

**ANNOTATED LEADING CASES OF
INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIBUNALS**

**VOLUME XLI:
THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT
2009**

**André KLIP and Steven FREELAND (eds.)
Anzinga LOW (assistant editor)**

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinierstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Please cite as: ICC, Decision on “Joseph Nzirorera’s Appeal from refusal to investigate [a] prosecution witness for false testimony” and on Motion for Oral Arguments, *Prosecutor v. Karemera, Ndirumpatse and Nzirorera*, Case No. ICTR-98-44-AR.91, A. Ch., 22 January 2009, Klip/ Freeland, ALC-XLI-9.

Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals
André Klip and Steven Freeland (eds.); Anzinga Low (assistant editor)
Cover illustration: Hans Der Kinderen

© 2014 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.annotatedleadingcases.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-138-2
D/2014/7849/1
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents	5
Preface	9
Part 1/ Preliminary matters	
1. Warrant of arrest, summons to appear and charges	
Decision on the Prosecution’s Application for a Warrant of Arrest against Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir, <i>Prosecutor v. Al Bashir</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-01/09, P.T. Ch. I, 4 March 2009	11
Separate and Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Anita Ušacka	61
Summons to appear for Bahr Idriss Abu Garda, <i>Prosecutor v. Abu Garda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 7 May 2009	87
Decision on the Filing of a Summary of the Charges by the Prosecutor, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 21 October 2009	93
Commentary <i>Léa Kulinowski</i>	104
2. Admissibility challenge	
Decision on the admissibility of the case under article 19(1) of the Statute, <i>Prosecutor v. Kony et al.</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04-01/05, P.T. Ch. II, 10 March 2009	119
Reasons for the Oral Decision on the Motion Challenging the Admissibility of the Case (Article 19 of the Statute), <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 16 June 2009	133
Judgment on the appeal of the Defence against the “Decision on the admissibility of the case under article 19 (1) of the Statute” of 10 March 2009, <i>Prosecutor v. Kony et al.</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04-01/05 OA 3, A. Ch., 16 September 2009	153
Judgment on the Appeal of Mr. Germain Katanga against the Oral Decision of Trial Chamber II of 12 June 2009 on the Admissibility of the Case, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07-OA8, A. Ch., 25 September 2009	175
Commentary <i>Sally Longworth</i>	201
3. Pre-trial detention	
Decision on Application for Interim Release, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, P.T. Ch. II, 14 April 2009	213
Decision on the Interim Release of Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo and Convening Hearings with the Kingdom of Belgium, the Republic of Portugal, the Republic of France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Italian Republic, and the Republic of South Africa, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, P.T. Ch. II, 14 August 2009.	225
Commentary <i>Heather Stevenson</i>	244

Part 2/ Procedural matters

4. Victim participation

Judgment on the appeals of the Defence against the decision entitled “Decision on victims’ application for participation a/0010/06, a/0064/06, a/0064/06.....to a/0127/06 of Pre-Trial Chamber II, <i>Prosecutor v. Kony et al.</i> , Case No. ICC-02/04 OA and ICC-02/04-01/05 OA2, A. Ch., 23 February 2009.	249
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Georghios Pikis	259
Decision on the treatment of applications for participation, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 26 February 2009	263
Redacted version of “Decision on ‘indirect victims’, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 8 April 2009	277
“Decision on the request by victims a/0225/06, a/0229/06 and a/0270/07 to express their views and concerns in person and to present evidence during the trial”, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 26 June 2009.	289
Order on the organization of common legal representation of victims, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 22 July 2009	301
Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal against the “Decision on the Interim Release of Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo and Convening Hearings with the Kingdom of Belgium, the Republic of Portugal, the Republic of France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Italian Republic, and the Republic of South Africa”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 2, A. Ch., 3 September 2009	309
Dissenting Opinion of Judge Sang-Hyun Song.	313
Decision on the request by the legal representative of victims a/0001/06..a/0162/07 for admission of the final report of the Panel of Experts on the illegal exploitation of natural resources and other forms of wealth of the Democratic Republic of the Congo as evidence, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 22 September 2009.	317
Grounds for the Decision on the 345 Applications for Participation in the Proceedings Submitted by Victims, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 23 September 2009	327
Partly Dissenting Opinion of Judge Hans-Peter Kaul.	345
Decision on victims’ modalities of participation at the Pre-Trial Stage of the Case, <i>Prosecutor v. Abu Garda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 6 October 2009	347
Reasons for the “Decision on the Participation of Victims in the Appeal against the ‘Decision on the Interim Release of Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo and Convening Hearings with the Kingdom of Belgium, the Republic of Portugal, the Republic of France, the Federal Republic of Germany, the Italian Republic, and the Republic of South Africa’”, <i>Prosecutor v. Bemba</i> , Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08 OA 2, A. Ch., 20 October 2009	355
Commentary <i>Marianna Tonellato</i>	361

5. Disclosure, access to evidence

Reasons for the Oral Decision of 3 February 2009 on the Procedure for the Redaction of Documents Obtained by the Prosecutor Under Article 54(3)(e) of the Statute and Order Instructing the Prosecutor to Submit Documents to the Chamber, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 26 February 2009	397
Decision issuing Annex accompanying Decision lifting the stay of proceedings of 23 January 2009, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 23 March 2009	403
“Decision on the “Prosecution’s Request for Non-Disclosure of the Identity of Twenty-Five Individuals providing <i>Tu Quoque</i> Information” of 5 December 2008”, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 2 June 2009	407
Public Redacted Version of the <i>Decision on the Prosecutor’s Application to Redact Information Falling Under Article 67(2) of the Statute and Rule 77 of the Rules of Procedure and Evidence (Witnesses 6, 83, 102 and 221)</i> of 18 May 2009 (ICC-01/04-01/07-1145-Conf-Exp), <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 18 August 2009	427
Public Redacted Version of the “First Decision on the Prosecution’s Request for Redactions” issued on 14 August 2009, <i>Prosecutor v. Abu Garda</i> , Case No. ICC-02/05-02/09, P.T. Ch. I, 20 August 2009	435
Decision on the prosecution’s request for an order on the disclosure of <i>tu quoque</i> material pursuant to Rule 77, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 2 October 2009	443
Decision on the disclosure of evidentiary material relating to the Prosecutor’s site visit to Bogoro on 28, 29 and 31 March 2009, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 9 October 2009	451
Commentary <i>Cristina Fernandez-Pacheco Estrada</i>	471

6. Presentation and admissibility of evidence

Decision on the admission of material from the “bar table”, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 24 June 2009	485
Decision on the “Prosecution’s Urgent Application to Be Permitted to Present as Incriminating Evidence Transcripts and translations of Videos and Video DRC-OTP-1042-0006 pursuant to Regulation 35 and Request for Redactions (ICC-01/04-01/07-1260)”, <i>Prosecutor v. Katanga and Ngudjolo Chui</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/07, T. Ch. II, 27 July 2009	545
Commentary <i>Steven Becker</i>	554

7. Witnesses

Instructions to the Court’s expert on names and other social conventions in the Democratic Republic of Congo, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 5 June 2009	565
Decision on the Manner of Questioning Witnesses by the Legal Representatives of Victims, <i>Prosecutor v. Lubanga</i> , Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 16 September 2009	571
Commentary <i>Håkan Friman</i>	580

8. Counsel and amicus

Decision on the Request for Withdrawal of Counsel, *Prosecutor v. Bemba*, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, P.T. Ch. II, 17 September 2009 585

Commentary *Adam Wolrich* 590

9. Legal characterization of facts

Decision giving notice to the parties and participants that the legal characterisation of the facts may be subject to change in accordance with Regulation 55(2) of the Regulations of the Court, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 14 July 2009 593

Minority opinion on the “Decision giving notice to the parties and participants that the legal characterisation of facts may be subject to change in accordance with Regulation 55(2) of the Regulations of the Court” of 17 July 2009, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06-2054, T. Ch. I, 17 July 2009 603

Clarification and further guidance to parties and participants in relation to the “Decision giving notice to the parties and participants that the legal characterization of the facts may be subject to change in accordance with Regulation 55(2) of the Regulations of the Court”, *Prosecutor v. Lubanga*, Case No. ICC-01/04-01/06, T. Ch. I, 27 August 2009..... 615

Commentary *Menno Dolman* 621

Part 3/ Confirmation stage

10. Confirmation decision

Decision Pursuant to Article 61(7)(a) and (b) of the Rome Statute on the Charges of the Prosecutor Against Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo, *Prosecutor v. Bemba*, Case No. ICC-01/05-01/08, P.T. Ch. II, 15 June 2009..... 629

Commentary *Alexandra Popov* 722

Index 729

Contributors and Editors 733

PREFACE

This is the forty-first volume in the series 'Annotated Leading Cases of International Criminal Tribunals' (ALC) and contains the most important decisions of the International Criminal Court (ICC) for the period from 16 February 2009 to 1 November 2009. It is the fourth volume containing decisions from the ICC, but still deals with decisions that characterise the relatively early judicial phase of that institution.

This volume is in its approach and structure similar to the previous volumes. Thus, the book contains the full text of each of the annotated decisions, *corrigendum*, and judgments, including any separate, concurring and dissenting opinions, as well as annexes to the decisions. As with the previous volumes, the Co-Editors have ensured that the decisions are fully identical to the *written* original text, as issued by the ICC Press and Information Office, and which bears the signatures of the judges, as only these can be considered as authoritative versions. In the course of our editorial work on this and previous volumes, we have discovered inconsistencies between the written original version of the decision and the any available internet versions.

Although we are only able to include the full text of the decisions by reducing their original format, we wanted the reader to be able to identify the page number of the original text, which is placed in brackets [] throughout the text.

We are very pleased that a number of distinguished international criminal law scholars were prepared to write interesting and stimulating commentaries regarding these decisions, and believe that their contributions will add to the breadth of knowledge and understanding about the work of the ICC.

A few words regarding the selection of decisions included in the ALC volumes are appropriate. In principle, we select all final judgments. In addition, we publish decisions taken at any stage of the procedure that are important for other reasons: because they deal with a specific legal question, because they are representative of a specific type of decision, or because they enter new legal waters. As a result, we may not publish decisions in which issues have been decided in a way similar or identical to a decision that has already been selected.

The decisions annotated in this volume are presented in various parts and under different headings:

Part 1, 'Preliminary matters', contains decisions relating to warrants of arrest, summons to appear, charges, challenges to admissibility, and pre-trial detention.

Part 2, 'Procedural matters', contains decisions relating to the participation of victims, disclosure and access to evidence, presentation and admissibility of evidence, witness-related matters, and counsel and *amicus*.

Part 3, 'Confirmation stage', contains one lengthy decision relating to the confirmation of charges against Jean-Pierre Bemba Gombo.

Once again, we gratefully acknowledge the assistance of many people without whom we could not have completed this volume. These include the Press and Information Office of the ICC, which offered generous assistance in obtaining the hard copies of decisions, our publisher Intersentia, in particular Hans Kluwer, Tom Scheirs and Isabelle van Dongen, and the assistant-editor Anzinga Low, who assisted with the coordination of all aspects of this volume. Of course, we would again like to thank the distinguished authors for their commentaries on the decisions, and their cooperation throughout the process.

We sincerely hope that this volume will be of interest to our readers and contribute to the further dissemination of the important work of the ICC, as well as providing stimulation and assistance to practitioners, academics and students.

We have made every effort to maintain the high standard of previous volumes, and the Co-Editors would welcome feedback and suggestions from readers as to how the ALC series can be continuously improved, so as to maximise its value to readers. The ALC is the largest case law series on international criminal

jurisprudence in the world, and it is our on-going aim to make it as useful as possible to all persons interested in the work of the various institutions.

We therefore hope that you will find this volume to be a significant addition to your research resources in this ever more important area of international law.

André Klip and Steven Freeland

Maastricht/ Sydney,

February 2014