

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CONFLICT

HUMAN RIGHTS AND CONFLICT

Essays in Honour of
Bas de Gaay Fortman

Edited by

Ineke BOEREFIJN
Laura HENDERSON
Ronald JANSE
Robert WEAVER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Human Rights and Conflict. Essays in Honour of Bas de Gaay Fortman
Ineke Boerefijn, Laura Henderson, Ronald Janse en Robert Weaver (eds.)

© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

ISBN 978-1-78068-054-5
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

CONTENTS

Introduction	
Human Rights Before, During, and After Conflict	
Ronald JANSE	1

PART I.

HUMAN RIGHTS IN PRE-CONFLICT SITUATIONS

Human Rights and the Regulation of the International State System	
Duco HELLEMA	13

1. Introduction	13
2. The Six Principles of the International Legal Order	16
2.1. Introduction	16
2.2. Sovereignty and Non-Intervention	16
2.3. Self-Determination	18
2.4. Free Trade	21
2.5. Collective Security	23
2.6. Arms Control and Disarmament	24
2.7. International Social Justice	26
3. Conclusion: Human Rights as Apotheosis?	27

Structures of Violence

Jolle DEMMERS	29
1. Introduction	29
2. Unending Failure: The Paradox of State-Making	32
3. The Connection Between Global Neoliberalism and Violent Conflict	34
3.1. State Competence and Conflict	36
3.2. Free Market Reforms and Identity Conflicts	37
3.3. Post-State Conflicts / Network Wars	38
4. 'New Wars': the Attempt to Frame Structural Flaws as Failures in 'Governance'	40
5. Conclusion	43

More Than Just a Nice Idea. Equality as an Effective Way to Reduce the Risk of Violent Conflict	
Jenny GOLDSCHMIDT and Laura HENDERSON	45
1. Introduction	45
2. Empirical Evidence Linking Effective Human Rights Standards with Decreased Risk of Violent Conflict	46
3. Equality	50
3.1. The Principle of Equality	50
3.2. Equality in Regional Human Rights Law	51
3.2.1. The European Court of Human Rights	52
3.2.2. The Court of Justice of the European Union	53
3.2.3. Developments at the European Level	55
4. Positive Obligations	56
4.1. A General Introduction to the Idea of Positive State Obligations	56
4.2. Positive Obligations – Specific Duties on States	58
4.2.1. Positive Obligations Under the ECHR	58
4.2.2. Positive Obligations in European Union Law	61
5. Conclusion	65
Human Rights Violations and Contemporary Violent Conflict. An Inquiry into Causes and Remedies	
Georg FRERKS	67
1. Introduction	67
2. Contemporary Conflict	68
2.1. Contemporary Wars as ‘New Wars’?	68
2.2. The Different Types of Causes	70
2.3. Different Explanatory Approaches	71
2.3.1. The Cultural School	72
2.3.2. The Economic School	74
2.3.3. The Political School	78
2.3.4. The Present Position: Converging Towards Consensus?	79
3. Changing War, Changing Peace: The Need for Different Conflict Management Approaches	81
4. The Relevance for Human Rights	84
5. Conclusion	85
Banning Cluster Bombs. Achieving Rights through Activism	
Georg FRERKS, Miriam STRUYK and Roos BOER	87
1. Introduction	87
2. Background on Cluster Munitions	88
2.1. What is Cluster Munition?	88

2.2. Humanitarian Impact.....	89
3. The Campaign for the Convention on Cluster Munitions	89
3.1. Negotiations on Protocol V of the CCW and the NGO Response ...	89
3.1.1. Launch of the CMC.....	90
3.1.2. CMC Action Beyond Protocol V	90
3.2. Action by the European Parliament.....	91
3.3. CMC Strategy and Activities in 2005 and 2006.....	91
3.4. The Use of Cluster Munitions in the Israel-Hezbollah War	92
3.5. Disillusionment at the 2006 CCW Review Conference.....	93
3.6. The Oslo Process	93
3.7. Rear-guard Actions in the GGE/CCW and Advocacy after the CCM	95
4. Activities in the Netherlands.....	96
4.1. Political Lobby	96
4.2. Disinvestment Campaign.....	99
5. Evaluation: Strong and Weak Points in the CMC and IPCN Campaigns .	100
6. Conclusion	103

Constraints and Challenges in Minority Protection. Experience of the OSCE
High Commissioner on National Minorities

Natalie SABANADZE.....	107
1. Introduction	107
2. HCNM – Post-Cold War Instrument of Comprehensive Security	108
3. National Minorities as a Systemic Problem.....	112
4. Geopolitical Constraints of Minority Protection.....	119
5. Normative Constraints of Minority Protection	123
6. Conclusion	127

Early Warning, Non-Intervention and Failed Responsibility to Protect in
Rwanda and Darfur

Fred GRÜNFELD.....	129
1. Introduction	129
2. Early Warnings	131
3. Causes of Conflicts and Atrocities	132
4. Rwanda	135
4.1. Early Warnings in Rwanda	135
4.2. Non-Intervention by the UN.....	138
4.3. The Absence of a Responsibility to Protect	139
5. Darfur	141
5.1. Early Warnings in 2003 and 2004.....	141
5.2. Continuing Warnings in 2005–2008	144

5.3. Non-Intervention by UN Human Rights Bodies	148
5.4. Non-Intervention by the UN Security Council 2004–2008	154
5.5. No Responsibility to Prevent or React	155
6. Failed Genocide Prevention and Human Rights Protection in Recent Decades	157
 Human Security. A Shifting and Bridging Concept that Can Be Operationalised	
Marlies GLASIUS	159
1. Introduction	159
2. Key Promoters of the Concept.	160
3. Human Security as a Paradigm-Shifting Concept.	162
3.1. Shifting Development	162
3.2. Shifting Security	163
3.3. Shifting Away from ‘Humanitarian Intervention’	163
3.4. A Shift Towards the Subjects of Security	164
4. Human Security as a Bridging Concept.	165
4.1. Bridging Security and Development	165
4.2. Bridging Realism and Ethics	166
5. Human Security as an Appropriated Concept?	167
5.1. Appropriation for Development	167
5.2. Appropriation for Security.	168
6. Operationalisation: Holistic yet Concrete Human Security Policies	171
6.1. The Human Security Soldier: Transformation of Military Policies. .	172
6.2. The Human Security Relief Worker: Transformation of Humanitarian Policies	173
6.3. The Human Security Spy: Transformation of Intelligence Policies. .	174
6.4. The Human Security Bureaucrat: Transformation of ‘Institution-Building’	175
6.5. Synthesis: The Human Security Worker	175
 From Acceptable Hazard to Violation of Rights. Upstream Human Rights Activism in the Sidoarjo Mudflow Case	
Irene I. HADIPRAYITNO	179
1. Introduction	179
2. Upstream Approach of Human Rights and Development Hazards	181
3. Description of the Sidoarjo Case.	182
3.1. Facts and Impact	182
3.2. Government Responses	186
4. The Trajectory of Human Rights Activism in the Sidoarjo Case	188
4.1. Human Rights Litigation by the Indonesian Legal Aid Foundation	188

4.2. The Investigation by the National Commission on Human Rights .	191
5. Human Rights Activism to Combat Development Hazards: Compensating for the Enforcement Deficit in Indonesia	195
6. Concluding Remarks.	197
 Climate Change, Conflict and the Protection of Vulnerable Collectivities	
M.A. Mohamed SALIH	199
1. Introduction	199
2. Climate Change and Vulnerability.	201
3. Climate Change and Conflict	203
4. Climate Change and Indigenous Peoples' Human Rights	205
5. Global Climate Governance and the Protection of Vulnerable Collectivities.	207
6. Conclusions	211
 From Charity to Institutional Development. Reflections on Newmont's Corporate Social Responsibility Strategies and Conflict-Avoidance in Ghana	
Radu MARES	213
1. Introduction	213
2. Institutional Development as Part of CSR Strategies	215
3. Community Participation	216
3.1. Newmont's Multistakeholder Committees	217
3.2. The Crop Compensation Committee	219
3.3. The Ahafo Social Responsibility Agreements (ASRA) Structures. . .	223
4. Capacities of Local Authorities	226
4.1. Ghana Responsible Mining Alliance	227
4.2. Tax Exemption	228
4.3. Advocacy for Increased Tax Transfers through MDF	230
5. Conclusion	230
 Doing Business in Pre-Conflict Areas	
Tineke LAMBOOY.	233
1. Introduction	233
2. Characteristics of Pre-Conflict Areas	233
3. Changing Expectations Toward Businesses	235
3.1. Criminal Prosecution in the Netherlands as Evidence of Changed Expectations	236
3.2. The Development of Corporate Social Responsibility Standards . . .	237
3.2.1. John Ruggie and the Development of International Standards to 'Protect, Respect and Remedy'	240

3.2.2. Other Human Rights Standards for Businesses (OECD, EU, UN, and Investment Fund Standards)	241
4. Local Partnerships	243
4.1. Designing a Partnership	246
5. Conclusion	249

Conflict and Rights in Vengeance-Ridden Societies. Moral and Legal Inferences

Fatos TARIFA	251
1. Introduction	251
2. Background: Vengeance, Culture and Law	252
3. The Kanun: Its Substance and Reach	254
3.1. Origins of the Kanun	254
3.2. Honor and Retaliation in the Kanun	256
3.3. The Duty of Hospitality in the Kanun	260
3.4. Asserted Jurisdiction and Reach of the Kanun	262
4. Conclusion: Implications for Legal Anthropology	264

PART II.

HUMAN RIGHTS IN CONFLICT SITUATIONS

Human Rights and Humanitarian Action

Dorothea HILHORST and Bram J. JANSEN	269
1. Introduction	269
1.1. Method	270
2. Background: Setting the Stage for Social Negotiation and Casting the Actors	270
2.1. Roles Played by Humanitarian Actors	270
2.2. Humanitarian Action as Arenas of Social Negotiation	271
3. Two Bodies of Law and a Bundle of Norms	273
3.1. International Humanitarian Law	273
3.2. Refugee Law and the Role of UNHCR	274
3.3. Norms, Codes, and Standards	275
3.4. Human Rights and Humanitarianism as Competing Frameworks for Global Governance	277
4. The Political Use of Humanitarian Labels and Languages of Rights	277
4.1. War under the Flag of Humanity	278
4.2. The Mediagenic Properties of Human Rights	278
4.3. Negotiating the Applicability of IHL	279
5. Rights and Standards in Practice	281
5.1. Humanitarian Cruelty	281

5.2. Consumer or Citizen Rights?	282
5.3. Negotiating Multiple and Overlapping Rights	284
6. Conclusion	285
Old Cultures Never Die? Cultural Genocide in International Law	
Yvonne DONDERS	287
1. Introduction	287
2. Cultural Genocide: A Definition	289
3. (Cultural) Genocide in International Law	291
3.1. The Genocide Convention	291
3.1.1. The Definition of Genocide	291
3.1.2. Cultural Genocide in the Draft Genocide Convention	292
3.2. The Core of Genocide: The Intent to Physically Destroy a Group ...	294
4. Cultural Genocide and Human Rights	296
4.1. Cultural Rights in International Human Rights Instruments	296
4.2. Obligations of States	297
5. The UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples	298
6. Prohibition of the Destruction of Cultural Heritage	300
6.1. The Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict	300
6.2. UNESCO Instruments on Cultural Heritage	301
7. Concluding Remarks	302
Non-State Actors in Conflict	
Anja MIHR	305
1. Introduction	305
2. Background: Non-State Actors and NGOs in Conflict Situations	307
3. The Role(s) of Non-State Actors in Conflicts	311
3.1. Becoming an Active Part of the Conflict through Neutrality	313
3.2. Assessment of Non-State Actors in Times of Conflict	316
3.3. Non-State Actors' Responsibility to Protect	320
4. Conclusion	322
Caught in the Middle of Persistent Conflict. The Rights of Palestinian Children	
Karin ARTS	325
1. Introduction	325
2. Children and Armed Conflict: Increased International Attention to the Facts, Law and Monitoring	326
2.1. Exposing the Facts: The Machel Reports	327

2.2. Creating a Normative Framework in Relation to Children Affected by Armed Conflict	329
2.3. International Monitoring	334
3. Palestinian Children: In the Middle of Persistent Conflict	337
4. Action Urgently Needed: Hold Relevant Actors to Account and Develop a Child-Rights Based Approach to Relations with Israel.	343

PART III.

HUMAN RIGHTS IN POST-CONFLICT SITUATIONS

How Transitional Are Transitional Politics and Transitional Justice?

A Case of Misleading Terminology

Peter R. BAEHR.	349
-------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	349
2. Dealing with the Past	351
3. Post-Conflict Politics	354
4. Political Aspects of Transitional Justice.	356
5. Conclusion	361

Counter-Terrorism, Rule of Law Promotion and the Friends of Yemen

Ronald JANSE	363
------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	363
2. Counter-Terrorism and Rule of Law Promotion	365
3. Diagnosis and Recommendations.	370
4. Lacunae	371
5. Conclusion	373

The Role of International Criminal Courts and Tribunals in Post-Conflict Societies

Gentian ZYBERI	375
--------------------------	-----

1. Introduction	375
2. The Growth of International Criminal Justice Mechanisms: From the Ad Hoc Tribunals to the ICC and the Hybrid Criminal Courts.	377
3. The Challenging Objectives of International Criminal Justice Mechanisms	380
3.1. Drawing a Line Between Two Different Regimes and Affirming Democratic Transition	384
3.2. Bringing Those Most Responsible for Mass Atrocity Crimes to Justice.	385
3.3. Providing Justice to Victims and Giving Them a Voice	386
3.4. Promoting and Strengthening the Rule of Law in Post-Conflict Societies.	387

4. A Brief Critical Appraisal of International Criminal Justice and Its Mechanisms	389
5. Concluding Remarks	392
Rwanda's Police Development	
Piet VAN REENEN	395
1. Introduction	395
2. The Context	396
2.1. Crisis and Recovery	396
2.2. Human Rights and Integrity	399
3. The Rwandan National Police	400
3.1. Brief Background on the Rwandan National Police	400
3.2. The Composition of the Rwandan National Police	402
4. The Police Development Plan and Foreign Support	403
4.1. The Police Development Plan	403
4.2. The Assessment	403
5. Explaining the Success	405
5.1. Unique Factors Contributing to the Success of the Rwandan National Police	405
5.1.1. Still a Movement	405
5.1.2. Kagame's Hand	406
5.1.3. Initial Political Stability and Broad External Support	406
5.2. General Factors Contributing to the Success of the Rwandan National Police	407
5.2.1. Systematic and Long-Term Political Support	407
5.2.2. A Planned Approach and Partnership	408
6. The Fragility of Success	408
7. The Dirty Hands Dilemma	409
Civil and Political Rights in Times of Political Oppression: Rights Without Remedies? The Case of Zambia	
Rodger M.A. CHONGWE and Nicola JÄGERS	413
1. Introduction	413
2. Legal Protection of Human Rights	415
3. The Impact of International Human Rights Norms on the Domestic Level	416
4. Human Rights Implementation in Former Colonies	417
5. Case Study of Zambia	420
5.1. The Legal Framework	422
5.2. The Judiciary	425
5.3. An Illustration of the Non-Implementation of Civil and Political Rights in Zambia: Chongwe versus Zambia	428

5.3.1. The Obligation to Comply with the Findings of the HRC . . .	430
6. The Meaning of Civil and Political Rights in Absence of a Willing Domestic State; The Pivotal Role of Civil Society.	432
7. Concluding Remarks.	434
Role of the Judiciary in the Enforcement of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Experience from Nepal	
Kalyan SHRESTHA and Ananda M. BHATTARAI	437
1. Introduction	437
2. Nepal: Current Situation and Constitutional Framework of Rights	438
3. Constitutional Position of the Judiciary	439
4. Judicial Approach to Rights.	440
5. Specific Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	443
5.1. The Right to Food	444
5.2. Right to Education.	446
5.3. Right to Water	449
5.4. Right to Health.	451
6. Role Played by the Judiciary in the Enforcement of ESC Rights and Its Limitations	453
7. Conclusion	457
Loss and Destruction of Property. Post-Conflict Human Rights Responses from an ECHR Perspective	
Antoine BUYSE.	459
1. Introduction	459
2. What Are Possessions under the ECHR?	460
3. The Home as the Most Cherished Possession	465
4. The State Duty not to Interfere with Property	469
5. The Positive Obligations of the State Concerning Property	478
6. Conclusion	480
The Human Right to Mourning. Social Trauma and Transitional Justice in Post-Conflict Argentina	
Antonius ROBBEN	483
1. Introduction	483
2. Mass Graves and Basic Trust	484
3. Social Trauma and the Pursuit of Justice.	486
4. The Complicated Mourning of Disappearances.	490
5. Human Rights and the Right to Mourning the Dead	494

The Interface Between Transitional Justice and Reconciliation in the Wake of Civil War. A Case Study of Northern Uganda	
Lauren GOULD and Cedric RYNGAERT	499
1. Introduction	499
2. Background: Conflict in Northern Uganda	502
2.1. Inter-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the LRA, Acholi and GoU	503
2.2. Intra-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the Acholi and Lower-Ranked LRA Combatants	504
2.3. Inter-Group Perceptions and Behaviour Between the Acholi and the GoU	505
3. A Process of Transitional Justice in the Wake of Uganda's Civil War	506
4. Transitional Justice in Theory and Practice	508
4.1. The Impact of the ICC Indictments	508
4.1.1. Interface Between International Criminal Justice and Reconciliation in Theory	509
4.1.2. Interface Between International Criminal Justice and Reconciliation in Practice	510
4.2. The Codification of Traditional Justice	513
4.2.1. Interface Between Traditional Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Theory	513
4.2.2. Interface Between Traditional Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Practice	514
4.3. War Crimes Division of the High Court	518
4.3.1. Interface Between National Criminal Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Theory	519
4.3.2. Interface Between National Criminal Justice and the Facilitation of Reconciliation in Practice	520
5. Conclusion	522
Selected Bibliography	
Bastiaan DE GAAY FORTMAN	525

