

Amnesty justified?
The need for a case by case approach
in the interests of human rights

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 52.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Amnesty justified?
The need for a case by case approach in the
interests of human rights

Vera Vriezen



Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
mail@intersentia.co.uk

This volume is an adapted version of a dissertation defended at Tilburg University on 16 December 2011.

The research for this dissertation was financially supported by the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO).

Vera Vriezen
Amnesty justified? The need for a case by case approach in the interests of human rights

Cover: Photo taken by Rashid Lombard (1990). Nelson Mandela and Frederik Willem de Klerk shake hands. The Nobel Peace Prize 1993 was awarded jointly to Mr. Mandela and Mr. De Klerk for their work for the peaceful termination of the apartheid regime, and for laying the foundations for a new democratic South Africa.

ISBN 978-1-78068-075-0
NUR 828

© 2012 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photo copy, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

To Reza, Twan and Olivia

DANKWOORD

Graag wil ik de mensen bedanken die mij op verschillende wijze hebben geholpen en gesteund deze dissertatie met succes te kunnen schrijven. Een aantal mensen wil ik hierbij graag in het bijzonder bedanken.

Allereerst mijn twee promotores, professor Willem van Genugten en professor Marc Groenhuijsen. Willem wil ik bedanken voor zijn begeleiding, vertrouwen en steun, niet alleen gedurende het proefschrifttraject, maar ook in de aanloop daarnaartoe. Willem heeft een grote rol gespeeld in de weg van student naar aio. Marc wil ik bedanken voor zijn begeleiding, vertrouwen en enthousiasme vanaf de eerste dag. Na een bespreking met Marc kreeg ik altijd weer nieuwe energie. Marc wil ik ook bedanken voor het indienen van de subsidieaanvraag waardoor dit onderzoek mogelijk werd.

De Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek (NWO) wil ik bedanken voor het mogelijk maken van dit onderzoek.

Dank gaat ook uit naar de leden van de promotiecommissie, de professoren Cees Flinterman, Rianne Letschert, Theo de Roos en Harmen van der Wilt, voor het lezen van het manuscript en hun waardevolle inzichten.

Mijn collega's van de vakgroep EIP wil ik bedanken voor hun bijdrage aan een plezierige werkomgeving.

Heel graag wil ik hier ook mijn familie bedanken. Allereerst wil ik mijn ouders en mijn broer bedanken en voor hun liefde, steun en vertrouwen. Tot slot wil ik mijn gezin bedanken. Lieve Reza, bedankt voor alles. Ik hou van je. Twan en Olivia, jullie zijn mijn lieve schatjes. Bedankt voor jullie vrolijkheid, jullie hebben mij de energie gegeven deze dissertatie tot een goed einde te brengen. Wat ben ik gelukkig met jullie.

CONTENTS

Dankwoord	vii
List of Abbreviations	xv
 PART 1 INTRODUCTION	 1
 Chapter I	
General introduction	3
1 Introduction	3
2 Research question	5
3 Objective of the study	5
4 Research approach	6
 PART 2 IMPUNITY AND AMNESTY	 9
 Chapter II	
Impunity	11
1 Introduction	11
2 Impunity	13
3 Forms of <i>de iure</i> impunity	17
3.1 Amnesty laws	18
3.2 Pardons	18
4 Effects on society	20
5 From impunity to a culture of impunity	22
6 Conclusion	25

Chapter III	
Amnesty	27
1	Introduction 28
2	The purposes of amnesty and the benefits of prosecution 29
2.1	Purposes of amnesty 32
2.2	Benefits of prosecution 35
3	Forms of amnesty 39
3.1	<i>De iure</i> amnesty 39
3.1.1	Blanket amnesty 39
3.1.2	Self-amnesty 41
3.1.3	Limited/political amnesty 42
3.1.4	Conditional amnesty 43
3.1.5	Corrective amnesty 44
3.1.6	Internationally legitimized amnesty 45
3.2	<i>De facto</i> amnesty 46
4	Timing and method of granting the amnesty 47
4.1	Amnesty before a transition or the end of conflict 47
4.2	Amnesty in a period of transition 47
5	Arguments in favour and against amnesty 49
5.1	In favour 50
5.2	Against 53
6	Conclusion 58
PART 3	THE LEGALITY OF NATIONAL AMNESTY LAWS 61
Chapter IV	
The legality of national amnesty laws under international law	63
1	Introduction 63
2	The duty to prosecute in general international and regional human rights treaty law 66
2.1	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights 1966 66
2.1.1	ICCPR 66
2.1.2	Human Rights Committee 68
2.2	American Convention on Human Rights 1969 71
2.2.1	ACHR 71
2.2.2	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights 73
2.2.3	Inter-American Court of Human Rights 76
2.3	Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 1950 80

2.3.1	European Convention	80
2.3.2	European Court of Human Rights	80
3	The duty to prosecute in human rights conventions on specific crimes	83
3.1	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide 1948	83
3.2	Convention on the Non-Applicability of Statutory Limitations to War Crimes and Crimes against Humanity 1968	84
3.3	International Convention on the Suppression and Punishment of the Crime of Apartheid 1976	86
3.4	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment 1984	87
3.4.1	Convention	87
3.4.2	Committee Against Torture	89
3.5	Inter-American Convention to Prevent and Punish Torture 1985	90
3.6	Inter-American Convention on Forced Disappearance of Persons 1994	91
3.7	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance 2006	92
4	The duty to prosecute in international humanitarian law	95
4.1	Geneva Conventions 1949	95
4.2	Additional Protocol II to the Geneva Conventions 1977	98
5	The duty to prosecute in statutes of international courts and tribunals	99
5.1	Introduction	99
5.2	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia	100
5.3	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda	102
5.4	International Criminal Court	103
5.5	Special Court for Sierra Leone	107
6	Universal jurisdiction	111
7	Conclusion	116

Chapter V

The United Nations' position and practice on impunity, amnesties and the duty to prosecute **119**

1	Introduction	119
2	General Assembly	120
3	Security Council	125
4	International Court of Justice	133
5	Secretary-General	136
6	Commission on Human Rights/Human Rights Council	143
6.1	Commission on Human Rights	143

6.2	Human Rights Council	149
7	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights	150
8	Conclusion	154

Chapter VI

Amnesty and the rights of victims 157

1	Introduction	157
2	The right to know the truth	162
2.1	Introduction	162
2.2	The development of the right to know the truth	167
2.3	The right to know the truth in international human rights law	171
2.4	Mechanisms to guarantee the right to know the truth	172
2.5	Interrelationship with other victims' rights	180
2.6	Conclusion	181
3	The right to reparation	182
3.1	Introduction	182
3.2	The development of the right to reparation	185
3.3	The right to reparation in international human rights law	188
3.4	Mechanisms to guarantee the right to reparation	189
3.5	Interrelationship with other victims' rights	194
3.6	Conclusion	197
4	The right to justice	198
4.1	Introduction	198
4.2	The development of the right to justice	200
4.3	The right to justice in international human rights law	202
4.4	Mechanisms to guarantee the right to justice	208
4.5	Interrelationship with other victims' rights	209
4.6	Conclusion	210
5	Victim participation	210
6	Conclusion	212

PART 4 FRAMEWORK FOR THE LEGITIMATE USE OF AMNESTY 215

Chapter VII

Framework for the legitimate use of amnesty 217

1	Introduction	217
2	Considerations for the drafting of a framework	218
3	Framework for the legitimate use of amnesty	223

Samenvatting (Dutch summary)	229
Bibliography	235
Curriculum Vitae	263
School of Human Rights Research Series	265

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACHR	American Convention on Human Rights
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council (Sierra Leone)
AI	Amnesty International
Art(t).	Article(s)
AZAPO	Azanian Peoples Organisation (South Africa)
CAT	Committee against Torture
CAVR	Commission for Reception, Truth, and Reconciliation (East Timor)
CDF	Civil Defence Forces (Sierra Leone)
CIDH	Commission for the Investigation of Criminal Acts (El Salvador)
CONADEP	Comisión Nacional sobre la Desaparición de Personas [National Commission on the Disappearance of Persons] (Argentina)
Comm.	Communication
CPA	Comprehensive Peace Agreement (Nepal)
Doc.	Document
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
ed(s).	editor(s)
e.g.	<i>exempli gratia</i> [for example]
<i>et al.</i>	<i>et alii/aliae</i> [and others]
<i>etc.</i>	<i>et cetera</i> [and so on]
ESMA	Escuela Superior de Méchanica de la Armade [Navy School of Mechanics] (Argentina)
EU	European Union
FAA	Angolan Armed Forces

List of abbreviations

FMLN	Frente Farabundo Martí para la Liberación Nacional [Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front] (El Salvador)
FNLA	National Front for the Liberation of Angola
FBI	Federal Bureau of Investigation (USA)
GA	General Assembly
GC	Geneva Convention
HRC	Human Rights Committee
HRW	Human Rights Watch
IAComHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
<i>Ibid.</i>	<i>Ibidem</i> [in the same place]
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
<i>i.e.</i>	<i>id est</i> [that is]
IST	Iraqi Special Tribunal
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army (Uganda)
MINUSTAH	United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti
MMM	Memory, Memorials and Museums
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
No(s).	Number(s)
OAS	Organization of American States
OEA	Organización de los Estados Americanos [OAS]
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
p(p).	page(s)
para(s).	paragraph(s)
Res.	Resolution
rev.	revised
RUF(/SL)	Revolutionary United Front (of Sierra Leone)
SC	(United Nations) Security Council
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SG	Secretary-General
SLA	Sierra Leone Army
STL	Special Tribunal for Lebanon
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UCA	José Simeón Cañas Universidad Centroamericana [Central American University] (El Salvador)
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations

List of abbreviations

UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
UNITA	Union for the Total Independence of Angola
U.S./USA	United States of America
USSR	Union of Soviet Socialist Republics
<i>v.</i>	<i>versus</i>
Vol.	Volume
WCHR	World Conference on Human Rights

