

GENOCIDAL GENDER AND SEXUAL VIOLENCE

The legacy of the ICTR, Rwanda's ordinary courts
and *gacaca* courts

Usta KAITESI



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7PP
United Kingdom
Tel: +44 1752 202 301
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence. The legacy of the ICTR, Rwanda's ordinary courts and *gacaca* courts
Usta Kaitesi

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: Francisco De Goya (1746-1828), Etching, Plate 52 from 'Los desastres de la guerra'

ISBN 978-1-78068-210-5
D/2014/7849/18
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*To my dearest friend and husband Richard, and to our girls.
Because of your enjoyable love, patience, self-sacrifice, unwavering support
and the smiles you bring.*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The fortunate aspect behind the completion of this study was the opportunity to work with two excellent mentors, Jenny Goldschmidt and Roelof Haveman; your guidance, support and the opportunity to grow academically is sincerely appreciated. I have learnt enormously from your valuable suggestions, perspectives, academic supervision, character and personality; I would not have wished for more. I am also indebted to the reading committee, Professors Rianne Letschert, Cees Flinterman, Titia Loenen and Chrisje Brants.

I would like to express my gratitude to the editors of this work Peter Morris and Klaartje Hoeberechts. The English proofreading and many of your contributions in such a short period I sincerely acknowledge. I wish to appreciate the courage and strength of the survivors whose experiences were deeply relevant, informative and challenging, yet they courageously and unselfishly shared their painful experiences with me – thank you for your heroism.

Over the years of carrying out this research many people have contributed in different ways, by reading the proposal, some chapters, asking and showing interest, encouraging me and being there when the going was tough. I wish to extend special thanks to my friend Anne-Marie De Brouwer for being encouraging and kind-hearted. I am also indebted to Chiseche Mibenge, Brianne McGonigle Leyh, Ettiennne Ruvebana, Alphonse Mulefu, Dianna and Didas. I am also grateful to you Patient and Maryse for being a family away from home and for receiving us warmly at your home.

This research would not have been possible without the support of the National University of Rwanda and the Centre for International Legal Cooperation (CILC) that provided the financial grant for which I am sincerely grateful. Many thanks to Utrecht University, in particular the Netherlands Institute for Human Rights (SIM) and the International Office, for the many services offered during my time in Utrecht. My thanks are also extended to the staff of the SIM documentation centre and of the Rwanda Library Services in Kigali.

I am so much indebted to my family for the values and support through the long education journey. Papa and Mama thank you for believing in formal education despite the fact that history was not in your favour. My sister and brothers your sacrifices were many especially after Papa's passing; thank you for allowing us to be achievers and for fulfilling our parents' dream by the sacrifices provided for our education and for being admirable examples.

I would like to pay special tribute to Richard as we have shared much of the pains of this journey. Your support and sacrifice is very assuring. Thank you for being a gentleman and an unselfish and candid friend. I am short of words to express my gratitude to you and I am blessed that I am sharing my life with you. Last but not least my thanks go to Janviere, Samantha, Stacy and Sianna for being so sweet. Samantha and Stacy, I remember your messages of love and encouragement especially the one on my keyboard reminding me to send something to my teacher. May God bless you all.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 The Research Problem and Research Questions	3
1.3 Research Objectives and the Study Method	9
1.4 Research Originality	11
1.5 Definition of Key Terms	12
1.5.1 Genocide	13
1.5.2 Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence	15
1.5.3 Crimes Against Humanity	18
1.5.4 Serious Violations of Article 3 Common to the Geneva Conventions and of Additional Protocol II	19
2 FRAMEWORK AND OVERVIEW	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 Historical Overview	24
2.2.1 Ethnicity Debates on Rwanda	24
2.2.2 Rwandan History	28
2.2.2.1 An Overview	28
2.2.2.2 Hutu-Tutsi: the Social Class Narrative	29
2.2.2.3 Colonisation: the Invention of Ethnicity	32
2.2.2.4 Ethnicity in the First and Second Republics	36
2.2.2.5 Ethnicity in Rwandan Laws	40
2.2.2.6 Concluding Remarks	43
2.3 Introduction to Theory	43
2.3.1 Overview of Applicable Feminist Theory	43
2.3.2 Introducing Feminist Debates on Genocidal Rape	45
2.4 Introduction to Post-Genocide Legal Responses	47
2.4.1 The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	49
2.4.1.1 The Establishment of the ICTR	50
2.4.1.2 The Structure of the Tribunal	53
2.4.1.3 The Jurisdiction of the ICTR	54
2.4.1.4 ICTR Rules of Procedure and Evidence Relating to Gender and Sexual Violence	56

2.4.2	Rwanda's Ordinary Courts	57
2.4.2.1	The Quest for a Judicial Response	58
2.4.2.2	The Normative Framework.....	60
2.4.2.3	Structure and Functioning of Specialised Chambers.....	60
2.4.2.4	Categorisation.....	62
2.4.2.5	Confession and Guilty Plea	63
2.4.3	<i>Gacaca</i> Courts	64
2.4.3.1	The Establishment of <i>Gacaca</i> Courts	64
2.4.3.2	Objectives of <i>Gacaca</i> Courts	65
2.4.3.3	Structure and Jurisdiction.....	67
3	THE RWANDAN EXPERIENCE: A COMPLEX REALITY	71
3.1	Gendered Genocidal Discourse: A Precursor to Genocide	71
3.2	The Scope and Nature of Gender and Sexual Violence	76
3.3	The Complex Reality as Seen from the Training	80
3.3.1	Introduction, Context and Method of the Training	81
3.3.2	Sharing Genocidal Experiences of Victims	86
3.3.3	The Dilemmas: Reflections and Impressions.....	90
3.3.3.1	The Complex Reality and Challenges on the Legal Platform	90
3.3.3.2	Theoretical Challenges	92
4	FEMINIST THEORY	95
4.1	General Overview of Feminist Theories	96
4.1.1	Liberal Feminists	97
4.1.2	Radical Feminists.....	98
4.1.3	Cultural Feminists	101
4.2	A Feminist's General View on Gender and Sexual Violence	104
4.3	Overview of African Feminism	106
4.4	African Feminism and Gender and Sexual Violence	113
4.5	Gender and Sexual Violence in War and Genocide: A Feminist Debate	116
4.6	Concluding Remarks	122
5	THE LEGACY OF THE ICTR	123
5.1	Introduction	123
5.2	Prosecutor v. Jean Paul Akayesu.....	126
5.2.1	Background	126
5.2.2	The Amended Indictment	128
5.2.3	The Akayesu Trial and Judgment	130
5.2.3.1	Findings on Rape and Sexual Violence.....	132
5.2.3.2	Discussion and Ruling on Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence.....	133
5.2.3.3	Ruling on Rape and Sexual Violence as Crimes against Humanity	135
5.2.4	Analysis of the Akayesu Case	136

5.3	The Prosecutor v. Muhimana	146
5.3.1	Background	146
5.3.2	The Muhimana Indictment	147
5.3.3	Factual and Legal Findings.....	148
5.3.4	Muhimana Case Analysis and Comment	151
5.3.5	Muhimana Concluding Remarks	156
5.4	The Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko <i>et al.</i>	158
5.4.1	Background	158
5.4.2	The Amended Indictment and the Alleged Facts.....	159
5.4.3	Factual and Legal findings.....	160
5.4.4	The Court’s Opinion on Rape as Genocide	161
5.4.5	Analysis of the Nyiramasuhuko Case	163
5.4.5.1	Defective Indictment for Genocidal Gender Rape and Sexual Violence	163
5.4.5.2	Female Perpetrators.....	166
5.4.5.3	Gender Discourse in Nyiramasuhuko’s Defence	169
5.4.5.4	Complexity of Testifying: Witness TA’s Experience	171
5.4.6	Final and Concluding Remarks	174
5.4.6.1	Legacy on Gender and Sexual Violence against Tutsi Men and Boys	175
5.4.6.2	Remarks on the Defect in not Charging Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence.....	180
5.4.6.3	Final Concluding Remarks for Chapter 5.....	181
6	THE LEGACY OF THE ORDINARY COURTS IN RWANDA.....	185
6.1	Introduction.....	185
6.2	Gender and Sexual Violence in the Legislative Narrative.....	190
6.2.1	Rape in the Government’s Draft Organic Law	190
6.2.2	Parliamentary Discourse: Rape vs. Sexual Torture	191
6.3	Prosecuting Rape and Sexual Torture 1996-2008.....	194
6.3.1	Introductory Remarks	194
6.3.2	The Legacy of the Ordinary Courts	196
6.4	Guilty Pleas and their Impact on Rape and Sexual Torture	202
6.5	Conclusion	203
7	THE LEGACY OF THE GACACA COURTS	205
7.1	<i>Gacaca</i> Justice and Gender and Sexual Violence Crimes 2001-2007.....	205
7.1.1	Introduction	205
7.2	The Functioning of the <i>Gacaca</i> Courts: Their Impact on Victims of Gender Violence.....	207
7.2.1	Information Gathering.....	208
7.2.2	Confessions and a Guilty Plea.....	213

7.3	<i>Gacaca</i> Trials.....	219
7.3.1	Why the <i>Gacaca</i> Courts Became Competent to Try Rape and Sexual Torture	221
7.3.2	Introduction to Amendment 13/2008	224
7.3.3	Parliamentary Discussions on Amendment 13/2008	225
7.3.4	Organic Law No. 13/2008 and Regulation No. 16/2008	232
7.3.5	The <i>Gacaca</i> Courts' Adjudication of Rape and Sexual Trials	233
7.3.6	Conclusion	235
8	SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	237
8.1	Summary	237
8.2	Recommendations	242
	Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch).....	245
	Bibliography	255
	Table of Cases.....	269
	Curriculum Vitae.....	271

ABBREVIATIONS

AI	Amnesty International
AU	African Union
ASF	Avocats Sans Frontières
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Court for the Former Yugoslavia
IMT	International Military Tribunal
IMTFE	International Military Tribunal for the Far East
HRW	Human Rights Watch
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
RPF	Rwandese Patriotic Front
PRI	Penal Reform International
MDR	Movement Democratique Republicain
MRND	Movement Revolutionnaire National pour le Development
MINJUST	Ministry of Justice
RTL	Radio-Télévision Libre de Mille Collines
CNLG	Commission Nationale de Lutte contre le Genocide
SNJG	Service Nationale de Jurisdiction <i>Gacaca</i>
UN	United Nations
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNSCR	United Nations Security Council Resolution
UNTS	United Nations Treaty Series
WWII	World War II