

Motive Matters!



Martijn van  
Kogelenberg

# Motive Matters!

An exploration of the notion ‘deliberate breach of contract’  
and its consequences for the application of remedies

Martijn van Kogelenberg

Motive Matters! An exploration of the notion ‘deliberate breach of contract’ and its consequences for the application of remedies

Intersentia Publishing Ltd  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: [mail@intersentia.co.uk](mailto:mail@intersentia.co.uk)

ISBN 978-1-78068-163-4  
D/2013/7849/94  
NUR 822

© 2013 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
[www.intersentia.com](http://www.intersentia.com) | [www.intersentia.co.uk](http://www.intersentia.co.uk)

Cover image © Pertusinas - Dreamstime.com

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photocopy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*Aan mijn ouders  
Aan Marte*

“Through the days of shame that are coming  
Through the nights of wild distress  
Though your promise count for nothing  
You must keep it nonetheless”

Leonard Cohen, ‘Heart With No Companion’

*The author thanks Hilmara Requena for editing the manuscript.*



## CONTENTS

### Chapter 1.

<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1. Research theme .....	1
1.2. Research questions.....	2
1.3. Methodology and justifications for the chosen approach.....	3

### Chapter 2.

<b>'Contract', 'breach of contract' and remedies in contract</b> .....	7
2.1. Introduction.....	7
2.2. The notion of 'contract' .....	8
2.2.1. Preliminary remarks .....	8
2.2.2. A common law approach.....	9
2.2.2.1. English law.....	9
2.2.2.2. US Law.....	10
2.2.3. A continental law approach .....	12
2.2.3.1. French law .....	12
2.2.3.2. German law .....	14
2.2.3.3. Dutch law .....	16
2.2.4. 'Contract' in soft law bodies: PECL, DCFR and PICC.....	17
2.2.5. The Proposal for a Regulation on a Common European Sales Law: the notion of 'contract' .....	19
2.3. Contract, promise and obligation: various theoretical approaches .....	20
2.4. The notion of 'breach of contract' and remedies in contract .....	24
2.4.1. Introductory remarks .....	24
2.4.2. Breach of contract: a common law perspective.....	25
2.4.3. Remedies in contract: a common law perspective.....	26
2.4.3.1. Damages.....	27
2.4.3.2. Actual performance of the contract.....	28
2.4.3.3. Termination .....	29
2.4.4. The notion of 'breach of contract' and remedies in contract: a continental law perspective.....	30

2.4.4.1. French law .....	31
2.4.4.2. German law .....	33
2.4.4.3. Dutch law .....	33
2.5. A <i>curiosum</i> ? CISG, PICC, DCFR, CESL and the notion of fundamental breach.....	35
2.6. Breach of contract anticipated upon by parties: penalty clauses and exclusion clauses.....	39
2.6.1. Penalty clauses and liquidated damages clauses.....	39
2.6.2. Exclusion and limitation clauses.....	41
2.7. Conclusion .....	42
<b>Chapter 3.</b>	
<b>Deliberate breach of contract: a notion to be explored, but not defined.....</b>	<b>45</b>
3.1. Introduction.....	45
3.2. Introducing the concept of deliberate breach.....	46
3.3. Deliberate breach and the distinction between excusable and non-excusable breach.....	49
3.4. The theory of efficient breach: a belief with supporters and opponents .....	53
3.5. Deliberate breach and efficient breach compared: similar but not equal.....	58
3.6. Deliberate breach of contract from a tort law perspective.....	61
3.7. Deliberate breach in empirical legal studies .....	66
3.8. Proving deliberateness? A comparison between deliberate breach and criminal intent.....	68
3.9. Conclusion .....	72
<b>Chapter 4.</b>	
<b>Deliberate breach of contract and its influence in (legal) practice on core remedies in contract: an exploration.....</b>	<b>75</b>
4.1. Introduction.....	75
4.2. Deliberateness and enforced performance.....	77
4.2.1. Introductory remarks .....	77
4.2.2. English law Ia: <i>Raphael v Thames Valley Railway Company</i> .....	78
4.2.3. English law Ib: <i>Co-operative Insurance Society Ltd v Argyll Stores (Holdings) Ltd</i> .....	79
4.2.4. English law IIa: <i>Rankin v Lay</i> .....	83
4.2.5. English law IIb: <i>Celestial Aviation v Paramount Airways</i> .....	83
4.2.6. US law: two case law examples indicating an implicit influence of deliberateness .....	85
4.2.7. French law: the pool case.....	87
4.2.8. German law: the window case.....	88
4.2.9. Dutch law I: limited relevance of deliberateness for a claim for enforced performance.....	88
4.2.10. Dutch law II: <i>NSI Kantoren BV/Ernst &amp; Young Accountants</i> .....	89

4.2.11.	Concluding remarks.....	91
4.3.	Deliberateness and its influence on the validity of penalty clauses and the court's discretion to mitigate or to increase the penalty.....	91
4.3.1.	Introductory remarks .....	91
4.3.2.	English law: <i>Bridge v Campbell Discount Co. Ltd</i> .....	91
4.3.3.	US law: a call for a different approach towards the penalty clause, but on which grounds?.....	92
4.3.4.	French law: the notion of 'dol' and penalty clauses.....	94
4.3.5.	Swiss law: mitigation and motive connected.....	95
4.3.6.	Dutch law: <i>NVB/Helder</i> and the <i>Buck</i> case .....	95
4.3.7.	Concluding remarks.....	96
4.4.	Deliberateness and expectation damages.....	97
4.4.1.	Introductory remarks .....	97
4.4.2.	English law I: <i>Golden Strait Corporation v Nippon Yusen Kubishika Kaisha (The Golden Victory)</i> .....	98
4.4.3.	English law II: <i>Patrick v Russo-British Grain Export Company, Limited</i> .....	100
4.4.4.	US law: a principled "no" on an explicit link between deliberateness and expectation damages .....	101
4.4.5.	French law I: deliberateness and the requirement of foreseeability.....	102
4.4.6.	French law II: the airline case .....	105
4.4.7.	German law .....	107
4.4.8.	Dutch law I: deliberateness in the Civil Code or not?.....	108
4.4.9.	Dutch law II: <i>Vos Logistics/TSN</i> .....	109
4.4.10.	PECL, DCFR and CESL.....	110
4.4.11.	Concluding remarks.....	113
4.5.	Deliberateness and damages for non-pecuniary losses.....	113
4.5.1.	Introductory remarks .....	113
4.5.2.	English law: <i>Ruxley Electronics and Construction Ltd v Forsyth</i> .....	114
4.5.3.	US law: <i>Lutz Farms et al. v. Asgrow Seed Company</i> .....	115
4.5.4.	French law: recapturing the swimming pool case.....	117
4.5.5.	Dutch law: article 6:106 s. 1a Cc; an exceptional provision in the Dutch Civil Code.....	118
4.5.6.	Concluding remarks.....	118
4.6.	Deliberateness and punitive damages.....	119
4.6.1.	Introductory remarks .....	119
4.6.2.	US law I: deliberateness, punitive damages and the issue of contract and tort.....	120
4.6.3.	US law II: <i>Fletcher v. Western National Life Insurance Co.</i> .....	121
4.6.4.	US law III: <i>Seaman's Direct Buying Service Inc. v. Standard Oil Co.</i> .....	124
4.6.5.	Dutch law: <i>Van Rossum/Fortis</i> .....	126
4.6.6.	Concluding remarks.....	127
4.7.	Deliberateness and account of profits.....	128
4.7.1.	Introductory remarks .....	128

4.7.2.	English law I: <i>Surrey County Council and another v Bredero Homes Ltd</i> .....	128
4.7.3.	English law II: <i>Attorney General v Blake (Jonathan Cape Ltd, third party)</i> .....	130
4.7.4.	English law III: <i>Experience Hendrix LLC v PPX Enterprises Inc and another</i> .....	133
4.7.5.	US law I: <i>Earthinfo, Inc v. Hydrosphere Resource Consultants, Inc.</i> .....	134
4.7.6.	US law II: The Restatement (Third) of Restitution and Unjust Enrichment.....	136
4.7.7.	Dutch law: <i>Doerga/Stichting Ymere</i> .....	139
4.7.8.	Concluding remarks.....	141
4.8.	Deliberateness and (partial) termination.....	141
4.8.1.	Introductory remarks .....	141
4.8.2.	US law: deliberateness and material breach; a few case law examples .....	142
4.8.3.	Deliberate breach and termination in a convergent soft law vehicle: the Draft Common Frame of Reference.....	145
4.8.4.	Concluding remarks.....	147
4.9.	Deliberateness and recovering costs for legal representation .....	147
4.9.1.	Introductory remarks .....	147
4.9.2.	US law: <i>James T. Wellman et al. v. Energy Resources Inc.</i> .....	147
4.9.3.	Concluding remarks.....	148
4.10.	An outsider: exclusion clauses limiting liability in a contractual context .....	149
4.10.1.	Introductory remarks .....	149
4.10.2.	English law: <i>Astrazeneca UK Ltd v Albemarle International Corporation</i> .....	149
4.10.3.	US law: <i>William D. Huggins and Dona. G. Huggins v. Marriott Ownership Resorts, Inc.</i> .....	152
4.10.4.	Dutch law: <i>Telfort/Scaramea</i> .....	153
4.10.5.	Concluding remarks.....	155
4.11.	Conclusion .....	156

## Chapter 5.

	<b>A framework for solving cases of deliberate breach: four arguments and six recommendations for adaptations in remedies in contract</b> .....	159
5.1.	Introduction.....	159
5.2.	The moral argument.....	160
5.3.	The systematic argument .....	164
5.4.	The practical argument .....	166
5.5.	The economic argument .....	167
5.6.	Intermezzo: three remarks .....	169
5.7.	Recommendation I: Deliberate breach and actual performance.....	171
5.8.	Recommendation II: Deliberate breach and expectation damages.....	173
5.9.	Recommendation III: Deliberate breach and account of profits .....	174
5.10.	Recommendation IV: Deliberate breach and punitive damages .....	178

5.11. Recommendation V: Deliberate breach and termination.....	179
5.12. Recommendation VI: Deliberate breach and penalty clauses.....	180
5.13. Conclusion: 4 arguments, 6 recommendations; a general approach or case-by-case solutions?.....	181

**Chapter 6.**

**Eight case studies on deliberate breach of contract: the pudding and the eating ..... 183**

6.1. Introduction.....	183
6.2. Case study 1: the double sale case.....	184
6.3. Case study 2: the farmland case.....	187
6.4. Case study 3: the car service case .....	190
6.5. Case study 4: the supermarket case.....	191
6.6. Case study 5: the swimming pool case .....	193
6.7. Case study 6: the airline tickets case .....	196
6.8. Case study 7: the aluminium pipes case.....	197
6.9. Case study 8: the bad faith insurance case.....	198
6.10. Conclusion .....	201

**Chapter 7.**

**Summary ..... 205**

7.1. Principal argument and research questions .....	205
7.2. Deliberate breach of contract: a notion with many faces.....	205
7.3. Deliberate breach of contract in current practice: a denied reality? .....	207
7.4. Deliberateness of the breach, a factor to take into account: why and how?.....	210
7.5. The pudding and the eating: case studies to explore the effects of deliberateness on remedies in contract.....	212

<i>References</i> .....	217
-------------------------	-----

<i>Index</i> .....	237
--------------------	-----

