

The Human Right to Equal Access to Health Care

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS SERIES, VOLUME 53

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

The Human Right to Equal Access to Health Care

Maite San Giorgi

Intersentia Ltd
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
mail@intersentia.co.uk

This book has been defended at Erasmus University Rotterdam on 31 May 2012.

Maite San Giorgi
The Human Right to Equal Access to Health Care

Cover illustration: One of the illustrations made by the Brazilian artist Otavio Roth of the 30 articles of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights for the United Nations. © Isabel Roth and Ana Roth

Typesetting: Xavier Mario San Giorgi

ISBN 978-1-78068-081-1

© 2012 Maite San Giorgi/Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo print, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

*In memory of my father
to Jan Willem
with love*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Conducting this research has been an interesting and challenging project. I considered it a window of opportunity to deepen my knowledge about the human right to equal access to health care. Moreover, during the many solitary hours spent on writing a PhD on a topic that was quite new to me as a non-jurist, I have learned a lot, also about myself. However, bringing this project to an end could not have been achieved without the help and contribution of many. I am indebted to, and it is my pleasure to thank, all those who have supported me throughout.

To start at the beginning, my supervisors Martin Buijsen and Roel de Lange. Martin, you have given me the opportunity to begin this project by offering me a position as a researcher and lecturer at the institute of Health Policy and Management. Thank you for believing in me. Roel, although you only got involved halfway through, your contribution to this research project has been a truly positive one. I would like to thank you for your kindness, the coffees we had in Utrecht, your support, and helpful comments. I would also like to thank the members of the Reading Committee, Professors Aart Hendriks, Pieter Ippel and Herman Nys for taking an interest in my research and agreeing to read my manuscript.

A word of thanks also goes to all my dear colleagues at the Institute of Health Policy and Management. I enjoyed the uplifting conversations, coffees, lunches and dinners, cheer and laughter I shared with so many of you, and thank you for your support during the difficult times I went through when both my parents fell seriously ill. It is unfortunately impossible to thank you all individually, but I would nevertheless like to thank a few of you specifically: my roommates of the past few years with whom I spent many a pleasant hour: Lieke, Stéphanie and Edith; the *Sectie ZKV* who welcomed me in their midst; and the members of the activity committee with whom I experienced marvellous moments in organizing many different activities. My special gratitude goes to Barbara: Thank you for lending me your ear, for being my sounding board, and for your support. I am very much indebted to you.

During my PhD research I became a member of the School of Human Rights Research and the Working Group on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. This gave me the possibility to meet many interesting and inspiring people and I would like to thank them for getting me involved in the broad field of human rights, which is such an interesting subject of research and debate.

I also wish to thank the student assistants Eveline, Joanna and Martijn who saved me many hours of basic library research, the EUR librarians for their kind

and patient assistance, and Marlon Steine who was willing to conscientiously and patiently correct the English of the final manuscript.

I am both lucky and privileged to have at my side so many wonderful and loving people. Amongst them my family and friends who make my life enjoyable and complete. My dear parents-in-law who I would like to thank for their interest, support and warm enquiries as to the progress of this venture. And my *paranimfen* Charlotte and Marjolein who encouraged me in all possible ways and supported me in completing this project. It is my honour to have you with me during the public defense.

It was difficult to write this thesis about health care while both my parents simultaneously got cancer. I terribly missed my farther when finishing and editing this PhD. Had he still been alive, he would have made such an essential contribution to this difficult work as he did at so many other times in my life.

My dear mother I would like to thank for her love and for convincing me that nothing is impossible. Her unwavering faith in my ability to accomplish this research made me believe in myself. My brother I would like to thank for always being there for me when I need him and for always giving me new perspectives on life. Since we were little we form a great team and so too during the preparation of this book for publication.

More than to anyone else I am indebted to my beloved husband Jan Willem. Words cannot describe how precious you are to me and I have the deepest respect for how you stood by me during the years that I worked on this PhD research. You unconditionally and in good spirit supported and encouraged me, provided me with good advice and cheered me up with your jokes. I can truthfully say that you meticulously read every word of this book. It is a great privilege to have you in my life.

Maite San Giorgi

March 2012

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|----------|
| List of Abbreviations | xiii |
| PART A | |
| GENERAL INTRODUCTION AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK | |
| Chapter I | |
| General Introduction | 3 |
| 1 Introduction and Statement of the Problem | 3 |
| 2 Research Objective, Research Questions and Structure of the Present Study | 5 |
| 3 Method of Analysis | 7 |
| Chapter II | |
| The Right to Health and the Right to Health Care in Human Right Law | 9 |
| 1 Introduction | 9 |
| 2 The Right to Health in International and Regional Human Rights Law | 10 |
| 2.1 Introduction | 10 |
| 2.2 The Right to Health in International Human Rights Law | 10 |
| 2.3 The Right to Health in Regional Human Rights Law | 13 |
| 3 The Scope, Core content and Overlapping Elements of the Right to Health | 14 |
| 3.1 Introduction | 14 |
| 3.2 The Scope of the Right to Health | 15 |
| 3.3 The Core Content of the Right to Health | 16 |
| 3.4 The Overlapping Elements of the Right to Health | 18 |
| 4 The Core Content and Scope of the Right to Health Care within the Broad Framework of the Right to Health | 19 |
| 4.1 Introduction | 19 |
| 4.2 The Scope of the Right to Health Care | 20 |
| 4.2.1 Overview of Scope of the Right to Health Care | 22 |
| 4.3 The Core Content of the Right to Health Care | 25 |
| 4.3.1 Overview of Core Content of the Right to Health Care | 27 |
| | ix |

| | | |
|---|-------------|----|
| 5 | Conclusions | 28 |
|---|-------------|----|

Chapter III

| | |
|--|-----------|
| State Obligations Resulting from the Right to Health Care | 31 |
|--|-----------|

| | | |
|-------|--|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 31 |
| 2 | General Clauses Regulating the Realisation of the Right to Health Care by Member States | 32 |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 32 |
| 2.2 | Progressive Realisation, Immediate Realisation and Realisation to the Maximum of Available Resources | 32 |
| 2.3 | Derogations, Limitations, and Retrogressive Measures | 36 |
| 2.3.1 | Derogations | 36 |
| 2.3.2 | Limitations | 37 |
| 2.3.3 | Retrogressive Measures | 40 |
| 3 | Tripartite Typology of Obligations: the Obligation to Respect, to Protect and to Fulfill | 42 |
| 4 | Tripartite Obligations and the Right to Health Care | 45 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 45 |
| 4.2 | The Obligation to Respect and the Right to Health Care | 45 |
| 4.3 | The Obligation to Protect and the Right to Health Care | 46 |
| 4.4 | The Obligation to Fulfil and the Right to Health Care | 47 |
| 4.5 | Observations on the Application of the Tripartite Typology of State Obligations and the Right to Health Care | 49 |
| 5. | Criteria to Ensure Actually Access to Health Care | 51 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 51 |
| 5.2 | Availability of Health Care | 51 |
| 5.3 | Accessibility of Health Care | 54 |
| 5.3.1 | Non-Discrimination | 54 |
| 5.3.2 | Financial Accessibility | 57 |
| 5.3.3 | Physical Accessibility | 59 |
| 5.4 | Acceptable Health Care of Good Quality | 60 |
| 6 | Conclusions | 61 |

Chapter IV

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Equality, Non-Discrimination and the Right to Equal Access to Health Care as a Human Right | 63 |
|---|-----------|

| | | |
|---|---|----|
| 1 | Introduction | 63 |
| 2 | Recurring Elements of the Rights to Health Care: Equal Access, Equitable Access, and Access on a Non-Discriminatory Basis | 63 |
| 3 | The Principle of Equality: Definition of Concepts | 65 |

| | | |
|-----|--|----|
| 3.1 | Introduction | 65 |
| 3.2 | The Right to Equality: Formal and Substantial Equality | 65 |
| 3.3 | Discrimination, Direct Discrimination and Indirect Discrimination | 66 |
| 3.4 | Positive Measures and Preferential Treatment | 68 |
| 4 | The Right to Equal Access to Health Care; its Components and Definition | 68 |
| 5 | The Legal Framework of the Right to Equal Treatment and Non-Discrimination in Human Rights Law | 70 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 70 |
| 5.2 | The International Legal Framework of the Human Right to Equal Treatment and Non-Discrimination | 71 |
| 5.3 | The Regional Legal Framework of the Human Right to Equal Treatment and Non-Discrimination | 73 |
| 6 | Conclusions | 74 |

PART B

Practice and Discussion of the Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Chapter V

| | | |
|-------|--|-----------|
| | The Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural rights | 79 |
| 1 | Introduction | 79 |
| 2 | The Term Justiciability Defined | 79 |
| 3 | Arguments against the Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 80 |
| 4 | Arguments in Support of the Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 82 |
| 5 | The Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Practice | 85 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 85 |
| 5.2 | The Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at the International Human Rights Level | 85 |
| 5.2.1 | The ICESCR and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 85 |
| 5.2.2 | The ICCPR and the Human Rights Committee | 88 |
| 5.2.3 | The CEDAWCee, CERDCee, CRCee, and the CRPDCee | 89 |
| 5.3 | The Justiciability of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at the Regional Human Rights Level | 90 |
| 5.3.1 | European Committee of Social Rights | 90 |
| 5.3.2 | European Court of Human Rights | 92 |
| 6 | Conclusions | 94 |

| | | |
|--|---|------------|
| Chapter VI | | |
| The Justiciability of The Right to Health Care | | 97 |
| 1 | Introduction | 97 |
| 2 | The Justiciability of the Right to Health Care at the International Human Rights Level: Review by the UN Treaty Based Bodies | 97 |
| 3 | The Justiciability of the Right to Health Care at the Regional Human Rights Level: Review by the European Committee of Social Rights and the European Court of Human Rights | 101 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 101 |
| 3.2 | The Justiciability of the Right to Health Care under the Collective Complaints Procedure at European Committee of Social Rights | 102 |
| 3.3 | The Justiciability of Elements of the Right to Health Care at the European Court of Human rights | 103 |
| 3.3.1 | Article 2 ECHR | 103 |
| 3.3.2 | Article 3 ECHR | 104 |
| 3.3.3 | Article 8 ECHR | 106 |
| 4 | Conclusions | 109 |
| Chapter VII | | |
| The Integrated Approach | | 111 |
| 1 | Introduction | 111 |
| 2 | The Integrated Approach: Definition and Emergence in Human Rights Law | 111 |
| 3 | Normative Explanation of the Integrated Approach | 113 |
| 4 | The Normative Explanations of the Integrated Approach and the Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | 118 |
| 5 | Conclusions | 120 |
| PART C | | |
| The Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | | |
| Chapter VIII | | |
| The Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care at the European Committee of Social Rights | | 125 |
| 1 | Introduction | 125 |
| 2 | The Assessment of Complaints on Unequal Treatment and Discrimination by the European Committee of Social Rights | 125 |

| | | |
|---|---|------------|
| 3 | Case Law of the European Committee of Social Rights on the Right to Equal Access to Health Care under the Collective Complaints Mechanism | 132 |
| 4 | The Case Law of the European Committee of Social Rights and the Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | 137 |
| 5 | Conclusions | 140 |
| Chapter IX | | |
| The Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care at the European Court of Human Rights | | 143 |
| 1 | Introduction | 143 |
| 2 | The Assessment Model under Article 14 ECHR of the European Court of Human Rights | 144 |
| 2.1 | Introduction | 144 |
| 2.2 | The First Phase of the Assessment Model of Article 14 ECHR: General Cases | 145 |
| 2.3 | The First Phase of the Assessment Model of Article 14 ECHR: Cases Dealing with Elements of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 148 |
| 2.4 | The Second Phase of the Assessment Model of Article 14 ECHR: General Cases | 150 |
| 2.4.1 | Phase 2a: Legitimate Aim | 151 |
| 2.4.2 | Phase 2b: The Proportionality Test | 152 |
| 2.5 | The Second Phase of the Assessment Model of Article 14 ECHR: Cases dealing with Elements of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights | 154 |
| 2.5.1 | The Second Phase 2a: The Legitimate Aim | 154 |
| 2.5.2 | The Second Phase 2b: The Proportionality Test | 155 |
| 3 | The Degree of Assessment under Article 14 ECHR | 157 |
| 3.1 | Introduction | 157 |
| 3.2 | The Degree of Assessment adopted under Article 14 ECHR and The Various Factors Influencing it | 157 |
| 3.3 | The Degree Adopted by the ECtHR in Cases that Deal with Elements of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights under Article 14 ECHR | 162 |
| 4 | Article 14 ECHR and the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | 165 |
| 4.1 | Introduction | 165 |
| 4.2 | The Right to Equal Access to Health Care and its Justiciability under Article 14 ECHR | 166 |
| 5 | Article 1 Protocol No. 12 to the ECHR | 172 |
| 5.1 | Introduction | 172 |
| 5.2 | Article 1 Protocol No. 12 ECHR and its Application | 173 |

| | | |
|---|--|------------|
| 5.3 | Concluding Remarks and the Significance of Article 1 Protocol No. 12 ECHR for the Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | 177 |
| 6 | Conclusions | 178 |
| | | |
| Chapter X | | |
| The Justiciability of the Right to Equal Access to Health Care at the Human Rights Committee | | 181 |
| 1 | Introduction | 181 |
| 2 | The Human Rights Committee and its Assessment of Cases concerning Unequal Treatment and Non-Discrimination under Article 26 ICCPR | 182 |
| 3 | Article 26 ICCPR and the Right to Equal Access to Health Care | 192 |
| 4 | Conclusions | 195 |
| | | |
| Chapter XI | | |
| Conclusion | | 197 |
| 1 | Introduction | 197 |
| 2 | Conclusions | 197 |
| 3 | Final Observations and Recommendations | 203 |
| | | |
| | Nederlandse Samenvatting | 207 |
| | Bibliography | 215 |
| | Table of Cases | 225 |
| | Table of Treaties and Declarations | 231 |
| | United Nations Documents | 235 |
| | Council of Europe Documents | 239 |
| | Index | 241 |
| | Curriculum Vitae | 247 |
| | School of Human Rights Research Series | 249 |

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|--|---|
| AP ESC | Additional Protocol to the ESC |
| CAT | Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment |
| CEDAW | Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women |
| CEDAWCee | Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women |
| CERD | Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination |
| CERDCee | Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination |
| CoE | Council of Europe |
| Committee | Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| Convention on Human Rights and Biomedicine | Convention for the protection of human rights and Dignity of the Human Being with regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine |
| CRC | Convention on the Rights of the Child |
| CRCCee | Committee on the Rights of the Child |
| CRPD | Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities |
| CRPDCee | Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities |
| ECHR | Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms |
| ECtHR | European Court of Human Rights |
| ESC | European Social Charter |
| ECOSOC | UN Economic and Social Council |
| GC | General Comment |
| GDP | Gross Domestic Product |
| HRCee | Human Rights Committee |
| ICCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political rights |
| ICESCR | International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights |
| ICPD | International Conference on Population and Development |
| ILO | International Labour Organization |

List of Abbreviations

| | |
|-----------|--|
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| OP ICCPR | Optional Protocol to the ICCPR |
| OP ICESCR | Optional Protocol to the ICESCR |
| RESC | Revised European Social Charter |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNFPA | UN Population Fund |
| UNICEF | UN Children's Fund |
| WHO | World Health Organization |