

FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

The General Editors of the Series are:

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (University of South Africa)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

Published titles within the series:

1. Stephen Peté and Max Du Plessis, *Repairing the Past? International Perspectives on Reparations for Gross Human Rights Abuses* (2007), 978-90-5095-492-1
2. Laura Stovel, *Long Road Home, Building Reconciliation and Trust in Post-War Sierra Leone* (2010), 978-94-000-0028-5
3. Andy Aitchison, *Making the Transition. International Intervention, State-Building and Criminal Justice Reform in Bosnia and Herzegovina* (2011), 978-94-000-0140-4
4. Stef Vandeginste, *Stones left unturned. Law and Transitional Justice in Burundi* (2010), 978-94-000-0115-2
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), *Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict* (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2
6. Gaby Oré Aguilar and Felipe Gómez Isa (eds.), *Rethinking Transitions. Equality and Social Justice in Societies Emerging from Conflict* (2011), 978-1-78068-003-3
7. Richard Zajac Sannerholm, *Rule of Law after War. Ideologies, Norms and Methods* (2012), 978-1-78068-008-8
8. Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark and Danielle Granville (chief editors), *Critical Perspectives in Transitional Justice* (2011), 978-1-78068-035-4
9. Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (eds.), *International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-conflict States* (2012), 978-1-78068-041-5
10. Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren (eds.), *Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts* (2012), 978-1-78068-044-6
11. Ilse Derluyn, Cindy Mels, Stephan Parmentier and Wouter Vandenhole (eds.), *Re-Member. Rehabilitation, Reintegration and Reconciliation of War-Affected Children* (2012), 978-94-000-0027-4
12. Anne-Marie de Brouwer, Charlotte Ku, Renée Römkens and Larissa van den Herik (eds.), *Sexual Violence as an International Crime: Interdisciplinary Approaches* (2012), 978-1-78068-002-6

FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES ON
TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

From International and Criminal
to Alternative Forms of Justice

Edited by

Martha Albertson FINEMAN
Estelle ZINSSTAG



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:

NBN International
Airport Business Centre, 10 Thornbury Road
Plymouth, PL6 7 PP
United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1752 202 301 | Fax: +44 1752 202 331
Email: orders@nbninternational.com

Distribution for the USA and Canada:

International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:

Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nwv.at

Distribution for other countries:

Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice. From International and Criminal to
Alternative Forms of Justice
Martha Albertson Fineman and Estelle Zinsstag (eds.)

© 2013 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaen, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999. From
the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio, Article 5*,
published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999

ISBN 978-1-78068-142-9
D/2013/7849/19
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

To the memory of Katherine Rorabach
Martha

To Georges and Georgios
Estelle

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are indebted to the editor of the transitional justice book series, Stephan Parmentier, and his colleagues Jeremy Sarkin and Elmar Weitekamp at Intersentia. Their initial interest in this project and encouragement as it progressed made this collection possible. We are also grateful for the wonderful contributions of our authors and appreciate the patience they displayed when the project took longer to complete than originally anticipated. Melanie Mendenhall deserves a special thank you for her attention to detail and wonderful editorial assistance in getting the book ready for publication. Finally, we both are consistently grateful for and enriched by the support and encouragement of our respective families and friends.

CONTENTS

Acknowledgmentsvii

Introduction: Feminist Perspectives on Transitional Justice

Martha Albertson FINEMAN and Estelle ZINSSTAG 1

PART 1

FEMINIST PERSPECTIVES IN CONTEXTS

Introduction 9

Chapter 1

International Law and Domestic Gender Justice, or Why Case Studies Matter

Catherine O'ROURKE 11

1. Introduction 11
2. Feminist critiques of international criminal law 13
 - 2.1. ICL as legally deficient. 15
 - 2.2. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women 17
 - 2.3. ICL as silencing individual women and more radical feminist critiques 19
 - 2.4. Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist. 20
3. A 'Boomerang Pattern'? 22
4. International law, local gender justice? The case of Chile 25
 - 4.1. Women, gender and transitional justice in a pacte d transition 25
 - 4.2. ICL as legally deficient. 30
 - 4.2.1. Truth, phase 1, the Chilean National Truth and Reconciliation Commission 30
 - 4.2.2. Truth, phase 2, the National Commission on Political Imprisonment and Torture. 32
 - 4.3. ICL as sexualising and infantilising women 33
 - 4.3.1. Sexual violence as women's exclusive experience of conflict and repression, obscuring other harms suffered by women, such as socioeconomic harms or the loss of a family member. 33

4.3.2.	Focus on sexual violence establishing exclusionary categories of ‘ideal’ female victimhood that reinforce the restrictive regulation of female sexuality.	34
4.3.3.	Focus on women’s sexual victimhood marginalising women as agents of political change	36
4.4.	ICL as silencing individual women victims and more radical feminist critiques	37
4.4.1.	Silencing of individual women victims	37
4.4.2.	Engagement with international criminal law as silencing more radical feminist critique	38
4.5.	Feminist engagement with ICL as hegemonic and imperialist.	38
4.5.1.	The hazards of governance feminism	38
4.5.2.	Feminism and the imperialist mission of international law	40
5.	Conclusion	41

Chapter 2

Advancing a Feminist Analysis of Transitional Justice

	Fionnuala Ní AOLÁIN	43
1.	A brief history of presence and engagement	45
2.	The limits of law	53
3.	Conclusion	61

Chapter 3

Feminist Perspectives on Extraordinary Justice

	David C. GRAY and Benjamin A. LEVIN.	63
1.	The moral meaning of violence	68
2.	Intersectional identity and dynamic stability	72
3.	Women and extraordinary justice	76
4.	Women at the nexus	84
5.	Conclusion	87

Chapter 4

Intersectionality: A Feminist Theory for Transitional Justice

	Eilish ROONEY.	89
1.	Introduction	90
2.	Travelling modalities.	95
3.	Awkward absences.	97
4.	Negotiating presence.	103
5.	Intersecting transitions.	108
6.	Conclusion	112

PART 2

FEMINIST LEGAL STRATEGIES AND THEIR CONSEQUENCES

Introduction 117

Chapter 5

International Law, Crisis and Feminist Time

Mary H. HANSEL 119

1. Introduction 120

2. The crisis model of international law and humanitarian intervention. 121

 2.1. The nature of the crisis model 122

 2.2. The NATO intervention in Kosovo. 123

 2.3. Conclusion 124

3. The marginalization of women under the crisis model. 124

 3.1. White male heroism in the crisis model. 124

 3.1.1. The centrality of the hero's rescue 125

 3.1.2. The presumed benevolence of the hero. 126

 3.2. The crisis model's effects on women in targeted states 128

 3.2.1. Obscuring the 'international law of everyday life' 128

 3.2.2. Neglecting hardships endured during crisis 129

 3.2.3. Failures to consider women in the aftermath 129

 3.2.4. Conclusion. 130

4. The crisis model's temporal underpinnings 130

 4.1. 'Emergency time' governing the crisis model 131

 4.2. Developing a broader temporal view 133

 4.3. Conclusion 134

5. Feminist temporal approaches to inform international law 134

 5.1. Predominant strains of feminist temporality and applications to the crisis model 135

 5.1.1. Time as regression 135

 5.1.2. Time as redemption 137

 5.1.3. Time as rupture 138

 5.1.4. Time as repetition 140

 5.2. Conclusion 142

6. Conclusion 142

Chapter 6

Justice as Practised by Victims of Conflict: Post-World War II Movements as Sites of Engagement and Knowledge

CHEAH Wui Ling 145

1. Introduction 145
2. The response of international law to conflict-related harms: Evolving approaches 148
 - 2.1. International humanitarian law and international criminal law. . 148
 - 2.2. International human rights law. 150
 - 2.3. The 2005 UN Basic Principles 151
3. The rise and development of post-World War II movements 153
 - 3.1. The Japanese American redress movement. 154
 - 3.2. The Hibakusha movement and the global anti-nuclear movement 157
 - 3.3. The ‘comfort women’ movement. 160
4. Justice as conceptualised by post-World War II movements: Recognition and atonement 163
 - 4.1. Recognising the suffering and rights of victims. 164
 - 4.2. The atonement of wrongdoers 166
5. Conclusion: Learning from victims and justice as practised 168

Chapter 7

The Symbolic and Communicative Function of International Criminal Tribunals

Teresa Godwin PHELPS 171

1. The early ICTR and ICTY trials 175
2. Later ICTY and ICTR trials 180
3. The Special Court for Sierra Leone 181

PART 3

EMERGING ALTERNATIVES WITHIN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

Introduction 187

Chapter 8

Sexual Violence Against Women in Armed Conflicts and Restorative Justice: An Exploratory Analysis

Estelle ZINSSTAG 189

1. Introduction 189
2. Sexual violence against women in armed conflicts 191

3.	Restorative justice and sexual violence	197
4.	The Sierra Leone Truth Commission: A case study	205
5.	Some points of discussion	208
6.	Conclusion	212

Chapter 9

Greensboro and Beyond: Remediating the Structural Sexism in Truth and Reconciliation Processes and Determining the Potential Impact and Benefits of Truth Processes in the United States

	Peggy MAISEL	215
1.	Introduction	215
2.	Feminist critique of human rights and TRC processes	218
3.	The South African TRC	223
	3.1. Brief history of the development of the TRC	224
	3.2. A ‘gender-neutral’ TRC	225
	3.3. Comparison to other TRC processes	232
4.	Greensboro	234
	4.1. Establishing the Greensboro TRC	236
	4.2. The Greensboro mandate	238
	4.3. The Commission process	240
	4.4. The final report, recommendations, and impact in Greensboro ..	244
5.	Beyond Greensboro	247
6.	Conclusion	253

Chapter 10

Exclusion of Women in Post-Conflict Peace Processes: Transitional Justice in Northern Uganda

	Joseph WASONGA	255
1.	Introduction	255
2.	Historical perspective of the conflict in northern Uganda	256
3.	Transitional justice initiatives	260
4.	Place of women in transitional justice in northern Uganda	268
5.	Conclusion	273

Chapter 11

Shifting Paradigms for State Intervention: Gender-Based Violence in Cuba

	Deborah M. WEISSMAN	275
1.	Introduction	275
2.	Cuba in the international: Human rights as political opportunity structures	276

3.	Objective and subjective elements of gender equality as framework . . .	278
4.	Specific approaches to domestic violence.	280
4.1.	Definitions and determinants	280
4.2.	Cuban responses to domestic violence.	281
4.2.1.	Research and policy initiatives.	282
4.2.2.	Controlling domestic violence through participatory mechanisms.	283
4.3.	Legal responses.	284
5.	Conclusion	286

PART 4
CASE STUDIES

Introduction	291
-------------------------------	------------

Chapter 12
Beauty and the Beast: Gender Integration and the Police in Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina

Lisa R. MUFTIĆ and Azra RAŠIĆ	293
1. Introduction	293
2. Police reformation in Bosnia	294
3. Gender integration as part of the police reformation process	295
3.1. Recruitment and training.	296
3.2. Promotion	296
3.3. Working conditions.	297
3.4. Maternity leave.	297
3.5. Police misconduct	298
4. Research questions.	298
5. Methods.	299
6. Female Bosnian national police officers.	300
7. Conclusion	306
8. Limitations & future studies	308

Chapter 13
The Parallel Processes of Law and Social Change: Gender Violence and Work in the United States and South Africa

Julie GOLDSCHIED.	311
1. Introduction	311
2. Context	312
2.1. Prevalence of abuse	312
2.2. Women’s labor market participation	314

3.	Reform efforts and critiques	316
4.	Gender violence and work	320
5.	South Africa’s potential for legal responses	324
6.	Implications for reform.	326
6.1.	Limits of litigation and employment law responses	326
6.2.	Challenges of implementation, enforcement and training	327
6.3.	Gender violence in a socio-political context	328
6.4.	Broad-based commitments and difficult conversations	329
7.	Conclusion	331

Chapter 14

Neoliberalism’s Impact on Women: A Case Study in Creating Supply and Demand for Human Trafficking

	Dina Francesca HAYNES	333
1.	Arizona market in context	334
1.1.	Post-war Bosnia and Herzegovina	335
1.2.	The first myth: achieving ethnic harmony through market forces	336
1.3.	Human trafficking at Arizona market	339
1.4.	The second myth: the actors on the ground during war should also be making economic development decisions	342
1.5.	Politico-socio-economic engineering: the story of Brčko and its relationship to Arizona market	344
2.	The impact of neoliberalism’s market liberalization practices on women	348
3.	Conclusion	353
	<i>About the Authors</i>	357

