

## BILLS OF RIGHTS



# BILLS OF RIGHTS

## A Comparative Perspective

Ronagh J.A. McQUIGG



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58<sup>th</sup> Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinerstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Bills of Rights. A Comparative Perspective  
Ronagh J.A. McQuigg

© 2014 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover illustration: Magna Carta – British Library Cotton MS Augustus II.106

ISBN 978-1-78068-192-4  
D/2014/7849/45  
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

# CONTENTS

<b>Chapter One. Introduction</b> .....	1
1. Approaches to Rights Protection .....	2
2. Chapter Outline .....	6
3. Methodology .....	9
<b>Chapter Two. Constitutional Contexts</b> .....	15
1. New Zealand .....	15
2. United Kingdom .....	18
3. Australian Capital Territory .....	20
3.1. The Constitutional Context at the Federal Level .....	20
3.2. The Australian Capital Territory (Self-Government) Act 1988 ....	25
4. Victoria .....	28
4.1. The Constitution of Victoria .....	28
5. Conclusions .....	30
<b>Chapter Three. The Background to the Enactment of the Bills of Rights</b> ....	31
1. New Zealand .....	31
2. United Kingdom .....	40
3. Australian Capital Territory .....	43
4. Victoria .....	47
5. Conclusions .....	50
<b>Chapter Four. Catalogues of Rights</b> .....	53
1. New Zealand .....	53
2. United Kingdom .....	61
3. Australian Capital Territory .....	71
4. Victoria .....	74
5. Conclusions .....	79

<b>Chapter Five. Operative Provisions</b> .....	81
1. New Zealand .....	81
2. United Kingdom .....	85
3. Australian Capital Territory .....	87
4. Victoria .....	92
5. Conclusions .....	100
<b>Chapter Six. Impact</b> .....	103
1. New Zealand .....	103
1.1. The Early Years of the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act .....	103
1.2. The Interrelationship Between Sections 4, 5 and 6 .....	106
1.3. Remedies .....	110
1.4. After Baigent: Evidence of a More Restrictive Approach? .....	112
1.5. Approaches to the Interpretative Obligation under Section 6 ....	115
1.6. Are Certain Rights Prioritised by the Judiciary? .....	119
1.7. The Impact of Section 7 .....	121
2. United Kingdom .....	127
2.1. The Standard of Review under the Section 6 Duty on Public Authorities to act Compatibly with the Convention Rights .....	127
2.2. Horizontal Effect .....	130
2.3. The Section 3 Interpretative Obligation and Section 4 Declarations of Incompatibility .....	132
2.4. The Impact of Section 19 .....	138
3. Australian Capital Territory .....	141
3.1. The Interrelationship between Sections 28 and 30 .....	141
3.2. The Section 30 Interpretative Obligation .....	142
3.3. Declarations of Incompatibility under Section 32 .....	148
3.4. The Section 40C Obligation on Public Authorities to act Consistently with Human Rights .....	149
3.5. The Impact of Sections 37 and 38 .....	151
4. Victoria .....	152
4.1. Early Judicial Comments on the Approach to be Adopted when Applying the Charter .....	152
4.2. The Section 32 Interpretative Obligation .....	153
4.3. Declarations of Inconsistent Interpretation under Section 36 ....	156
4.4. The Section 38 Duty on Public Authorities to act Compatibly with Human Rights .....	158
4.5. The Impact of Sections 28 and 30 .....	160
5. Conclusions .....	161

<b>Chapter Seven. Reform</b> .....	165
1. New Zealand.....	165
2. United Kingdom .....	170
3. Australian Capital Territory and Victoria .....	179
4. Conclusions.....	186
<b>Chapter Eight. Concluding Observations</b> .....	189
<i>Bibliography</i> .....	197
<i>Table of Statutes</i> .....	205
<i>Table of Cases</i> .....	213
<i>Index</i> .....	217

