
1.4.	The scope of justice	333
1.5.	Non-judicial measures and popular purges.	335
1.6.	Reintegration and the impact of demography and reconstruction	337
1.7.	The logic of inclusion.	338
1.8.	Historical policy, historiography and the meaning of collaboration.	339
1.9.	Memory eruptions – the question of anti-Semitism after the war	341
2.	Transitional justice and democratisation during the nineties	342
2.1.	Introduction	342
2.2.	The preparation of transitional justice measures	342
2.3.	Non-judicial measures and popular purges.	344
2.4.	Reintegration and the impact of demography and reconstruction	348

2.5. Memory eruptions and the prevalence of inclusion and the national paradigm	348
2.6. The role of historical and sociological research	349
Abbreviations	349
Selective further reading	350

Comparing Transitional Justice Experiences in Europe

Luc HUYSE	351
1. Same challenges, but different answers?	351
1.1. A devil’s choice: to punish or to let bygones be bygones	352
1.2. Exclusion versus inclusion of perpetrators	353
1.3. Blending <i>Realpolitik</i> and respect for the rule of law	355
1.4. Perpetrator- or victim-centered attention?	357
1.5. To forget or to remember?	358
2. Contextual factors that shaped policies	360
2.1. The preceding regime	360
2.2. Earlier experiences	361
2.3. The type of transition	361
2.4. The international context	361
3. Similarities	363
3.1. A chaotic start	363
3.2. Pragmatic and adaptive decision-making	363
3.3. Perpetrator-centered policies	364
3.4. Selectivity in accountability and reintegration measures, and in reparation policies	364
3.5. Politico-strategic concerns dominated	364
3.6. A long-term process	364
3.6.1. What?	365
3.6.2. Why?	366
3.7. Common challenges	367
3.8. The considerable impact of the outside world	367

Transitional Justice and Memory Development in Europe

Nico WOUTERS	369
1. How to approach transitional justice and memory?	369
2. Can we see a sequenced TJ life cycle?	372
3. What was the impact of the politics of memory?	378
4. What kind of TJ-related issues invoked memory incidents/irruptions?	386
5. What was the role of local memories; civil society agency and memory activism?	396

6. How do we explain shifts in memorial regimes? 401
7. To conclude and summarise 408
About the Authors 413