

NATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL IDENTITY  
AND EUROPEAN INTEGRATION



NATIONAL CONSTITUTIONAL  
IDENTITY AND EUROPEAN  
INTEGRATION

Alejandro SAIZ ARNAIZ and  
Carina ALCOBERRO LLIVINA (eds.)



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*

NBN International  
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road  
Plymouth, PL6 7PP  
United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331  
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*

International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58<sup>th</sup> Ave Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinerstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nvw.at

*Distribution for other countries:*

Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

National Constitutional Identity and European Integration  
Alejandro Saiz Arnaiz and Carina Alcoberro Llivina (eds.)

© 2013 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover image: Une Fenêtre (Etude pour Les Trois Fenêtres), Delaunay Robert (1885-1941) © Paris, Musée national d'Art moderne – Centre Georges Pompidou, MNAM-CCI, Dist. RMN-Grand Palais / Droits réservés

ISBN 978-1-78068-160-3  
D/2013/7849/58  
NUR 823



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

# CONTENTS

## Introduction

### Why Constitutional Identity Suddenly Matters: A Tale of Brave States, a Mighty Union and the Decline of Sovereignty

ALEJANDRO SAIZ ARNAIZ AND CARINA ALCOBERRO LLIVINA . . . . . 1

1. Part I: the Concept of National Constitutional Identity . . . . . 3
  - 1.1. From Sovereignty to Identity . . . . . 3
  - 1.2. Sketching scope and meaning of the concept. . . . . 8
2. Part II: National Constitutional Identity in the Aftermath of the  
Lisbon Treaty . . . . . 9
3. Part III: National Constitutional Identity in the Jurisprudence of  
European Courts . . . . . 12

## Chapter 1

### Two Different Ideas of Constitutional Identity: Identity of the Constitution v. Identity of the People

JOSÉ LUIS MARTÍ . . . . . 17

1. Introduction . . . . . 17
2. Two Ideas of ‘Constitutional Identity’ . . . . . 19
  - 2.1. The Identity of the Constitution . . . . . 21
  - 2.2. The Identity of the People . . . . . 30
3. Conclusion . . . . . 35

## Chapter 2

### Methods of Identification of National Constitutional Identity

CONSTANCE GREWE . . . . . 37

1. Introduction . . . . . 37
2. The Typology of Constitutional Amendments . . . . . 40
  - 2.1. The substantial conception of the revision . . . . . 40
    - 2.1.1. Textual analysis . . . . . 40
    - 2.1.2. Constitutional case-law . . . . . 41
  - 2.2. The procedural conception . . . . . 42

2.2.1.	Textual analysis .....	42
2.2.2.	Case-law .....	43
2.3.	The formal conception .....	43
3.	The Introductory Provisions of Constitutions .....	44
3.1.	The content of the ‘introductory part’ .....	45
3.1.1.	Institutional or ‘sovereignist’ content .....	45
3.1.2.	Constitutionalist or substantive content .....	45
3.2.	The preferences highlighted in the <i>Introductions</i> .....	46
3.2.1.	Textual analysis .....	46
3.2.2.	Case-law .....	47
4.	Conclusion .....	48

### Chapter 3

#### Sovereignty Lost, Constitutional Identity Regained

ROBERTO TONIATTI .....

1.	Introduction: Ambiguity and Ambivalence in the Process of Supranational Constitutional Integration .....	49
2.	The Waning of Sovereignty .....	54
3.	The Blooming of Identity .....	62
3.1	National identity as constitutional identity .....	63
3.2	Testing the identity clause in court: an ‘invitation to struggle’ ...	68
4.	Final Remarks .....	71

### Chapter 4

#### National Constitutional Identity in European Constitutionalism: Revisiting the Tale of the Emperor’s New Clothes in Spain?

RAFAEL BUSTOS GISBERT .....

1.	Two Sides of the Same Coin: Article 4(2) TEU and the ‘European Clauses’ in National Constitutions .....	75
2.	The Most Important Constitutional Changes Provoked by European Integration: A Brief Overview .....	77
2.1.	Legal system .....	78
2.1.1.	The extra-constitutional logic of the EU legal system ...	78
2.1.2.	The absence of an institution in charge of resolving competence conflicts .....	79
2.2.	The form of government .....	80
2.3.	The allocation of powers .....	82
2.4.	The centralised model of judicial review .....	84
2.5.	The constitutional regulation of the economy .....	85
2.6.	Preliminary title of the Constitution .....	87

3. Is the Spanish Constitution Naked? Are We Witnessing Another Dangerous Case of the Emperor's Clothes? ..... 88

## Chapter 5

### What Lies Behind Article 4(2) TEU?

- GIUSEPPE MARTINICO ..... 93
1. Goals and Structure ..... 93
2. Article 4(2) TEU as the Apex of a Constitutional Crescendo ..... 94
3. The Struggle for τὰξίς ..... 98
4. The Maastricht Treaty as a Turning Point in the Relationship between the ECJ and National Governments ..... 100
5. The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU ..... 103
6. Final Remarks ..... 107

## Chapter 6

### National Identity: Trump Card or Up for Negotiation?

- MONICA CLAES ..... 109
1. Introduction ..... 109
2. The European Discovery of the Concept of 'Constitutional Identity' ... 112
- 2.1. The advent of 'national identity' ..... 115
- 2.2. A new context ..... 118
- 2.3. The embracement of 'constitutional identity' ..... 121
3. 'National and Constitutional Identity' in the Case-Law of the Constitutional Courts ..... 124
- 3.1. National Identity in the case-law of the European Court ..... 130
4. Negotiating National Identity ..... 134
- 4.1. Modalities of the negotiations on national identities ..... 135
5. Conclusions ..... 138

## Chapter 7

### Constitutional Identity and Fundamental Rights: The Intersection between Articles 4(2) TEU and 53 Charter

- AIDA TORRES PÉREZ ..... 141
1. Introduction ..... 141
2. The Substantive Perspective ..... 143
3. The Functional Perspective ..... 145
- 3.1. The primacy of EU law ..... 145
- 3.2. The uniform application of EU law ..... 148
4. The Procedural Perspective ..... 152
5. Concluding Remarks ..... 156

**Chapter 8**

**Criminal Law as an Essential Function of the State: Last Line of Resistance?**

MARIBEL GONZÁLEZ PASCUAL ..... 159

1. Criminal Law, Essential State Functions and National Constitutional Identity ..... 159
2. European Criminal Law: Institutional Framework ..... 165
3. Mutual Recognition of Judgments in Criminal Matters ..... 167
4. Criminal Law as the Last Line of Resistance: Myth or Reality? ..... 170

**Chapter 9**

**The EU's Constitutional Core**

DANIEL SARMIENTO ..... 177

1. The EU's Legal Identity and the Three Normative Ideals ..... 179
2. Channelling Identity through European Citizenship ..... 181
3. The Constitutional Core of EU law: Foundation, Autonomy and Content ..... 184
  - 3.1. Foundation and autonomy ..... 184
  - 3.2. The protected content of the constitutional core ..... 186
    - 3.2.1. Protection of the existence of the statute ..... 187
      - 3.2.1.1. No arbitrary *de iure* deprivation of the statute ..... 188
      - 3.2.1.2. No arbitrary *de facto* deprivation of the statute ..... 189
    - 3.2.2. Protection of the substance of the rights attached to the statute: no strategic/structural restriction of fundamental rights ..... 191
      - 3.2.2.1. Strategic breach ..... 191
      - 3.2.2.2. Structural breach ..... 193
  - 3.3. The constitutional core as a living instrument, and the inspiring force of the three normative ideals ..... 195
4. Response to the Critics ..... 197
  - 4.1. Competence Creep ..... 198
    - 4.1.1. The critique ..... 198
    - 4.1.2. Response ..... 199
  - 4.2. Legitimacy ..... 200
    - 4.2.1. The critique ..... 200
    - 4.2.2. Response ..... 200
  - 4.3. Subsidiarity ..... 202
    - 4.3.1. The critique ..... 202
    - 4.3.2. Response ..... 202



**Chapter 10****The Defence of National Identity by the German Constitutional Court**

CHRISTIAN TOMUSCHAT.....	205
1. An Obsession – or a Serious Concern? .....	205
2. The Jurisprudence of the German Constitutional Court .....	207
2.1. Solange I.....	207
2.2. Solange II .....	208
2.3. The Maastricht Judgment .....	209
2.4. The Banana Market Decision .....	210
2.5. The Lisbon Judgment .....	210
2.6. The Honeywell Decision.....	214
2.7. The Judgment on the <i>Euro Crisis</i> .....	217
3. Concluding Observations .....	218

**Chapter 11****What is not Constitutional Pluralism in the EU: National Constitutional Identity in the German *Lisbon* Judgment**

HÈCTOR LÓPEZ BOFILL.....	221
1. Introduction .....	221
2. The Member State as the ‘Primary Democratic Space’ .....	224
3. The Lisbon Judgment of the German Constitutional Court as a ‘Non Pluralist Constitutional’ Approach .....	226
3.1. Constitutional identity and the eternity clause .....	230
3.2. Citizenship.....	230
3.3. Civil and military monopoly on the use of force and deprivation of liberty in the administration of criminal law....	231
3.4. Revenue and expenditure including external financing .....	233
3.5. Cultural issues such as language and the shaping circumstances concerning family and education .....	234
3.6. Freedom of opinion and press. Freedom of association. The dealing with the profession of faith or ideology .....	235
4. Plural Constitutional Identities before the EU Institutions are not Constitutional Pluralism in the EU .....	237
5. EU Law Primacy versus Constitutional Identity .....	239
6. Final Remarks .....	241

**Chapter 12**

**The Case-law of the Polish, Hungarian and Czech Constitutional Courts on National Identity and the ‘German Model’**

JOËL RIDEAU .....	243
1. The Emergence of the Notion of Constitutional Identity in the Case-law of the Constitutional Courts.....	243
2. The ‘German Model’.....	244
2.1. Solange I and Solange II.....	244
2.2. Maastricht Treaty.....	244
2.2.1. The control of acts of the European institutions .....	245
2.2.2. The Democratic Principle .....	245
2.3. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty .....	246
2.3.1. The defence of the democratic principle .....	246
2.3.2. The principle of attribution of competences and its limits .....	247
2.3.3. The control of the respect of the limits.....	248
2.4. The order of 6 July 2010: concrete implementation of the control.....	249
2.5. The order of 27 October 2011 .....	249
2.6. The decision of 7 September 2011 .....	250
3. The Adoption of the ‘German Model’ by the Polish and Hungarian Constitutional Courts .....	250
3.1. Poland.....	250
3.1.1. The decision on the Accession Treaty.....	251
3.1.2. The European Arrest Warrant .....	251
3.1.3. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty .....	252
3.2. Hungary .....	253
3.2.1. The Decision on the Lisbon Treaty .....	253
3.2.2. Present concerns.....	254
4. The Relative Distancing by the Czech Republic .....	254
4.1. The limits to the transfers of competences .....	255
4.2. Lisbon I.....	255
4.2. Lisbon II .....	256
4.3. The 2012 Decision .....	257
5. The Recognition of National Identity by EU Primary Law .....	258
5.1. National identity – a European notion.....	259
5.2. The convergence of national identity and of constitutional identities .....	259
6. Conclusion .....	260

**Chapter 13****National Identity in Spanish Constitutional Court Case-law**

PABLO PÉREZ TREMPES .....	263
1. Approximations in Defining Concepts and Content. ....	263
1.1. Introduction .....	263
1.2. Traditional Content: Freedom and Democracy.....	264
1.3. Additional Content of National Identity .....	266
1.4. The ‘Guarantee of the State’.....	268
2. The Constitutional Court’s Definition of Identity .....	268
2.1. The formal Framework.....	268
2.2. The case- law content of ‘identity’: Guaranteeing the ‘State’ by safeguarding its sovereignty .....	270

**Chapter 14*****A Huron at the Kirchberg Plateau* or a Few Naive Thoughts on  
Constitutional Identity in the Case-law of the Judge of the European  
Union**

LAURENCE BURGORGUE-LARSEN .....	275
1. Nihil Novi I.....	276
2. Nihil Novi II.....	287

**Chapter 15****National Identity and the European Convention on Human Rights**

LUIS LÓPEZ GUERRA .....	305
1. Relative Absence of a Provision on National Identity in the European Convention on Human Rights. ....	305
2. National Identity and Margin of Appreciation.....	307
3. Some Aspects of National Identity: Politics, Transitional Situations, Traditions and Culture .....	309
3.1. Politics, national identity and electoral regulation.....	310
3.2. Right of property: transitional situations .....	311
3.3. Traditions and culture .....	313
4. Constitutional Identity. A Positive Consideration .....	314
5. Limits to the Relevance of Constitutional Identity .....	315
6. Constitutional Identity as an Aggravating Circumstance?.....	318
7. National Identity in the Absence of a Nation?.....	319
<i>A Brief Author CV</i> .....	323

