

AFRICAN PERSPECTIVES ON TRADITION AND JUSTICE

AFRICAN PERSPECTIVES ON
TRADITION AND JUSTICE

Edited by

Tom BENNETT

Eva BREMS

Giselle CORRADI

Lia NIJZINK

Martien SCHOTSMANS



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

African Perspectives on Tradition and Justice
Tom Bennett, Eva Brems, Giselle Corradi, Lia Nijzink and Martien Schotsmans
(eds.)

© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Cover photo: *People gossip and smoke waiting for the sun to come out, Chench Village, Southern Ethiopia* (© Marcin Bartosz Czarnoleski/Dreamstime.com)

ISBN 978-1-78068-059-0
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This publication was completed in the framework of the research project 'Addressing Traditional Law in Post-Conflict Legal and Judicial Development Aid in sub-Saharan Africa', with the financial support of the Belgian Ministry of Science Policy within its programme 'Society and Future' 2007 [TA/00/17 AFTRALAW]. The editors wish to express their gratitude to the programme administrators, Mrs. Margarida Freire, and her predecessor, Mrs. Zakia Khattabi, for their enthusiastic support to the project. They also wish to thank Dr. Marleen Renders for her role in designing the research project and the members of the Scientific Support Committee for their valuable inputs and critical comments as the project moved on: Mrs. Lara Deramaix, Prof. Marie-Claire Foblets, Mr. Renaud Galand, Prof. Em. Luc Huyse, Mr. Robert Olbrechts, Prof. Barbara Oomen, Mr. Dick Oosting, Prof. Stephan Parmentier, Prof. Filip Reyntjens, Mrs. Heidy Rombouts, Dr. Stef Vandeginste, Mr. Marc Van Wymeersch and Mr. Pierre Vincke. The authors of the chapters especially deserve our thanks for accepting our invitation to contribute to the volume and for addressing our comments and adjusting their chapters accordingly. Finally, our thanks are due to the University of Cape Town for the organization of the international forum 'Traditional Justice and the Role of External Actors in sub-Saharan Africa' in March 2010, which planted the seeds out of which this publication grew.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>About the authors and editors</i>	xi

Chapter I. Introduction

Giselle CORRADI and Martien SCHOTSMANS	1
1. Background to the Volume	1
2. Historical context and current approaches.	2
2.1. Traditional justice and development in Africa.	2
2.2. The localisation of transitional justice.	5
3. The contributions	9
4. Common themes.	11
Bibliography	14

Chapter II. Access to justice and human rights in the traditional courts of sub-Saharan Africa

Tom BENNETT	19
1. Introduction.	19
2. The traditional African style of justice	22
3. Due process of law.	24
4. Equal treatment.	26
5. Rights in criminal proceedings.	28
5.1. The civil/criminal distinction	28
5.2. Due process in criminal proceedings	31
5.3. The presumption of innocence	32
5.4. Legal representation	33
6. Access to justice.	34
7. Conclusion – And the right to culture.	38
Bibliography	40

Chapter III. Courts and the application of customary law in Malawi: Towards the reintroduction of local courts

Kenan Tilombe MANDA	47
1. Introduction.	47
2. Historical background	47

3.	The structure of the Malawi court system since 1994.....	50
4.	The application of customary law.....	51
4.1.	Problems in the magistrate courts.....	51
4.2.	Developing customary law jurisprudence.....	54
5.	The recommendations of the Malawi Law Commission.....	59
5.1.	The structure and positioning of the new local courts.....	60
5.2.	Presiding officers and assessors.....	61
5.3.	Jurisdiction.....	62
6.	Conclusion.....	64
	Bibliography.....	65

Chapter IV. Powers, rights and citizenship: The ‘return’ of the traditional authorities in Mozambique

Maria Paula G. MENESES..... 67

1.	Introduction.....	67
2.	Tradition, between the past and the future.....	68
3.	Civilization, culture and citizenship in the colonial context.....	72
3.1.	Nationality and citizenship: toughening the abyssal line.....	72
3.2.	Highlights of colonial administrative reforms.....	75
4.	Old and new actors in the political fabric of independent Mozambique..	78
4.1.	Amplifying the plural network of justices.....	79
4.2.	The return of ‘old’ actors.....	83
5.	Contemporary political implications of legal pluralism.....	87
	Bibliography.....	90

Chapter V. Traditional justice and human rights in post-war African countries: Prospects and challenges

Joe A.D. ALIE..... 95

1.	Introduction.....	95
2.	Confronting the justice challenge.....	96
3.	Is traditional justice the answer?.....	98
4.	Characteristics.....	101
5.	The human rights question.....	106
6.	The Sierra Leone conflict.....	109
7.	Justice and reconciliation from below.....	111
7.1.	Reintegration and reconciliation of ex-combatants.....	112
7.2.	Community reconciliation.....	113
7.3.	Philosophical expressions that are germane to the reconciliation process.....	115

8. Conclusion: The future of traditional justice	116
Bibliography	117
Chapter VI. Reinventing and validating the cosmology and ontology of restorative justice: Hermeneutics of the traditional Acholi justice system in Northern Uganda	
Daniel KOMAKECH	121
1. Rationale of the study: Contextualizing the assumptions and traits of justice in transitional justice.....	121
1.1. Introduction.....	121
1.2. The thesis and outline of the chapter	122
1.3. Central argument	122
1.4. Methodology	123
2. Live and let live: A critique of dominant modernist justice in transitional justice discourse.....	124
2.1. Introduction.....	124
2.2. The modernist critique of tradition	124
2.3. The modernist epistemology and retributive justice.....	126
2.4. The ICC and retributive justice in the Northern Uganda armed conflict	128
3. The resurgence of the traditional justice system in Northern Uganda... ..	130
3.1. The notion of tradition in the Acholi community.....	130
3.2. Reconstructing and validating tradition: A hermeneutics.....	131
3.3. Acholi cosmology and ontology: Tempels' framework.....	132
3.4. Cosmology and ontology among the Acholi of Uganda.....	133
3.5. The ontological hierarchy – Reconciliation and restoration in Acholi	135
4. Acholi traditional justice and human rights.....	137
4.1. Acholi understanding of human rights.....	137
4.1.1. The Acholi concept of rights being natural and communal.....	138
4.1.2. Duty and responsibility in human rights	139
5. Reliving Acholi traditional justice mechanisms: Plant Acholi in an Acholi garden.....	140
5.1. The Acholi concept of <i>dano</i> as a framework for reconciliation....	140
5.2. Justice and systemic thinking: Returning the ICC to the classroom	142
6. Conclusion	144
Bibliography	145

Chapter VII. Revisiting the legal and socio-political foundations and (Western) criticisms of *gacaca* courts
 Felix Mukwiza NDAHINDA and Alphonse MULEEFU 149

1. Introduction. 149
2. Legal and socio-political underpinnings of *gacaca* courts
 - 2.1. Prosecuting genocide cases in post-genocide Rwanda 152
 - 2.2. Motivations for the establishment of the *gacaca* courts 154
 - 2.2.1. Socio-legal dimensions 155
 - 2.2.2. Socio-political considerations 156
 - 2.2.3. Socio-cultural motivations 159
3. (Western) criticisms of *gacaca* courts 160
 - 3.1. Non-inclusion of RPF/A crimes in the *gacaca* process 161
 - 3.2. Non-compliance with due process guarantees 165
 - 3.3. Lack of judicial independence 166
4. Conclusion 168

Bibliography 168

ABOUT THE AUTHORS AND EDITORS

Joe A.D. Alie is an associate professor of history, head of the Department of History & African Studies and former dean of the Faculty of Arts, Fourah Bay College, University of Sierra Leone. He holds BA and MA degrees in history from the University of Sierra Leone, and a PhD in African History and Certificate in African Studies from the University of Wisconsin at Madison, USA. Dr. Alie is a leading textbook writer on the history of Sierra Leone.

Tom Bennett holds a BA LLB (Rhodes) and a PhD (UCT). He is a Professor in the Department of Public Law, a Fellow of the of the University of Cape Town and the recipient of the Alexander von Humboldt Fellowship. As a member of the special project Committee on Customary Law of the South African Law Reform Commission, he was actively engaged in the Report on Customary Marriages (1997), Report on Application of Customary Law (1997), Discussion Paper on Reform of the Customary Law of Succession (2000). His other major publications include: *The Application of Customary Law in Southern Africa: the conflict of personal laws* (1985), *A Sourcebook of African Customary Law for Southern Africa* (1991), *Human Rights and Customary Law under the South African Constitution* (1995) and *Customary Law in South Africa* (2004).

Eva Brems studied law at the universities of Namur (candidat 1989), Leuven (licentiaat 1992, PhD 1999) and Harvard (LLM 1995). Before joining Ghent University as a professor of Human Rights law, she was a researcher at the University of Leuven (1992–1994 and 1995–1999) and a lecturer at the University of Maastricht (1999–2000). Her research interests include most areas of human rights law (Belgian law, European law, international law, comparative law), with special emphases on women's rights, children's rights and cultural diversity. Since July 2010, she is also a member of the Belgian Parliament.

Giselle Corradi is a PhD candidate at the Human Rights Centre, Ghent University Law School. Her doctoral research focuses on the role of legal development actors at grassroots level regarding the relationship between human rights and customary justice in sub-Saharan Africa, with case studies in Sierra Leone and Mozambique. She holds a Bachelor in Law from the University of Buenos Aires and a Masters in Comparative Studies of Culture from Ghent University. Before joining the Human Rights Centre as a researcher, she worked

as a consultant in fair trade projects in Guatemala and Peru for the Durabilis Foundation.

Daniel Komakech holds a MA Philosophy and a BA in Political Science and Philosophy, both from Makerere University, Uganda and is a PhD Candidate in Philosophy, Makerere University. He is a lecturer in African political philosophy at Gulu University in Uganda and acting Director of the Institute of Peace and Strategic Studies at the same university.

Kenan Tilombe Manda is a Judge of the High Court of the Republic of Malawi. He holds an LLB (Hons) from the University of Malawi and an LLM from the University of Warwick (UK).

Maria Paula G. Meneses, a Mozambican scholar, is currently a senior researcher at the Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra, integrating the Research Group on Democracy, Citizenship and Law. She holds a PhD in Anthropology by Rutgers University (USA) and a MA in History from St. Petersburg University (Russia). She has carried out research on legal pluralism in Mozambique and Angola. Her current research focuses on the struggles over citizenship in Mozambique in the 1970s, with the transition to independence.

Alphonse Muleefu is a PhD researcher at Intervict, Tilburg University. He holds a Law Degree (LLB) from the National University of Rwanda and a LLM in International and European Public Law from Tilburg University, The Netherlands. He has participated in short courses on Transitional Justice, International Criminal law and International Criminal Investigations. He worked as a research student and legal researcher at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda and as a legal intern at the International Criminal Court (ICC). In Rwanda he worked as a legal officer in the National Service of Gacaca Courts and is a Founder of Together Against Impunity in the Great Lakes Region (TAI/GLR).

Felix Mukwiza Ndahinda is an Assistant Professor at the International Victimology Institute Tilburg (Tilburg University – The Netherlands). He holds a law degree from the National University of Rwanda (2003); an LLM from the Raoul Wallenberg Institute of Human Rights (Sweden, 2006) and a PhD from Tilburg Law School (2009). In 2001, he worked as a trainer for the elected *gacaca* judges. He also worked for the Office of the Auditor General for State Finances in Rwanda (2004), as an intern (2003) and a legal officer (2009) at the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda in Arusha, Tanzania and has been a visiting lecturer at the Kigali Independent University/Université Libre de Kigali (ULK) in 2005 and at the Independent Institute of Lay Adventists of Kigali (INILAK) in 2009, teaching Rwandan Criminal Law.

Lia Nijzink is a Senior Researcher with the Law, Race and Gender Research Unit, University of Cape Town. Previously, she held the same position with UCT's Department of Public Law, where she conducted research on the role of traditional justice in international justice sector aid in Africa and coordinated a research partnership with the universities of Dar es Salaam (Tanzania) and Warwick (UK). Nijzink holds an LLM from the University of Maastricht (NL) and an MA in Political Science from the University of Amsterdam (NL), has lectured in UCT's Department of Political Studies and has worked as a researcher for various South African and African organisations. Nijzink is the co-editor of *Electoral Politics in South Africa* (Palgrave/Macmillan 2005), *Accountable Government in Africa* (UCT Press 2012), *Trajectories of One-Party Dominance in African Democracies* (Lynne Rienner Publishers 2012) and *Political Parties, Party systems and Democracy in Africa* (Palgrave/Macmillan, forthcoming).

Martien Schotsmans is a PhD candidate at the Human Rights Centre of Ghent University on globalisation and localisation in transitional justice, with a focus on tradition-based justice. She holds a Master in Law and in Criminology from the KU Leuven University. After having practiced as a lawyer in Belgium, she worked in Rwanda, Chad and Sierra Leone and with *Avocats Sans Frontières*, among others. Since April 2008, she is a researcher at the Ghent University, looking into the role of international actors regarding the use of tradition in the framework of transitional justice in post-conflict Africa.

