

## PATENTS AS PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE?

EUROPEAN STUDIES IN LAW AND ECONOMICS SERIES

1. *Group Litigation in European Competition Law. A Law and Economics Perspective*, Sonja E. Keske
2. *Behavioural Economics in Consumer Policy*, Hanneke Luth
3. *Ex-Post Liability Rules in Modern Patent Law*, Rosa Castro Bernieri
4. *Competition and Innovation in the EU Regulation of Pharmaceuticals: The Case of Parallel Trade*, Claudia Desogus
5. *The Law and Economics of Organ Procurement*, Firat Bilgel
6. *Law and Economics in the RIA World. Improving the use of economic analysis in public policy and legislation*, Andrea Renda
7. *Regulatory Competition in European Corporate and Capital Market Law*, Lars Hornuf
8. *Economic Criteria for Criminalization: Optimizing Enforcement in Case of Environmental Violations*, Katarina Svatikova

PATENTS AS PROTECTION OF  
TRADITIONAL MEDICAL  
KNOWLEDGE?

A Law and Economics Analysis

Petra EBERMANN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*  
Hart Publishing Ltd.  
16C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530  
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*  
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinierstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nvw.at

*Distribution for other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Patents as Protection of Traditional Medical Knowledge? A Law and Economics  
Analysis  
Petra Ebermann

© 2012 Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-073-6  
NUR 820

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is  
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any  
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book was in large parts written while I was a research assistant at the Institute of Law and Economics at the University of Hamburg. A number of people have contributed to the final success of this project and I want to take the opportunity to thank them.

First of all, I am especially grateful to my supervisor Thomas Eger for his time, helpful comments and advice and likewise to Hans-Bernd Schäfer who kindly agreed to act as second reviewer and handled the review process very efficiently whilst offering appropriate critique. My colleagues at the Institute were supportive at all times and provided well appreciated comments and inspiration. Amongst them, I would like to mention Katharina Greczszuk and Katherine Walker explicitly who have also become good friends of mine during this time. I wish to thank the editors of the scientific series 'European Studies in Law and Economics' for giving me the opportunity to publish this book in this series: Michael G. Faure, Luigi A. Franzoni and Patrick C. Leyens. I thank the Max Planck Institute of Intellectual Property and Competition Law in Munich for allowing me to conduct parts of my research at their library. I am especially indebted to Inga Ebermann and Tanja Friedrich for their active support, valuable comments and advice and Gabor Gottlieb and Paul Stange for providing practical and technical support at all times.

Most importantly, I want to take the opportunity to thank my parents, my sister (once more) and Patrick Hauser for their support, patience, kindness and constant encouragement.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i> .....	v
Introduction .....	1
PART 1.	
TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE, BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY AND INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS .....	9
Chapter 1.	
The Concept of Traditional Medical Knowledge and the Impact of Biotechnology.....	11
1.1. A Definition of Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	11
1.1.1. Traditional and Indigenous Knowledge .....	11
1.1.2. Traditional Medical Knowledge.....	13
1.1.3. General Characteristics of Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	14
1.1.3.1. Traditional Knowledge Holders.....	15
1.1.3.2. Creation and Preservation .....	15
1.1.3.3. Ownership .....	15
1.2. The Role of Natural Resources in Pharmaceutical R&D .....	16
1.2.1. Overview .....	16
1.2.2. Pharmaceutical Biotechnology.....	17
1.2.3. Bioprospecting Research Project .....	19
1.3. The Value of Pharmaceutical Biotechnology and Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	21
1.3.1. The Value of Pharmaceutical Biotechnological R&D.....	21
1.3.2. The Value of Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	22
Chapter 2.	
The Convention on Biological Diversity .....	25
2.1. Biological Diversity.....	25
2.1.1. Loss of Biodiversity .....	25
2.1.2. Consequences of Biodiversity Loss .....	26
2.2. Main Objectives of the CBD .....	27
2.2.1. Conservation and Sustainable Use .....	28

2.2.2.	Access to Biological Resources and Benefit Sharing . . . . .	30
2.2.2.1.	National Sovereignty . . . . .	31
2.2.2.2.	The Tragedy of the Commons . . . . .	32
2.2.2.3.	The Role of Property Rights in Access and Benefit-Sharing Regulation. . . . .	33
2.3.	Article 8 (j) CBD . . . . .	35
2.3.1.	The Elements of Traditional Knowledge Protection. . . . .	35
2.3.2.	Relationship with the Objectives . . . . .	35
2.3.3.	Form of Protection . . . . .	37
2.3.3.1.	Protection by Intellectual Property Rights. . . . .	37
2.3.3.2.	Positive and Negative Approaches to Protection. . . . .	38
 Chapter 3.		
	Trade-Related Intellectual Property Rights and Traditional Medical Knowledge. . . . .	39
3.1.	The TRIPS Agreement . . . . .	39
3.1.1.	Introduction . . . . .	40
3.1.1.1.	The International Legal Developments . . . . .	40
3.1.1.2.	The Economic Rationale of Intellectual Property Protection . . . . .	41
3.1.2.	Objectives of the TRIPS Agreement . . . . .	43
3.1.2.1.	Promotion of Free Trade . . . . .	44
3.1.2.2.	Promotion of Economic Development . . . . .	45
3.1.2.3.	Intellectual Property Rights and Developing Countries . . . . .	47
3.1.3.	General Principles of Non-Discrimination . . . . .	52
3.1.3.1.	National Treatment . . . . .	52
3.1.3.2.	Most-Favoured-Nation Clause . . . . .	52
3.2.	The International Legal and Economic Framework of Patents . . . . .	53
3.2.1.	Historical Development of Today's Patent Laws . . . . .	54
3.2.2.	Overview on TRIPS Rules on Patents . . . . .	54
3.2.2.1.	Patentable Subject Matter . . . . .	55
3.2.2.2.	Rules on Biotechnological Inventions and Biological Resources . . . . .	56
3.2.2.3.	Disclosure . . . . .	57
3.2.3.	The Economic Underlyings of Patenting . . . . .	57
3.2.3.1.	The Incentive-to-Invent Theory . . . . .	57
3.2.3.2.	Patent Scope . . . . .	59
3.3.	The Interaction Between Traditional Medical Knowledge, the TRIPS Agreement and the CBD . . . . .	61
3.3.1.	Traditional Knowledge in the TRIPS Context. . . . .	61
3.3.2.	Intellectual Property Rights and the CBD . . . . .	62



3.3.2.1.	Article 8 (j) CBD – Preservation of and Respect for the Knowledge, Innovations and Practices of Traditional Communities. . . . .	62
3.3.2.2.	Conservation and Sustainable Use of Biodiversity . . . . .	63
3.3.2.3.	Article 15 CBD – Access to Genetic Resources and Fair and Equitable Benefit Sharing . . . . .	63
3.3.2.4.	Article 16 CBD – Access to and Transfer of Technology . . . . .	63
3.4.	Summary of the Main Results of Part 1 . . . . .	64

PART 2.

THE STATUS QUO – PROTECTION OF TRADITIONAL MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE AND BIOTECHNOLOGICAL INVENTIONS UNDER CURRENT PATENT LAW . . . . .	67
---	----

Chapter 1.

Patentability Criteria in the US and the EU . . . . .	71
---	----

1.1. Legal Foundations for (Biotechnological) Patents in the US and the EU . . . . .	72
1.1.1. Sources of US Patent Law . . . . .	72
1.1.1.1. The Constitution. . . . .	72
1.1.1.2. Federal Statutes and Regulations. . . . .	72
1.1.1.3. Case Law . . . . .	73
1.1.2. European Patent Law . . . . .	74
1.1.2.1. The European Patent Convention . . . . .	74
1.1.2.2. The Biotechnology Directive . . . . .	75
1.1.2.3. National Laws and Court Decisions . . . . .	76
1.2. Substantive Patent Requirements . . . . .	76
1.2.1. Products of Nature . . . . .	76
1.2.1.1. US Patent Law . . . . .	77
1.2.1.2. European Patent Law . . . . .	79
1.2.2. Novelty . . . . .	82
1.2.2.1. The State of the Art in US Patent Law. . . . .	82
1.2.2.2. The European Approach to Novelty . . . . .	84
1.2.3. Inventive Step and Non-Obviousness . . . . .	85
1.2.3.1. US Patent Law – Non-Obviousness. . . . .	86
1.2.3.2. European Patent Law – Inventive Step . . . . .	89
1.2.4. Utility and Industrial Application. . . . .	91
1.2.4.1. US – Utility . . . . .	91
1.2.4.2. EU – Industrial Application . . . . .	93
1.3. Specification . . . . .	94
1.3.1. Disclosure of the Invention. . . . .	94

1.3.1.1.	US Patent Law .....	94
1.3.1.2.	Europe .....	96
1.3.2.	Patent Claims .....	98
1.3.2.1.	Claim Categories .....	98
1.3.2.2.	Claim Drafting .....	98
1.4.	Concluding Remarks .....	100
Chapter 2.		
	Biotechnological Patents on Pharmaceutical Drugs Developed in Bioprospecting Research Projects .....	101
2.1.	The Patentability of Biotechnological Inventions Using Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	101
2.1.1.	Natural Products Doctrine .....	101
2.1.2.	Traditional Medical Knowledge as Invalidating Prior Art .....	102
2.1.2.1.	The <i>Neem</i> Patents .....	103
2.1.2.2.	Analysis of the Prior Art Assessment in the <i>Neem</i> Proceedings .....	104
2.1.2.3.	The Standard of Disclosure .....	105
2.1.3.	Non-Obviousness in Bioprospecting Research Projects .....	106
2.1.3.1.	US Patent Law: The Standard of Non-Obviousness in the Aftermath of <i>KSR</i> .....	107
2.1.3.2.	The Inventive Step Requirement in Europe: <i>Neem</i> and <i>Hoodia</i> .....	109
2.2.	Analysis of the Results .....	112
2.2.1.	The Importance of Patents for Pharmaceutical R&D .....	112
2.2.2.	The Predictability of the Outcomes of Patent Proceedings .....	114
Chapter 3.		
	The Rights of the Providers of Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	117
3.1.	The Patentability of Traditional Medical Knowledge .....	117
3.1.1.	Products of Nature .....	117
3.1.2.	Novelty and Non-Obviousness .....	118
3.1.3.	Formal Requirements .....	120
3.2.	The Owner of the Patent: The Concept of Joint Inventorship .....	120
3.2.1.	Legal Definition of Joint Inventorship .....	121
3.2.1.1.	Requirements for Joint Inventorship in US Patent Law .....	121
3.2.1.2.	Joint Inventorship Under the EPC .....	122
3.2.2.	Joint Inventorship of Traditional Knowledge Groups and Pharmaceutical Companies .....	124
3.3.	Analysis of the Results .....	127
3.3.1.	The Public Good Problem .....	127

3.3.1.1. Suboptimal Rate of Innovation .....	128
3.3.1.2. Free-Riding .....	129
3.3.2. Allocation of Resources .....	129
3.3.3. Implementation of the CBD .....	131
3.3.3.1. Prior Informed Consent .....	131
3.3.3.2. Benefit Sharing .....	131
3.3.3.3. Disclosure of the Origin of the Source .....	132
3.4. Summary of the Main Results of Part 2 .....	132
PART 3.	
PROTECTING AND REWARDING TRADITIONAL MEDICAL	
KNOWLEDGE CONTRIBUTIONS UNDER PROPERTY AND	
LIABILITY REGIMES .....	
	135
Chapter 1.	
The Property Rights-based Approach to Protection .....	
	139
1.1. The Construction of Traditional Knowledge Rights .....	139
1.1.1. Novel Interpretation of Existing Norms .....	139
1.1.1.1. Invention .....	140
1.1.1.2. Novelty and Inventive Step .....	140
1.1.2. Sui Generis Systems – Definition of New Rights for Indigenous	
Peoples .....	141
1.2. Implementation of Article 8 (j) CBD Through Traditional Knowledge	
Rights .....	144
1.2.1. Interpretation and Infringement .....	144
1.2.1.1. Literal Infringement .....	145
1.2.1.2. The Doctrine of Equivalentents .....	145
1.2.1.3. Implications for the Right of Traditional Knowledge	
Providers .....	148
1.2.2. Economic Analysis – The Effects of Patents in Cumulative	
Innovation Scenarios .....	149
1.2.2.1. Optimal Allocation of Rights and Division of Profits ..	149
1.2.2.2. Hold-Up and Anticommons .....	151
1.2.2.3. Conclusion .....	153
1.3. Co-Operation Between Indigenous Groups and Pharmaceutical	
Companies and Joint Inventorship .....	154
1.3.1. Modification of the Requirements .....	154
1.3.2. The Rights of Joint Inventors .....	155
1.3.2.1. Use of the Patented Invention .....	155
1.3.2.2. Sharing of Profits .....	156
1.3.2.3. Discussion .....	156
1.4. Conclusion on the Property Rights Approach .....	157

Chapter 2.	
Benefit-Sharing Agreements and Liability Rules . . . . .	159
2.1. Mandatory Benefit-Sharing Agreements as Conditions to Patentability . . . . .	160
2.2. Benefit Sharing Under a Liability-Based Approach. . . . .	161
2.2.1. Conditions of a Compensatory Liability Regime . . . . .	162
2.2.2. Determination of the Value. . . . .	163
2.2.2.1. Statutory Rules . . . . .	164
2.2.2.2. Collective Rights Organizations . . . . .	164
2.2.3. Impact of Benefit Sharing on Retail Costs of Pharmaceuticals. . .	165
2.3. Conclusion on Benefit Sharing . . . . .	167
 Chapter 3.	
Prior Informed Consent and Disclosure Requirements . . . . .	169
3.1. The Content and Scope of the Requirements . . . . .	169
3.1.1. Prior Informed Consent Requirement . . . . .	169
3.1.2. Disclosure Requirements. . . . .	170
3.1.3. Effects and Costs of Prior Informed Consent and Disclosure Requirements. . . . .	170
3.1.3.1. The Sanction in Case of Non-Compliance. . . . .	170
3.1.3.2. The Effects of Disclosure Requirements . . . . .	171
3.1.3.3. The Effects of Prior Informed Consent . . . . .	172
3.2.. Compatibility with TRIPS. . . . .	172
3.2.1. Prior Informed Consent . . . . .	173
3.2.2. Disclosure Requirements. . . . .	173
3.2.2.1. Substantive or Formal Requirements . . . . .	173
3.2.2.2. Article 29 TRIPS. . . . .	173
3.2.2.3. Article 62 TRIPS. . . . .	174
3.3. Conclusion on Disclosure and Prior Informed Consent Requirements. . . . .	175
3.4. Summary of the Results of Part 3. . . . .	175
 Conclusion. The Results of the Analysis and the Implications for Future Discussions . . . . .	177
 <i>Bibliography</i> . . . . .	185
 <i>List of Cases</i> . . . . .	193
 <i>About the author</i> . . . . .	197
 <i>About the series</i> . . . . .	199