

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

VOLUME XLII:

**THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNAL
FOR RWANDA
1 JANUARY – 21 OCTOBER 2010**

André KLIP and Steven FREELAND (eds.)

Anzinga LOW (assistant editor)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd.
Sheraton House | Castle Park
Cambridge | CB3 0AX | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 370 170 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Please cite as: ICTR, Judgement and Sentence, *Prosecutor v. Setako*, Case No. ICTR-04-81-T, T. Ch. I, 25 February 2010, Klip/ Freeland, ALC-XLII-157.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals
André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor)
Cover illustration: Nette Rombouts

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.annotatedleadingcases.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-161-0
D/2014/7849/110
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	7
Part 1/ Procedural Matters	
1. Evidentiary Matters/ Witnesses	
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s and the Prosecutor’s Appeals of Decision not to Prosecute Witness BTH for False Testimony, <i>Karemera et al. v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR91.2, A. Ch., 16 February 2010	9
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Patrick Robinson	18
Decision on Joseph Nzirorera’s Motion to Subpoena Paul Rusesabagina, <i>Prosecutor v. Karemera et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44-T, T. Ch. III, 22 February 2010	25
Decision Regarding Ntahobali, Nyiramasuhuko, and Kanyabashi’s Motion to Transmit the Amicus Curiae Report, <i>Prosecutor v. Nyiramasuhuko et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-21-T, T. Ch. II, 4 March 2010 ..	29
Decision on Prosecutor’s Interlocutory Appeal of Decision not to Admit Marcel Gatzinzi’s Statement into Evidence Pursuant to Rule 92bis, <i>Prosecutor v. Nizeyimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55C-AR73.2, A. Ch., 8 March 2011	35
Commentary <i>Maria Kaiafa-Gbandi and Evangelia Sarikaki</i>	43
2. State Cooperation and Undue Delay	
Decision on Defence Motion to Reconsider Prior Trial Chamber Decisions on France’s Cooperation with the Tribunal, <i>Prosecutor v. Nzabonimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-44D-T, T. Ch. III, 4 March 2010	55
Decision on Prosper Mugiraneza’s Fourth Motion to Dismiss Indictment for Violation of Right to Trial without Undue Delay, <i>Prosecutor v. Bizimungu et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-99-50-T, T. Ch. II, 23 June 2010	65
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Emile Francis Short	70
Commentary <i>Marjolein Cupido</i>	72
Commentary <i>Marjolein Cupido</i>	80
3. Relation with Rwanda	
Decision on Aloys Ntabakuze’s Motion for Injunctions against the Government of Rwanda Regarding the Arrest and Investigation of Lead Counsel Peter Erlinder, <i>Prosecutor v. Bagosora et al.</i> , Case No. ICTR-98-41-A, A. Ch., 6 October 2010	89
Commentary <i>Roland Moerland</i>	98
4. Cautioning the Parties	
Decision on Defence Motion to Reconsider Scheduling Order, <i>Prosecutor v. Ndahimana</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-68-T, T. Ch. III, 21 October 2010	107

Separate Opinion of Judge Florence Rita Arrey	113
Commentary <i>Gerard Mols</i>	114
Part 2/ Judgements	
Judgement, <i>Prosecutor v. Muvunyi</i> , Case No. ICTR-00-55A-T, T. Ch. III, 11 February 2010	115
Commentary <i>David Taylor</i>	149
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Setako</i> , Case No. ICTR-04-81-T, T. Ch. I, 25 February 2010	157
Commentary <i>Caroline Fournet</i>	267
Judgement, <i>Nshogoza v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2007-91-A, A. Ch., 15 March 2010	275
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Patrick Robinson	298
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Mehmet Güney	300
Commentary <i>Michele Panzavolta</i>	301
Judgement, <i>Nchamihigo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-63-A, A. Ch., 18 March 2010	323
Joint Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judges Pocar and Liu.	407
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar.	409
Commentary <i>Maria Nybondas</i>	422
Judgement, <i>Bikindi v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-01-72-A, A. Ch., 18 March 2010	427
Commentary <i>Cedric Ryngaert</i>	480
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Munyakazi</i> , Case No. ICTR-97-36A-T, T. Ch. I, 5 July 2010	485
Commentary <i>Yuliya Mik</i>	588
Judgement and Sentence, <i>Prosecutor v. Ntawukulilyayo</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-82-T, T. Ch. III, 3 August 2010.	595
Separate Dissenting Opinion of Judge Akay.	695
Commentary <i>Yannis Naziris</i>	719
Judgement, <i>Rukundo v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-2001-70-A, A. Ch., 20 October 2010.	727
Partially Dissenting Opinion of Judge Pocar	786
Commentary <i>Boris Burghardt</i>	796
Judgement, <i>Kalimanzira v. Prosecutor</i> , Case No. ICTR-05-88-A, A. Ch., 20 October 2010	805
Partially Dissenting and Separate Opinion of Judge Pocar	862
Commentary <i>Jackson Maogoto</i>	882
Index	887
Contributors and Editors	889

PREFACE

This is the forty-second volume in the series 'Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals' and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda (ICTR) handed down in 2010 (to 21 October). It is the thirteenth volume in the series containing decisions of the ICTR. Further volumes on ICTR case law will be published, with the next volume covering decisions in the remainder of 2010 and 2011.

This volume is in its approach and structure similar to previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of all the annotated decisions and judgements, including any separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with previous volumes, the Editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICTR Press and Information Office, and which bears the signatures of the Judges, as only these can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have occasionally discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and any available internet versions.

Although we are only able to include the full text of the decisions by reducing their original format, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is placed in brackets [].

We are very pleased that a number of distinguished international criminal law scholars were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding these decisions, and believe that their contributions will add to the breadth of knowledge and understanding about the work of the ICTR.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions in the ALC volumes are appropriate. In principle, we select all final judgements. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions annotated in this volume are presented in various parts and under different headings.

Part 1, 'Procedural matters', deals with a variety of short but interesting decisions on false testimony, and cooperation with third States and with Rwanda, as well as with a decision concerning cautioning the parties.

Part 2, 'Judgement and Sentencing', contains judgements relating both to contempt procedures, as well as the crimes for which the ICTR was established. It covers by far the largest part of this volume. As mentioned above, judgements are by definition included in this series, because of their importance, both from a factual and legal perspective.

Once again, we gratefully acknowledge the assistance of many people without whom we could not have completed this volume. These include Registrar Bongani Majola of the ICTR and his staff, who offered generous assistance in obtaining all the necessary copies of decisions, our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, and also our Assistant Editor, Anzinga Low, who assisted with the corrections of the text and without whom we would not be able to publish this series. The Netherlands School of Human Rights Research also stimulated our work. Of course, we would again like to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions, and their cooperation throughout the process.

We hope that this volume will contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICTR, and that it will provide access to its decisions to practitioners, academics and students.

We continue to make every effort to maintain the high standard of previous volumes, and the Editors would welcome feedback and suggestions from readers as to how the ALC series can be continuously improved, so as to maximise its value to readers. The ALC is the largest case law series on international criminal jurisprudence in the world, and it is our on-going aim to make it as useful as possible to all persons interested in the work of the various institutions.

We therefore hope that you will find this volume to be a significant addition to your research resources in this ever more important area of international law.

André Klip and Steven Freeland
Maastricht/ Sydney, 2014