

NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS INSTITUTIONS AND
ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS
INSTITUTIONS AND ECONOMIC,
SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

Edited by

Eva BREMS
Gauthier DE BECO
Wouter VANDENHOLE



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
Eva Brems, Gauthier de Beco and Wouter Vandenhoe (editors)

© 2013 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover image: Morgengrauen, Jawlensky Alexej von (1864–1941) © Musée national d'Art moderne – Centre Georges Pompidou, MNAM-CCI, Dist. RMN-Grand Palais / Philippe Migeat

ISBN 978-1-78068-145-0
D/2013/7849/25
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

CONTENTS

Introduction to the Volume

EVA BREMS, GAUTHIER DE BECO and WOUTER VANDENHOLE	1
---	---

The Role of National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Historical, Theoretical and Critical Perspectives

Gauthier DE BECO	7
1. National Human Rights Institutions (NHRIs).....	7
2. Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	12
3. The Role of National Human Rights Institutions in the Promotion and Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	16
3.1. Support for NHRI Engagement in Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	16
3.2. The Contribution of NHRIs to the Implementation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	21
3.3. Factors Encouraging NHRIs to Focus on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	23
4. Conclusion	29

National Human Rights Institutions as Independent Actors in Relation to Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Lone LINDHOLT	33
1. Introduction.....	33
2. Human Rights Actors.....	34
2.1. Definition and Rationale	34
2.2. The Concept of Human Rights Actor.....	35
2.3. Independent Actors.....	36
3. National Human Rights Institutions as Human Rights Actors.....	39
3.1. General Human Rights Instruments	40
3.2. The Paris Principles on National Human Rights Institutions	44
3.3. Other Documents	47
3.3.1. United Nations Handbook	47
3.3.2. Commonwealth Conference	47

3.3.3. Ombudsman and National Institutions Conference	48
3.3.4. UN Handbook on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights for National Institutions	48
4. Framework for the Recognition of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. . .	48
4.1. International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.	49
4.2. Limburg Principles	49
4.3. Maastricht Guidelines.	50
4.4. UN General Comments	51
5. Conclusion: National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.	53

The Bolivian Human Rights Ombudsman and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Thomas PEGRAM	57
1. Introduction	57
2. Fulfilling an ESCR Mandate in Bolivia	58
2.1. The Bolivian <i>Defensoría del Pueblo</i>	59
2.2. Defining an ESCR mandate	60
2.2.1. The parameters of an ESCR mandate	60
2.2.2. Defining an ESCR mandate: the internal challenge	63
2.2.3. Defining an ESCR mandate: the external challenge	64
3. Implementing an ESCR Mandate	66
3.1. Implementation through Legislative and Policy Impact.	66
3.1.1. Policy impact	66
3.1.2. Monitoring legislation	67
3.1.3. Implementation through judicial activism and legal petition.	69
3.2. Implementation through Social Accountability Mobilisation.	71
3.2.1. Coordination with civil society organisations	71
3.2.2. Coordination with the media	73
3.3. The Defensoría and Engagement at the International Level.	74
Conclusion	75
Bibliography	77

The Role of NHRC in Protecting and Promoting the Economic and Social Rights of Vulnerable Groups in India

Justice B.C. PATEL	79
1. Demographic, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural Profile of India. . .	80
2. The Set Up of NHRC-India and Its Mandate	83

2.1.	The Extensive Range of Its Functions.	85
2.2.	Complaint Handling Mechanism.	87
2.3.	<i>Suo Motu</i> Power.	88
2.4.	Powers Relating to Inquiries.	88
2.5.	Powers of Investigation.	89
2.6.	Broad Autonomy.	89
2.7.	Specialised Staff.	89
2.8.	Core and Expert Groups.	90
2.9.	Appointment of Special Rapporteurs.	90
2.10.	Holding of Camp Sitzings.	90
2.11.	Creating a Culture of Human Rights.	91
3.	The Protection and Promotion of the Social and Economic Rights of Vulnerable Groups.	92
3.1.	The Right to Health.	92
3.1.1.	Access to health care.	93
3.1.2.	Nutrition.	93
3.1.3.	Public hearings on the right to health care.	94
3.1.4.	Mental health.	95
3.1.5.	Silicosis.	95
3.1.6.	Issue of endosulfan.	96
3.2.	The Right to Food.	97
3.2.1.	Starvation deaths in Odisha.	98
3.2.2.	Human rights awareness and facilitating the assessment and enforcement of the human rights programme in 28 selected districts of India.	99
3.3.	The Right to Education.	99
3.4.	The Rights of Children.	100
3.5.	The Rights of Women.	101
3.6.	The Rights of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Vulnerable Groups.	102
3.7.	The Rights of Minorities.	104
4.	Conclusion.	104

**The Monitoring Role of the Ghana Commission on Human Rights
and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ) in the Protection of Economic,
Social and Cultural Rights**

Kofi QUASHIGAH. 107

1.	Introduction.	107
2.	The 1992 Constitutional Provisions.	108
2.1.	The CHRAJ as a National Human Rights Institution.	109
2.2.	The Role of CHRAJ in Relation to the State's Duties in Respect of Economic and Social Rights.	110

3. The CHRAJ’s Concept of Monitoring	111
3.1. Monitoring Approaches and Methodologies	112
3.2. The Importance of NHRIs in Monitoring.....	113
3.3. The Need for Monitoring.....	113
3.4. Judicial Attitude in Ghana Towards Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	114
3.5. Collaboration with NGOs in the Monitoring Exercise.....	117
4. The CHRAJ’s Thematic Areas for Monitoring	118
4.1. Monitoring Goals	118
4.2. Examples of Specific Thematic Research Processes	118
4.2.1. Child rights	119
4.2.2. The right to basic education.....	119
4.2.3. The right to health.....	119
4.3. A Case Study of an Investigation into Mining and Its Effects on Affected Communities	119
5. The Initiated Review of the Monitoring Process	122
5.1. Examples of the Benefits of the Tracking System.....	123
5.1.1. Prisons monitoring.....	123
5.1.2. <i>Trokosi</i> monitoring	123
5.2. The Future Importance of Monitoring in the Ghanaian System....	124
6. Conclusion	124

National Human Rights Institutions and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: An Examination of the Mandate and Practice of the Ethiopian Human Rights Commission

Mohammed ABDO	127
1. Introduction	127
2. The Establishment of the Commission	128
3. Structure of the Commission	129
4. Mandate and Power of the Commission	130
5. Mandate of the Commission over Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	132
6. Review of the Practice of the Commission in Enforcing Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	133
6.1. Promotion of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	133
6.2. Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	137
7. Assessment of the Practice of the Commission Regarding Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	141
8. Concluding Remarks.....	146

Equal Treatment, an Effective Mechanism to Protect Human Rights in the Netherlands?

Laurien J.L. KOSTER	149
1. Introduction	149
2. The Equal Treatment Commission and Its Legal Mandate	150
3. The Right to Work: Article 6 of the ICESCR	152
3.1. Scope	152
3.2. ETC Case Law in the Field of Recruitment and Selection	152
3.3. The Use of Other Instruments	153
4. The Right to the Enjoyment of Just and Favourable Conditions of Work: Article 7 ICESCR	154
4.1. ETC Case Law Regarding Terms of Employment and Working Conditions	154
4.2. Use of Other Instruments: Investigation and Research	155
4.2.1. Unequal pay	156
4.2.2. Pregnancy	157
4.2.3. Work environment	158
4.3. Analysis and Conclusions: Relative and Absolute Standards	158
5. Article 11 ICESCR: An Adequate Standard of Living	160
5.1. Introduction	160
5.2. Housing	160
6. The Right to Health: Article 12 ICESCR	161
7. The Right to Education: Article 13 ICESCR	162
8. Concluding Remarks	165

Anti-Discrimination Legislation and the Role of an Equality body in the Promotion of Economic and Social Rights

Jozef DE WITTE	167
1. The Centre for Equal Opportunities and Opposition to Racism	167
2. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	170
3. Non-Discrimination Legislation	171
4. The Role of the Centre when Economic and Social Rights are Violated ..	173
4.1. The Right to Work	174
4.2. The Right to Housing	174
4.3. The Right to Health Care	175
4.4. The Right to Dispose of One's Property	175
4.5. The Right to Social and Leisure Activities	175

4.6. The Right to Participate in Economic and Social Life.....	175
4.7. Difficulties.....	176
5. The Centre’s Other Contributions to the Realisation of Economic and Social Rights.....	177
6. Conclusion	179

**The Role of National Inquiries in the Protection of Social and
Economic Rights**

Brian BURDEKIN	181
1. The United Nations Standards for NHRIs (the ‘Paris Principles’)	182
2. National Inquiries	184
3. The Australian National Inquiry on Mental Illness.....	186