

## PUBLIC FORGIVENESS IN POST-CONFLICT CONTEXTS

## SERIES ON TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

The Series on *Transitional Justice* offers a platform for high-quality research within the rapidly growing field of transitional justice. The research is, of necessity inter-disciplinary in nature, drawing from disciplines such as law, political science, history, sociology, criminology, anthropology and psychology, as well as from various specialised fields of study such as human rights, victimology and peace studies. Furthermore, the research is international in outlook, drawing on the knowledge and experience of academics and other specialists in many different regions of the world.

The series is aimed at a variety of audiences who are either working or interested in fields such as crime and justice; human rights; humanitarian law and human security; conflict resolution and peace building. These audiences include academics, researchers, students, policy makers, practitioners, non-governmental organisations and the media.

All books published within the series are subject to a double-blind peer review by recognised authorities in the field.

### **The General Editors of the Series are:**

- Prof. Stephan Parmentier (Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium)
- Prof. Jeremy Sarkin (United Nations Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances)
- Prof. Elmar Weitekamp (University of Tübingen, Germany)

The general editors receive the support from an Editorial Committee and an Advisory Board, consisting of internationally renowned academics and practitioners.

### **Published titles within the series:**

1. Stephen Peté & Max Du Plessis, *Repairing the Past? International Perspectives on Reparations for Gross Human Rights Abuses* (2007), 978-90-5095-492-1
2. Laura Stovel, *Long Road Home, Building Reconciliation and Trust in Post-War Sierra Leone* (2010), 978-94-000-0028-5
3. Andy Aitchison, *Making the Transition. International Intervention, State-Building and Criminal Justice Reform in Bosnia and Herzegovina* (2011), 978-94-000-0140-4
4. Stef Vandeginste, *Stones left unturned. Law and Transitional Justice in Burundi* (2010), 978-94-000-0115-2
5. Antoine Buyse (ed.), *Margins of Conflict. The ECHR and Transitions to and from Armed Conflict* (2011), 978-94-000-0157-2
6. Gaby Oré Aguilar and Felipe Gómez Isa (eds.), *Rethinking Transitions. Equality and Social Justice in Societies Emerging from Conflict* (2011), 978-1-78068-003-3
7. Richard Zajac Sannerholm, *Rule of Law after War. Ideologies, Norms and Methods* (2012), 978-1-78068-008-8
8. Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark and Danielle Granville (chief editors), *Critical Perspectives in Transitional Justice* (2011), 978-1-78068-035-4
9. Edda Kristjánsdóttir, André Nollkaemper and Cedric Ryngaert (eds.), *International Law in Domestic Courts: Rule of Law Reform in Post-conflict States* (2012), 978-1-78068-041-5

PUBLIC FORGIVENESS IN  
POST-CONFLICT CONTEXTS

Edited by

Bas VAN STOKKOM  
Neelke DOORN  
Paul VAN TONGEREN



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.  
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road  
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom  
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

*Distribution for the UK:*  
Hart Publishing Ltd.  
16C Worcester Place  
Oxford OX1 2JW  
UK  
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530  
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

*Distribution for the USA and Canada:*  
International Specialized Book Services  
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300  
Portland, OR 97213  
USA  
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)  
Email: info@isbs.com

*Distribution for Austria:*  
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag  
Argentinierstraße 42/6  
1040 Wien  
Austria  
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24  
Email: office@nwv.at

*Distribution for other countries:*  
Intersentia Publishing nv  
Groenstraat 31  
2640 Mortsel  
Belgium  
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50  
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Public Forgiveness in Post-Conflict Contexts  
Edited by Bas van Stokkom, Neelke Doorn and Paul van Tongeren

© van Stokkom, Doorn and van Tongeren, 2012

Intersentia  
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland  
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaan, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999. From the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio, Article 5*, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999

ISBN 978-1-78068-044-6  
NUR 828



British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The papers presented in this volume were first published in a conference at the Radboud University in Nijmegen, the Netherlands (March 2010). The conference was organised by the Centre for Ethics, Radboud University and Cordaid, an international development organisation. The conference was supported by ICCO, interchurch organisation for development cooperation, Sormani Fonds, and Radboud University Nijmegen.

The editors wish to express their gratitude to these institutions for their generous support. Thanks is also due to Professor Stephan Parmentier, who kindly chaired the afternoon session in Nijmegen, and pointed our attention to the Transitional Justice Series of Intersentia Publishers. Thanks also to the other editors of the Series and two anonymous reviewers for their fruitful comments on earlier versions of the chapters.

Those who wish to watch and listen to some conference presentations, please see the website [www.publicforgiveness.com](http://www.publicforgiveness.com). This site includes presenters whose speeches are not incorporated in this book (Johan Du Toit, Alistair Little, Stephan Parmentier, Daniel Philpott, Marlies Stappers, Wilhelm Verwoerd and George Wachira). Thanks to all contributors for their hard work and cooperation, and especially their sound grasp of many particular aspects of transitional justice processes.



# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i> .....	v
<i>List of contributors</i> .....	xiii

## Public forgiveness: Theoretical and practical perspectives

Bas VAN STOKKOM, Neelke DOORN and Paul VAN TONGEREN .....	1
1. Introduction .....	1
2. What is public forgiveness? .....	2
3. The minimalist account: 'Reconciliation without forgiveness' .....	6
4. The maximalist account: 'No future without forgiveness' .....	8
5. Contexts of public forgiveness .....	9
6. Aims and overview .....	12
References .....	18

## PART 1

### PHILOSOPHICAL ACCOUNTS OF PUBLIC FORGIVENESS

#### Public forgiveness: A modest defence

Trudy GOVIER .....	25
1. The logical objection .....	28
2. Normative objections .....	31
3. Practical considerations .....	35
References .....	36

#### The philosophical controversy over political forgiveness

Alice MACLACHLAN .....	37
1. Introduction .....	37
2. A working theory of forgiveness .....	39
3. Making forgiveness political .....	41
4. First objection: Political actors cannot forgive for victims .....	45
5. Second objection: Political forgiveness is illiberal .....	48
6. Third objection: Groups cannot forgive .....	51
7. Fourth objection: Acts of political forgiveness lack appropriate reasons .....	52

8. Political grounds for forgiveness: An Arendtian account . . . . .	56
9. Conclusion . . . . .	61
References . . . . .	62
Forgetting, remembering, forgiving, and the mundane legal order	
Wouter VERAART . . . . .	65
1. Introduction . . . . .	65
2. A collective duty to forget . . . . .	66
3. A collective duty to remember . . . . .	68
4. Earthly justice and theological motives . . . . .	70
5. A collective duty to forgive . . . . .	73
5.1. Back to Damhouder . . . . .	73
5.2. Forgiveness and transitional justice . . . . .	76
5.3. Tutu and his critics . . . . .	79
5.4. The constitution and structuring time . . . . .	82
6. Tasks of the mundane legal order . . . . .	85
References . . . . .	87
Time beyond time – time before time: Comments on Ricoeur	
Bert VAN ROERMUND . . . . .	91
1. Forgiveness and reconciliation . . . . .	92
2. The problem of the political . . . . .	97
3. Public forgiveness? . . . . .	102
References . . . . .	104
A question of forgiving words	
Erik DOXTADER . . . . .	107
1. Speaking, to a question . . . . .	107
2. Asking for forgiveness: The (im)potentiality of language . . . . .	110
3. The public question of forgiveness . . . . .	120
References . . . . .	123
Sympathy and inseparability	
Nir EISIKOVITS . . . . .	125
1. Sympathy and political reconciliation . . . . .	125
2. Inseparability . . . . .	129
3. Israeli Jews and Israeli Arabs . . . . .	132
4. The Israeli Palestinian conflict . . . . .	135
5. Conclusion . . . . .	137
References . . . . .	138



PART 2

PUBLIC FORGIVENESS IN POLITICAL AND RELIGIOUS CONTEXTS

Political forgiveness, promise, and the “understanding heart” in Hannah Arendt’s theory

Catherine GUISAN .....	143
1. Introduction .....	143
2. The theoretical argument .....	144
2.1. Forgiving and promising in Arendt’s politics .....	144
2.2. Reconciliation as understanding and the hermeneutical path of story-telling. ....	148
3. The practices of political forgiveness, promise and understanding: Three stories .....	149
3.1. The founding of the European Coal and Steel Community (ECSC): A deficit of understanding. ....	149
3.2. The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission: A deficit of promising .....	153
3.3. Iraqi and US reconciliatory processes and the deficits of forgiving and understanding .....	155
4. Conclusion. ....	158
References .....	158

Victimhood, truth recovery, and public forgiveness in Northern Ireland –  
Some interdisciplinary reflections

Margaret E. SMITH .....	163
1. Introduction .....	163
2. Northern Ireland after 1998 .....	163
3. Truth recovery .....	165
4. Victims in the Northern Ireland conflict. ....	169
5. Emergence of victims’ groups .....	170
6. The Consultative Group on the Past .....	171
7. Strategy for victims and survivors – The new government plan .....	172
8. Public forgiveness in Northern Ireland .....	174
9. Nature of the conflict – Northern Ireland as a contested state. ....	177
10. No truth commission for Northern Ireland. ....	181
11. Public forgiveness from the bottom up. ....	182
12. Final thoughts. ....	183
References .....	184

Forums of apology and forgiveness

Sanderijn CELS .....	189
1. Introduction .....	189
2. Public forgiveness.....	190
3. Questions.....	191
4. Moral dependency .....	192
5. Practice of apologies .....	194
6. Consequences .....	196
7. Other meanings .....	199
8. Conclusions.....	200
References .....	201

Public reconciliation at the South African TRC: The impact of the victim hearings

Annelies VERDOOLAEGE .....	203
1. The South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission.....	203
2. Reconciliation discourse and the archive.....	204
3. Reconciliation as a multidimensional term at the HRV hearings .....	206
4. Interpreting reconciliation before the TRC – Too much forgiveness?.....	217
5. Reconciliation and society .....	219
6. Conclusion.....	223
References .....	223

Should Christian contributions to transitional justice focus on reconciliation? Learning from El Salvador

Stephen J. POPE.....	227
1. Introduction .....	227
2. Historical context.....	228
3. The Church .....	233
4. Justice as the path to reconciliation.....	236
5. Liberal democracy and Christian reconciliation .....	240
6. Conclusion.....	242
References .....	243

Public forgiveness at the boundary of the secular and the religious.

How do we read the terrain?

Robert SCHREITER .....	249
1. Introduction .....	249
2. Religious views of reconciliation .....	251
2.1. The exocentric character of reconciliation .....	251

2.2. The ambivalences of narrative .....	254
2.3. Negotiating constructs of suffering.....	255
3. Forgiveness .....	256
3.1. Are there unforgivable deeds? .....	257
3.2. Can groups forgive? .....	258
3.3. Does forgiveness require apology and repentance? .....	259
4. Conclusion.....	261
References .....	262



## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Sanderijn Cels is currently senior fellow at the Consensus Building Institute and research associate at the MIT-Harvard Public Disputes Program (both located in Cambridge, US). She is a scholar and writer in the field of political communication and public sector innovation, and she is specialized in case teaching and writing. She has (co) authored six books, including *Becoming an Agent of Change: Strategy and Tactics of Social Innovation* (Brookings Institution, 2012). Cels is also a PhD candidate at Loughborough University (UK). Her thesis focuses on political apologies and aims to conceptualize those as public performances in multi-actor environments.

Neelke Doorn is assistant professor of Ethics of Water Governance at the Department of Philosophy of Delft University of Technology. She recently finished her work on the project Moral Responsibility in R&D networks (PhD thesis). Neelke has a master degree in Civil Engineering (Delft 1997, MSc) and Philosophy (Leiden 2005, MA). Between 2006 and 2010, she was affiliated to the Radboud University in Nijmegen, where she held a part-time research position at the Centre of Ethics focusing on justice issues in post-conflict situations.

Nir Eisikovits is Assistant Professor of Philosophy, Department of Philosophy, Suffolk University Boston (USA). He teaches legal and political philosophy and directs the Graduate Program in Ethics and Public Policy. His publications focus on how countries emerge from war and how they come to terms with their past. His book *Sympathizing with the Enemy: Reconciliation, Negotiation and Transitional Justice* (2010) was published by Brill and Republic of Letters.

Erik Doxtader is a Professor of Rhetoric at the University of South Carolina and a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation in Cape Town. A past recipient of a MacArthur Foundation-Social Science Research Council Fellowship, he has authored, edited, and co-edited a number of books and essays on transitional justice and the dynamics of reconciliation in South Africa, including *Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa – The Fundamental Documents* (2008), *With Faith in the Works of Words: The Beginnings of Reconciliation in South Africa, 1985–1995* (2009) and *In the Balance: South Africans Debate Reconciliation* (2010).

Trudy Govier is a philosopher and the author of many articles and books, including *Forgiveness and Revenge* (Routledge 2002), *Taking Wrongs Seriously* (Humanity Books, Prometheus 2006), and *A Practical Study of Argument* (Wadsworth/Cengage, Seventh Edition 2010). In addition to academic work, she has been a key participant in peace education and advocacy groups. Trudy Govier is presently Professor of Philosophy at the University of Lethbridge in Alberta, Canada.

Catherine Guisan is Visiting Assistant Professor in the Department of Political Science, University of Minnesota, Twin Cities, and teaches in European universities also. She is the author of *Un sens à l'Europe: Gagner la paix 1950–2003* (Paris: Odile Jacob, 2003) and *A Political Theory of Identity in European Integration: Memory and Policies* (Oxford and New York: Routledge, 2011).

Alice MacLachlan is an Assistant Professor of Philosophy at York University (Toronto, Canada). She has written articles and book chapters on forgiveness, reconciliation, and apology in personal and political contexts; her recent publications include “The State of Sorry: Official Apologies and their Absence” in the *Journal of Human Rights* (2010), “Unreasonable Resentments” in the *Journal of Social Philosophy* (2009), and “Practicing Imperfect Forgiveness” in *Feminist Ethics and Social Philosophy: Theorizing the Non-Ideal* (ed. Lisa Tessman, Springer 2009). She is currently completing a manuscript on forgiveness and co-editing a volume of essays on moral issues in the wake of violent conflict.

Stephen J. Pope is Professor of Theological Ethics in the Theology Department at Boston College in Chestnut Hill, Massachusetts. He is the author of *Human Evolution and Christian Ethics* (Cambridge, 2007) and “Restorative Justice as a Prophetic Path to Peace”, *Catholic Theological Society of America Proceedings* 65 (2010): 19–34. He is the editor of *The Ethics of Aquinas* (Georgetown, 2002).

Robert Schreiter is professor of theology at the Catholic Theological Union in Chicago. He has been involved with peace/building on all six continents, especially around the healing of societies in post-conflict reconstruction, and the building of resilience for local peace-builders. For twelve years he was the theological consultant to *Caritas Internationalis*, the umbrella organization for 165 relief and development agencies in the Roman Catholic Church, for its programs in peace-building. Among his works are: *Reconciliation: Mission and Ministry in a Changing Social Order* and *Reconciliation: Spirituality and Strategies*. With Scott Appleby and Gerard Powers he edited *Peacebuilding: Catholic Theology, Ethics, and Praxis*.

Margaret E. Smith is a Scholar in Residence in the Division of International Peace and Conflict Resolution at the School of International Service, American University. Her areas of specialization include nationalist and ethnic conflict, uses of memory in politics, and post conflict reconstruction in deeply divided societies. She has studied the revision of the teaching of history as a tool of post-conflict reconstruction, and is the author of *Reckoning with the Past: Teaching History in Northern Ireland* (Lexington Books, 2005).

Bert van Roermund is Professor of Philosophy, Tilburg University in The Netherlands. He has published extensively on various fundamental legal concepts and contemporary legal problems (constitutional review, democracy, punishment, contract law). His monograph *Law, Narrative and Reality* (1997; also in Spanish) concluded a period of research on law and language. Since 1997, he has focused on problems of authority and representation (sovereignty, identity, normativity) in supra-national contexts (in particular the EU), as well as transitional justice and reconciliation. Currently, his main topic is the first-person perspective in law, with special emphasis on human rights and democratic law making.

Bas van Stokkom is lecturer and research fellow at the Criminological Institute, Radboud University Nijmegen, The Netherlands. His research concentrates on the fields of citizenship, deliberative democracy, restorative justice, and legal / punishment ethics. He is secretary of the Dutch-Flemish journal *Tijdschrift voor Herstelrecht* (Journal of Restorative Justice) and co-editor of the studies *Images of Restorative Justice Theory* (2008) and *Reflections on Reassurance Policing in the Low Countries* (2008).

Paul J.M. van Tongeren studied theology in Utrecht (The Netherlands) and philosophy in Louvain (Belgium). He is professor for moral philosophy at Radboud University Nijmegen and special professor for ethics at the Catholic University of Leuven. He published widely on Nietzsche as well as on moral philosophy. Further info and list of publications can be found at: [www.paulvantongeren.nl](http://www.paulvantongeren.nl)

Wouter Veraart is professor of legal philosophy at the Department Legal Theory and Legal History of the Faculty of Law, VU University Amsterdam. His research is focussed on redress and restitution after periods of injustice, and the tension between remembering and forgetting (which was also the main subject of his inaugural lecture in 2009). In 2011 he published together with Laurens Winkel, *The Post-War Restitution of Property Rights in Europe, Comparative Perspectives*, Scientia Verlag, Amsterdam & Aalen.

Annelies Verdoolaege obtained Ma degrees in Germanic Languages and in African Languages and Cultures from Ghent University and an Ma degree in Africana Studies from the State University of New York at Albany. Her PhD dissertation (June 2005) involved a discursive analysis of the victim hearings of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC). From May 2006 onwards she works as a postdoctoral researcher at the department of African Languages and Cultures at Ghent University. She has published in the fields of discourse analysis, political sciences and cultural studies, and on various aspects of the TRC (see <http://cas1.elis.rug.ac.be/avrug/trc/cv.htm>).