

# GENOCIDAL GENDER AND SEXUAL VIOLENCE

The legacy of the ICTR, Rwanda's ordinary courts  
and *gacaca* courts

Usta KAITESI



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*  
NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*  
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinierstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence. The legacy of the ICTR, Rwanda's ordinary courts and *gacaca* courts  
Usta Kaitesi

© 2014 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: Francisco De Goya (1746-1828), Etching, Plate 52 from 'Los desastres de la guerra'

ISBN 978-1-78068-210-5  
D/2014/7849/18  
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*To my dearest friend and husband Richard, and to our girls.  
Because of your enjoyable love, patience, self-sacrifice, unwavering support  
and the smiles you bring.*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The fortunate aspect behind the completion of this study was the opportunity to work with two excellent mentors, Jenny Goldschmidt and Roelof Haveman; your guidance, support and the opportunity to grow academically is sincerely appreciated. I have learnt enormously from your valuable suggestions, perspectives, academic supervision, character and personality; I would not have wished for more. I am also indebted to the reading committee, Professors Rianne Letschert, Cees Flinterman, Titia Loenen and Chrisje Brants.

I would like to express my gratitude to the editors of this work Peter Morris and Klaartje Hoeberechts. The English proofreading and many of your contributions in such a short period I sincerely acknowledge. I wish to appreciate the courage and strength of the survivors whose experiences were deeply relevant, informative and challenging, yet they courageously and unselfishly shared their painful experiences with me – thank you for your heroism.

Over the years of carrying out this research many people have contributed in different ways, by reading the proposal, some chapters, asking and showing interest, encouraging me and being there when the going was tough. I wish to extend special thanks to my friend Anne-Marie De Brouwer for being encouraging and kind-hearted. I am also indebted to Chiseche Mibenge, Brianne McGonigle Leyh, Ettiennne Ruvebana, Alphonse Mulefu, Dianna and Didas. I am also grateful to you Patient and Maryse for being a family away from home and for receiving us warmly at your home.

This research would not have been possible without the support of the National University of Rwanda and the Centre for International Legal Cooperation (CILC) that provided the financial grant for which I am sincerely grateful. Many thanks to Utrecht University, in particular the Netherlands Institute for Human Rights (SIM) and the International Office, for the many services offered during my time in Utrecht. My thanks are also extended to the staff of the SIM documentation centre and of the Rwanda Library Services in Kigali.

I am so much indebted to my family for the values and support through the long education journey. Papa and Mama thank you for believing in formal education despite the fact that history was not in your favour. My sister and brothers your sacrifices were many especially after Papa's passing; thank you for allowing us to be achievers and for fulfilling our parents' dream by the sacrifices provided for our education and for being admirable examples.

I would like to pay special tribute to Richard as we have shared much of the pains of this journey. Your support and sacrifice is very assuring. Thank you for being a gentleman and an unselfish and candid friend. I am short of words to express my gratitude to you and I am blessed that I am sharing my life with you. Last but not least my thanks go to Janviere, Samantha, Stacy and Sianna for being so sweet. Samantha and Stacy, I remember your messages of love and encouragement especially the one on my keyboard reminding me to send something to my teacher. May God bless you all.

# CONTENTS

|   |      |
|---|------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> .....   | vii  |
| <i>Abbreviations</i> .....  | xiii |
| <br>  |      |
| 1 INTRODUCTION .....  | 1    |
| 1.1 Introduction .....  | 1    |
| 1.2 The Research Problem and Research Questions .....   | 3    |
| 1.3 Research Objectives and the Study Method .....  | 9    |
| 1.4 Research Originality .....  | 11   |
| 1.5 Definition of Key Terms .....   | 12   |
| 1.5.1 Genocide .....  | 13   |
| 1.5.2 Genocidal Gender and Sexual Violence .....  | 15   |
| 1.5.3 Crimes Against Humanity .....   | 18   |
| 1.5.4 Serious Violations of Article 3 Common to the Geneva Conventions<br>and of Additional Protocol II ..... | 19   |
| <br>  |      |
| 2 FRAMEWORK AND OVERVIEW .....  | 21   |
| 2.1 Introduction .....  | 21   |
| 2.2 Historical Overview .....   | 24   |
| 2.2.1 Ethnicity Debates on Rwanda .....   | 24   |
| 2.2.2 Rwandan History .....   | 28   |
| 2.2.2.1 An Overview .....   | 28   |
| 2.2.2.2 Hutu-Tutsi: the Social Class Narrative .....  | 29   |
| 2.2.2.3 Colonisation: the Invention of Ethnicity .....  | 32   |
| 2.2.2.4 Ethnicity in the First and Second Republics .....   | 36   |
| 2.2.2.5 Ethnicity in Rwandan Laws .....   | 40   |
| 2.2.2.6 Concluding Remarks .....  | 43   |
| 2.3 Introduction to Theory .....  | 43   |
| 2.3.1 Overview of Applicable Feminist Theory .....  | 43   |
| 2.3.2 Introducing Feminist Debates on Genocidal Rape .....  | 45   |
| 2.4 Introduction to Post-Genocide Legal Responses .....   | 47   |
| 2.4.1 The International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda .....  | 49   |
| 2.4.1.1 The Establishment of the ICTR .....   | 50   |
| 2.4.1.2 The Structure of the Tribunal .....   | 53   |
| 2.4.1.3 The Jurisdiction of the ICTR .....  | 54   |
| 2.4.1.4 ICTR Rules of Procedure and Evidence Relating to Gender<br>and Sexual Violence .....                  | 56   |

|         |   |     |
|---------|---|-----|
| 2.4.2   | Rwanda's Ordinary Courts .....  | 57  |
| 2.4.2.1 | The Quest for a Judicial Response .....                                 | 58  |
| 2.4.2.2 | The Normative Framework.....  | 60  |
| 2.4.2.3 | Structure and Functioning of Specialised Chambers.....                  | 60  |
| 2.4.2.4 | Categorisation.....   | 62  |
| 2.4.2.5 | Confession and Guilty Plea .....  | 63  |
| 2.4.3   | <i>Gacaca</i> Courts .....  | 64  |
| 2.4.3.1 | The Establishment of <i>Gacaca</i> Courts .....                         | 64  |
| 2.4.3.2 | Objectives of <i>Gacaca</i> Courts .....                                | 65  |
| 2.4.3.3 | Structure and Jurisdiction.....   | 67  |
| 3       | THE RWANDAN EXPERIENCE: A COMPLEX REALITY .....                         | 71  |
| 3.1     | Gendered Genocidal Discourse: A Precursor to Genocide .....             | 71  |
| 3.2     | The Scope and Nature of Gender and Sexual Violence .....                | 76  |
| 3.3     | The Complex Reality as Seen from the Training .....                     | 80  |
| 3.3.1   | Introduction, Context and Method of the Training .....                  | 81  |
| 3.3.2   | Sharing Genocidal Experiences of Victims .....                          | 86  |
| 3.3.3   | The Dilemmas: Reflections and Impressions.....                          | 90  |
| 3.3.3.1 | The Complex Reality and Challenges on the Legal Platform ....           | 90  |
| 3.3.3.2 | Theoretical Challenges .....  | 92  |
| 4       | FEMINIST THEORY .....   | 95  |
| 4.1     | General Overview of Feminist Theories .....                             | 96  |
| 4.1.1   | Liberal Feminists .....   | 97  |
| 4.1.2   | Radical Feminists.....  | 98  |
| 4.1.3   | Cultural Feminists .....  | 101 |
| 4.2     | A Feminist's General View on Gender and Sexual Violence .....           | 104 |
| 4.3     | Overview of African Feminism .....                                      | 106 |
| 4.4     | African Feminism and Gender and Sexual Violence .....                   | 113 |
| 4.5     | Gender and Sexual Violence in War and Genocide: A Feminist Debate ..... | 116 |
| 4.6     | Concluding Remarks .....  | 122 |
| 5       | THE LEGACY OF THE ICTR .....  | 123 |
| 5.1     | Introduction .....  | 123 |
| 5.2     | Prosecutor v. Jean Paul Akayesu.....                                    | 126 |
| 5.2.1   | Background .....  | 126 |
| 5.2.2   | The Amended Indictment .....  | 128 |
| 5.2.3   | The Akayesu Trial and Judgment .....                                    | 130 |
| 5.2.3.1 | Findings on Rape and Sexual Violence.....                               | 132 |
| 5.2.3.2 | Discussion and Ruling on Genocidal Gender and Sexual<br>Violence.....   | 133 |
| 5.2.3.3 | Ruling on Rape and Sexual Violence as Crimes against<br>Humanity .....  | 135 |
| 5.2.4   | Analysis of the Akayesu Case .....                                      | 136 |

|         |   |     |
|---------|---|-----|
| 5.3     | The Prosecutor v. Muhimana .....  | 146 |
| 5.3.1   | Background .....  | 146 |
| 5.3.2   | The Muhimana Indictment .....   | 147 |
| 5.3.3   | Factual and Legal Findings.....   | 148 |
| 5.3.4   | Muhimana Case Analysis and Comment .....  | 151 |
| 5.3.5   | Muhimana Concluding Remarks .....   | 156 |
| 5.4     | The Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko <i>et al.</i> .....   | 158 |
| 5.4.1   | Background .....  | 158 |
| 5.4.2   | The Amended Indictment and the Alleged Facts.....   | 159 |
| 5.4.3   | Factual and Legal findings.....   | 160 |
| 5.4.4   | The Court’s Opinion on Rape as Genocide .....   | 161 |
| 5.4.5   | Analysis of the Nyiramasuhuko Case .....  | 163 |
| 5.4.5.1 | Defective Indictment for Genocidal Gender Rape and<br>Sexual Violence .....                     | 163 |
| 5.4.5.2 | Female Perpetrators.....  | 166 |
| 5.4.5.3 | Gender Discourse in Nyiramasuhuko’s Defence .....   | 169 |
| 5.4.5.4 | Complexity of Testifying: Witness TA’s Experience .....   | 171 |
| 5.4.6   | Final and Concluding Remarks .....  | 174 |
| 5.4.6.1 | Legacy on Gender and Sexual Violence against Tutsi Men<br>and Boys .....                        | 175 |
| 5.4.6.2 | Remarks on the Defect in not Charging Genocidal Gender<br>and Sexual Violence.....              | 180 |
| 5.4.6.3 | Final Concluding Remarks for Chapter 5.....   | 181 |
| 6       | THE LEGACY OF THE ORDINARY COURTS IN RWANDA.....  | 185 |
| 6.1     | Introduction.....   | 185 |
| 6.2     | Gender and Sexual Violence in the Legislative Narrative.....                                    | 190 |
| 6.2.1   | Rape in the Government’s Draft Organic Law .....  | 190 |
| 6.2.2   | Parliamentary Discourse: Rape vs. Sexual Torture .....  | 191 |
| 6.3     | Prosecuting Rape and Sexual Torture 1996-2008.....  | 194 |
| 6.3.1   | Introductory Remarks .....  | 194 |
| 6.3.2   | The Legacy of the Ordinary Courts .....   | 196 |
| 6.4     | Guilty Pleas and their Impact on Rape and Sexual Torture .....                                  | 202 |
| 6.5     | Conclusion .....  | 203 |
| 7       | THE LEGACY OF THE GACACA COURTS .....   | 205 |
| 7.1     | <i>Gacaca</i> Justice and Gender and Sexual Violence Crimes 2001-2007.....                      | 205 |
| 7.1.1   | Introduction .....  | 205 |
| 7.2     | The Functioning of the <i>Gacaca</i> Courts: Their Impact on Victims of<br>Gender Violence..... | 207 |
| 7.2.1   | Information Gathering.....  | 208 |
| 7.2.2   | Confessions and a Guilty Plea.....  | 213 |



|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 7.3 <i>Gacaca</i> Trials.....   | 219 |
| 7.3.1 Why the <i>Gacaca</i> Courts Became Competent to Try Rape and<br>Sexual Torture ..... | 221 |
| 7.3.2 Introduction to Amendment 13/2008 .....   | 224 |
| 7.3.3 Parliamentary Discussions on Amendment 13/2008 .....                                  | 225 |
| 7.3.4 Organic Law No. 13/2008 and Regulation No. 16/2008 .....                              | 232 |
| 7.3.5 The <i>Gacaca</i> Courts' Adjudication of Rape and Sexual Trials .....                | 233 |
| 7.3.6 Conclusion .....  | 235 |
| <br>  |     |
| 8 SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....  | 237 |
| 8.1 Summary .....   | 237 |
| 8.2 Recommendations .....   | 242 |
| <br>  |     |
| Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch).....  | 245 |
| Bibliography .....  | 255 |
| Table of Cases.....   | 269 |
| Curriculum Vitae.....   | 271 |

## ABBREVIATIONS

|         |  |
|---------|--|
| AI      | Amnesty International                                  |
| AU      | African Union  |
| ASF     | Avocats Sans Frontières                                |
| ICC     | International Criminal Court                           |
| ICTR    | International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda             |
| ICTY    | International Criminal Court for the Former Yugoslavia |
| IMT     | International Military Tribunal                        |
| IMTFE   | International Military Tribunal for the Far East       |
| HRW     | Human Rights Watch                                     |
| OTP     | Office of the Prosecutor                               |
| RPF     | Rwandese Patriotic Front                               |
| PRI     | Penal Reform International                             |
| MDR     | Movement Democratique Republicain                      |
| MRND    | Movement Revolutionnaire National pour le Development  |
| MINJUST | Ministry of Justice                                    |
| RTL     | Radio-Télévision Libre de Mille Collines               |
| CNLG    | Commission Nationale de Lutte contre le Genocide       |
| SNJG    | Service Nationale de Jurisdiction <i>Gacaca</i>        |
| UN      | United Nations   |
| UNGA    | United Nations General Assembly                        |
| UNSCR   | United Nations Security Council Resolution             |
| UNTS    | United Nations Treaty Series                           |
| WWII    | World War II   |