

CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES IN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES IN TRANSITIONAL JUSTICE

Nicola PALMER
Phil CLARK
Danielle GRANVILLE
(chief editors)

ROSS BEATON
Par ENGSTROM
Briony JONES
Lydia KEMUNTO BOSIRE
Julia PAULSON
(section editors)

Oxford Transitional Justice Research



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Publishing Ltd.
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
Tel.: +44 1223 393 753 | Email: mail@intersentia.co.uk

Distribution for the UK:
Hart Publishing Ltd.
16C Worcester Place
Oxford OX1 2JW
UK
Tel.: +44 1865 517 530
Email: mail@hartpub.co.uk

Distribution for the USA and Canada:
International Specialized Book Services
920 NE 58th Ave. Suite 300
Portland, OR 97213
USA
Tel.: +1 800 944 6190 (toll free)
Email: info@isbs.com

Distribution for Austria:
Neuer Wissenschaftlicher Verlag
Argentinerstraße 42/6
1040 Wien
Austria
Tel.: +43 1 535 61 03 24
Email: office@nvw.at

Distribution for other countries:
Intersentia Publishing nv
Groenstraat 31
2640 Mortsel
Belgium
Tel.: +32 3 680 15 50
Email: mail@intersentia.be

Critical Perspectives in Transitional Justice
Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark, Danielle Granville (chief editors)

© 2012 Intersentia
Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

Artwork on cover: Author Jan Jordaan, title 'Hurt', medium Linocut, 1999. From the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights – International Print Portfolio, Article 5*, published by Art for Humanity, South Africa, 1999



ISBN 978-1-78068-035-4
NUR 828

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means, without written permission from the publisher.

NOTE

The editors of this book are represented as ‘Oxford Transitional Justice Research’ (OTJR) to reflect the collective effort that enabled the production of the volume. Nicola Palmer, Phil Clark and Danielle Granville acted as chief editors, while Ross Beaton, Par Engstrom, Briony Jones, Julia Paulson and Lydiah Kemunto Bosire edited individual sections. The conference that generated this volume, however, was the result of the energy and hard work of the entire OTJR network, which comprises nearly 150 staff and students researching transitional justice issues across 15 departments and centres at the University of Oxford. Since 2007, OTJR has become one of the largest academic networks internationally which is dedicated to transitional justice research, publications and policy work. More information about OTJR can be found at the network’s website: www.csls.ox.ac.uk/otjr.php

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Oxford Transitional Justice Research and the editors of this volume are grateful to the Law Faculty and the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies, University of Oxford, for their support throughout the production of this book. These bodies, as well as the Planethood Foundation, the Royal African Society, Rapisardi Intellectual Property, the Open Society Initiative for Southern Africa, and the African Studies Centre at the University of Oxford were generous supporters of the 2009 conference that formed the basis of this volume.

We are also enormously grateful for the editorial assistance of Caleb Fountain, Katherine Graham, Chloe Noonan and Jennifer Potvin, whose enthusiasm and attention to detail were invaluable as this book was being completed.

Finally, we would like to thank the editors of the Intersentia transitional justice series, Stephan Parmentier, Jeremy Sarkin and Elmar Weitekamp, as well as two anonymous reviewers for their insightful comments and suggestions, which greatly improved the book as a whole.

CONTENTS

<i>Note</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii

Introduction

Challenging Transitional Justice

Phil CLARK and Nicola PALMER	1
------------------------------------	---

Section 1: Critiquing Core Concepts in Transitional Justice

1. Transitional Justice and the Just War Tradition Larry MAY	17
2. Transitional Justice as Retribution: Revisiting its Kantian Roots Shaina P. WANG	31
3. A Discourse Theoretic Approach to Transitional Justice Ideals: Conceptualising ‘Reconciliation’ as an Empty Universal in Times of Political Transition Judith RENNER	51
4. Transitions as States of Exception: Towards a More General Theory of Transitional Justice Derk VENEMA	73
5. Commentary on Critiquing Core Transitional Justice Concepts Max PENSKY	91

Section 2: Accountability, Human Rights and the Rule of Law

6. Human Rights, International Courts and Deliberative Democracy Roberto GARGARELLA	101
--	-----

7. Accountability After Atrocity in Peru: The Trial of Former President Alberto Fujimori in Comparative Perspective Jo-Marie BURT	119
8. Hybrid Human Rights Mechanisms in Post-Conflict Transitions: The Experience of the Bosnian Human Rights Chamber Antoine BUYSE	147
9. International Sentencing as a Force for Achieving Peace through Justice Ralph HENHAM	169
10. Can International Justice Be Restorative Justice? The Role of Reparations Carolyn HOYLE	189
11. Commentary on Accountability, Human Rights and the Rule of Law Par ENGSTROM	211

Section 3: Locality and Legitimacy

12. Legitimacy, Power and Memory at the Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia Peter MANNING	217
13. Outreach, Inreach and Civil Society Participation in Transitional Justice Wendy LAMBOURNE	235
14. ‘Blow Your Mind and Cool Your Heart’: Can Tradition-Based Justice Fill the Transitional Justice Gap in Sierra Leone? Martien SCHOTSMANS	263
15. The Elusive Quest for Reconciliation in Northern Uganda Dean E. PEACHEY	289
16. Commentary on Locality and Legitimacy Kieran MCEVOY	311

Section 4: Memory, Ritual and Apology

17. “Lebanon of Dignity, a People that Perseveres”: A Psychological Perspective on Collective Amnesia in Lebanon and its Implications for Transitional Justice
 Diana BATCHELOR 319

18. Performing Reconciliation: A Performance Approach to the Analysis of Political Apologies
 Michel-André HORELT..... 347

19. Self-Inflicted Genocide and State- and Nation-Building in Post-Soviet Russia
 Danielle GRANVILLE 369

20. Commentary on Memory, Ritual and Apology
 Julia PAULSON 393

Section 5: Transitional Justice after Transition

21. The End of Impunity? ‘Late Justice’ and Post-Transitional Prosecutions in Latin America
 Cath COLLINS 399

22. Transitional Justice in Post-Communist Central-Eastern Europe: Decommunisation and the Rule of Law
 Adam CZARNOTA 425

23. Prosecutions, Pardons and Amnesty: The Trajectory of Transitional Accountability in South Africa
 Hugo VAN DER MERWE 443

24. Post-Conflict Accountability and the Demands of Justice: Can Conditional Amnesties Take the Place of Criminal Prosecutions?
 Antje DU BOIS-PEDAIN..... 459

25. Commentary on Transitional Justice after Transition
 Marjorie D. JOBSON 485

Contributors’ Biographies 493

ABBREVIATIONS

ADHOC	Cambodian Human Rights and Development Association
AFRC	Armed Forces Revolutionary Council
AI	Amnesty International
ANC	African National Congress
APRA	American Popular Revolutionary Alliance
ARLPI	Acholi Religious Leaders Peace Initiative
AZAPO	Azanian People's Organisation
CAVR	Commission for Reception, Truth and Reconciliation
CDF	Civilian Defence Forces
CELS	Center for Legal and Social Studies
CHRAC	Cambodian Human Rights Action Committee
CNVR	National Commission for Truth and Reconciliation
CPA	Concerned Parents Association
CRPC	Commission on Real Property Claims
CSD	Center for Social Development
CVR	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
DC-Cam	Documentation Centre of Cambodia
DfID	Department for International Development
DINTE	National Directorate against Terrorism
DK	Democratic Kampuchea
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms
HRC	Human Rights Chamber
HRW	Human Rights Watch
IACHR	Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTJ	International Center for Transitional Justice
ICTR	International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for the former Yugoslavia
IFP	Inkatha Freedom Party
IRCSL	Inter-Religious Council of Sierra Leone
KGB	Committee for State Security
KID	Khmer Institute for Democracy

KMT	Kuomintang
KR	Khmer Rouge
KRT	Khmer Rouge Tribunal
LRA	Lord's Resistance Army
MRTA	Tupac Amaru Revolutionary Movement
NaCSA	National Commission for Social Action
NKVD	People's Commissariat for Internal Affairs
NPA	National Prosecuting Authority
NRA	National Resistance Army
OSCE	Organisation for Security and Cooperation in Europe
OTJR	Oxford Transitional Justice Research
PCLU	Priority Crimes Litigation Unit
PRK	People's Republic of Kampuchea
PSOE	Spanish Socialist Workers' Party
PTSD	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder
RJ	Restorative Justice
RS	Republika Srpska
RUF	Revolutionary United Front
SCU	Serious Crimes Unit
SIE	Army Intelligence Service
SIN	National Intelligence Service
SADF	South African Defence Force
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
SLA	Sierra Leonean Army
SWAPO	South West Africa People's Organisation
TRC	Truth and Reconciliation Commission
UCD	Union of the Democratic Centre
UN	United Nations
VTF	Victims' Trust Fund
VTFT	Victims' Trust Fund Team