

THE NON-DISCRIMINATION OBLIGATION OF ENERGY NETWORK
OPERATORS: EUROPEAN RULES AND REGULATORY PRACTICE

ENERGY & LAW SERIES

1. *European Energy Law Report I*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
2. *The Regulation of Power Exchanges in Europe*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and François Boisseleau (eds.)
3. *European Energy Law Report II*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
4. *European Energy Law Report III*, Ulf Hammer and Martha M. Roggenkamp (eds.)
5. *European Energy Law Report IV*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
6. *A Functional Legal Design for Reliable Electricity Supply*, Hamilcar P.A. Knops
7. *European Energy Law Report V*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
8. *European Energy and Law Report VI*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
9. *Electricity and Gas Supply Network Unbundling in Germany, Great Britain and the Netherlands and the Law of the European Union: A Comparison*, E. Ehlers
10. *Legal Design of Carbon Capture and Storage – Developments in the Netherlands from an International and EU Perspective*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and E. Woerdman (eds.)
11. *European Energy Law Report VII*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
12. *European Energy Law Report VIII*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
13. *European Energy Law Report IX*, Martha M. Roggenkamp and Ulf Hammer (eds.)
14. *EU Regulation of Cross-Border Carbon capture and Storage*, Marijn Holwerda
15. *The Non-discrimination Obligation of Energy Network Operators; European Rules and Regulatory Practice*, Hannah Kruimer

THE NON-DISCRIMINATION
OBLIGATION OF ENERGY
NETWORK OPERATORS:
EUROPEAN RULES AND
REGULATORY PRACTICE

Hannah KRUIMER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

The Energy & Law Series

The Energy & Law Series is published in parallel with the Dutch series Energie & Recht.

Members of the editorial committee are:

Prof. Dr. Martha M. Roggenkamp, University of Groningen and Simmons & Simmons, Rotterdam
(editor in chief)

Prof. Dr. Kurt Deketelaere, Institute of Environmental and Energy Law, University of Leuven

Prof. Dr. Leigh Hancher, Allen & Overy, Amsterdam and Tilburg University, Tilburg and Council
Member, WRR

Dr. Tom Vanden Borre, Chief Counsellor, Commission for the Regulation of Electricity and Gas
(CREG) and University of Leuven

**The Non-Discrimination Obligation of Energy Network Operators: European Rules
and Regulatory Practice**

Hannah Kruimer

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover photograph © Tungphoto - Dreamstime.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-203-7
D/2014/7849/23
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other
means, without written permission from the publisher.

Voor mijn ouders / for my parents Tetsje en Dick

“Van de maan af gezien, zyn wy allen even groot” /
“Seen from the moon we are all the same size”

Multatuli [Eduard Douwes Dekker] (1820–1887), Dutch writer, civil servant. “Idee 155”
The Oyster and the Eagle: Selected Aphorisms and Parables of Multatuli (1872),
trans. by E.M. Beekman, U of Mass. Press (1974)

PREFACE

I would like to firstly express my gratitude to the organisations that funded my research and made my PhD possible: Nederlandse Vereniging voor EnergieRecht, Gas Transport Services, Energy Delta Institute and National Grid.

Also a convey special thanks to Hans, Martha and Erik who inspired me to take up this research and challenged me throughout. I am grateful for your trust and the room you gave me to independently organise and undertake placements with regulators and network operators across the EU. The latter field research, that covered almost 50% of my PhD research time, enabled me to keep a pragmatic approach with interesting results for the industry too.

I would like to extend my appreciation to those many people that supported me during several industry placements and interviews across National Grid, Ofgem, Gas Transport Services, Gasunie, Tennet, NMa (now ACM), Gasunie Deutschland and Bundesnetzagentur. Working at these businesses enabled me to understand practical implications of the academic issues I was researching, for instance, regarding regulation and competition of network industries. I have used this input in developing practical recommendations relating to my PhD. I would like to give a round of thanks to each colleague, student and contact via the Nederlandse Vereniging voor EnergieRecht that contributed to my research through attending and contributing to the many interactive lectures and workshops I organised during my PhD, or through reviewing early work and articles related to my PhD. I would like to thank my university roommate Marijn in particular. I have very much enjoyed our brainstorm sessions as well as our laughs.

Also many thanks to my friends that have inspired me throughout my PhD years either in PhD related ways or completely unrelated! Thanks so much James – my fiancé – for all your love, help and trust – and for introducing me to scones and the English countryside.

Finally, thank you so much my parents Tetsje en Dick and brothers Anne Dirk and Thijs, who always believed in me. I am sure that my upbringing – in which there was always lots of attention for politics and arts – stimulated me to find my own path and challenge myself. Thank you all so much.

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| <i>Preface</i> | ix |
| Chapter 1. | |
| Introduction and Overview | 1 |
| 1.1 Aim and Relevancy | 1 |
| 1.2 Research Focus, Justification and Methodology | 2 |
| 1.2.1 A Primary Focus on Non-Discrimination Obligations of Transmission Network Operators | 9 |
| 1.2.2 A Review of Both Gas and Electricity Transmission Network Non-Discrimination Obligations | 10 |
| 1.2.3 A Review of the Implementation and Application of Non- Discrimination Obligations in Three Member States | 11 |
| 1.3 Primary Questions and Chapter Overview | 12 |
| Chapter 2. | |
| The Reasons Why Network Operators Have a Non-Discrimination Obligation | 17 |
| 2.1 The Wider Context: the Establishment of the Internal Market | 17 |
| 2.2 The Specific Context: a Free and Real Choice of Energy Supplier for European Consumers | 26 |
| 2.3 The Ability of Network Operators to Discriminate Between Network Users | 31 |
| 2.4 The Incentives of Network Operators to Treat Network Users Differently | 37 |
| 2.4.1 Primary Reason: Vertical Integration | 37 |
| 2.4.2 Strategic Reasons and Abuse | 39 |
| 2.4.3 State Ownership | 39 |
| 2.4.4 Network Related Reasons | 40 |
| 2.4.5 Cost and Risk Considerations | 41 |
| 2.4.6 Required Favourable Treatment of Renewable Energy Producers | 41 |
| 2.5 Summary and Conclusions: a Precondition for a Free and Real Supplier Choice for European Consumers | 42 |

Chapter 3.

The Enforcement and Evolution of Non-Discriminatory Behaviour through European Rules.

| | |
|---|----|
| | 43 |
| 3.1 Directive 90/377/EEC, Directive 90/547/EEC and Directive 91/296/EEC. | 44 |
| 3.2 Directive 96/92 and Directive 98/30 | 46 |
| 3.3 Directive 2003/54 and Directive 2003/55 and Regulation 1228/2003 and Regulation 1775/2005 | 51 |
| 3.4 Directive 2009/72 and Directive 2009/73 and Regulation 714/2009 and Regulation 715/2009 | 55 |
| 3.5 Summary and Conclusions: Discrimination by Network Operators Remains an Issue. | 60 |

Chapter 4.

Approaching Non-Discrimination Obligations under European Law: When Does Different Treatment of Network Users Amount to Unlawful Discrimination?

| | |
|--|----|
| | 65 |
| 4.1 Approaching Non-Discrimination Rules under European Law | 65 |
| 4.2 The Legal Concept of Non-Discrimination and Its Application by the European Court of Justice in the Energy Context | 69 |
| 4.2.1 The Underlying Principle: Equality | 69 |
| 4.2.2 The Importance of Similarity (of Network Users) | 70 |
| 4.2.3 The Scope of the Non-Discrimination Obligation: All Forms, Ways and Network Users | 73 |
| 4.2.4 Justification Possibilities for Network Operators and Proportionality | 75 |
| 4.3 Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations: an Effects-Based Approach. | 79 |

Chapter 5.

Justifying the Effects-Based Approach to the Non-Discrimination Obligation on the Basis of Discrimination Assessments in Similar Sectors

| | |
|---|----|
| | 83 |
| 5.1 The Discrimination Assessment under Competition Law – Article 102. | 84 |
| 5.1.1 An Analysis of the Non-Discrimination Obligation under Article 102. | 84 |
| 5.1.2 The Assessment of Discrimination. | 89 |
| 5.1.3 Conclusions | 95 |

| | | |
|-------|--|-----|
| 5.2 | The Discrimination Assessment under Telecommunications Law | 96 |
| 5.2.1 | An Analysis of Non-Discrimination Obligations in the Telecommunications Context | 97 |
| 5.2.2 | The Assessment of Discrimination. | 100 |
| 5.3 | The Discrimination Assessment under Public Procurement Law. | 105 |
| 5.3.1 | An Analysis of Non-Discrimination Obligations in the Public Procurement Context. | 107 |
| 5.3.2 | The Assessment of Discrimination. | 109 |
| 5.4 | Conclusions and Recommendations: a Sufficient Legal Foundation for an Effects-Based Approach. | 114 |

Chapter 6.

**The Legal Grounds on Which Different Treatment of Network Users
can be Justified and Their Procedural and Substantive Limitations 117**

| | | |
|-----|---|-----|
| 6.1 | Lack of Network Capacity | 118 |
| 6.2 | Financial Security – Creditworthiness. | 124 |
| 6.3 | Public Service Obligations | 126 |
| 6.4 | The Promotion of Renewables | 129 |
| 6.5 | Difficulties with Take-or-Pay Contracts | 133 |
| 6.6 | The Promotion of New Infrastructure | 138 |
| 6.7 | Technical Network Safety Rules | 141 |
| 6.8 | Cost-Reflectivity. | 144 |
| 6.9 | Conclusions and Summary | 146 |

Chapter 7.

**Country Overview: The Application of the Non-Discrimination
Obligation and Justification Rules in Great Britain, the Netherlands
and Germany 151**

| | | |
|---------|--|-----|
| 7.1 | Great Britain | 152 |
| 7.1.1 | Legal Framework and Non-Discrimination Obligations | 152 |
| 7.1.2 | Network Operation and Unbundling. | 153 |
| 7.1.3 | Regulation and Judicial Review | 154 |
| 7.1.4 | Examples of Application by Regulators and Courts | 155 |
| 7.1.4.1 | Effects on Competition | 157 |
| 7.1.4.2 | Effects for Consumers | 158 |
| 7.1.4.3 | Elements of (Dis)similarity: Costs and Risks. | 159 |
| 7.1.4.4 | Proportionality. | 163 |
| 7.1.4.5 | Summary and Conclusions. | 165 |
| 7.2 | The Netherlands. | 166 |
| 7.2.1 | Legal Framework and Non-Discrimination Obligations | 166 |
| 7.2.2 | Network Operation and Unbundling. | 167 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 7.2.3 | Regulation and Judicial Review | 169 |
| 7.2.4 | Examples of Application by Regulators and Courts | 170 |
| 7.2.4.1 | Tariff Differentiation and Effects on Legal Duties | 170 |
| 7.2.4.2 | Justified Differentiation between Network Users regarding Conditions. | 172 |
| 7.2.4.3 | Effects on Competition | 174 |
| 7.2.4.4 | Effects for Consumers | 175 |
| 7.2.4.5 | Proportionality | 177 |
| 7.2.4.6 | Summary and Conclusions. | 179 |
| 7.3 | Germany | 180 |
| 7.3.1 | Legal Framework and Non-Discrimination Obligations | 180 |
| 7.3.2 | Regulation and Judicial Review | 181 |
| 7.3.3 | Regulator and Judicial Review | 182 |
| 7.3.4 | Examples of Application by Regulators and Courts | 183 |
| 7.4 | Summary and Conclusions: Differences and Similarities in Application by Regulators and Courts. | 185 |
| Chapter 8. | | |
| Academic Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations. | | 187 |
| 8.1 | Academic Summary & Conclusions | 187 |
| 8.2 | Recommendations. | 190 |
| <i>Bibliography</i> | | 193 |
| <i>Nederlandse samenvatting</i> | | 201 |
| <i>Curriculum Vitae</i> | | 203 |