

Disability and Employment
A contemporary disability human rights approach applied to
Danish, Swedish and EU law and policy

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 43.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Disability and Employment
A contemporary disability human rights approach applied to
Danish, Swedish and EU law and policy

Maria Ventegodt Liisberg



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

Intersentia Ltd
Trinity House | Cambridge Business Park | Cowley Road
Cambridge | CB4 0WZ | United Kingdom
mail@intersentia.co.uk

Maria Ventegodt Liisberg
Disability and Employment
A contemporary disability human rights approach applied to Danish, Swedish and
EU Law and Policy

Cover image: © Antonprado – Dreamstime.com

ISBN 978-1-78068-028-6
NUR 828

© 2011 Intersentia
www.intersentia.com | www.intersentia.co.uk

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data. A catalogue record for this book is
available from the British Library.

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any
other means, without written permission from the publisher.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book is the result of my research as an external PhD student at Maastricht University. First and foremost, I am deeply grateful for the unwavering support of my main supervisor Lisa Waddington who has commented on all the drafts of my thesis as well as helping me with the practicalities associated with being an external PhD student. Lisa has continuously inspired me to seek to improve my analytical skills and my clarity of writing. I am also indebted to my co-supervisor Ruth Nielsen of Copenhagen Business School for highly useful feed-back and guidance. Special thanks also to my friend Brigit Toebes who has provided me with academic and moral support during the last years of this long-lasting process.

I would also like to acknowledge the support of the Danish Institute for Human Rights where I have had the pleasure of working both before, during and after the writing of my thesis. I thank the former Director of the Institute, Morten Kjærum, and the former Head of the National Department, Birgitte Kofod Olsen, for giving me working tasks related to disability human rights law and for supporting my wish to write this thesis. I have also appreciated the stimulating and supportive atmosphere of the Research Department under the leadership of Hans-Otto Sano, Eva Maria Lassen and Peter Scharff Smith.

Moreover, I am grateful to Stig Langvad, Chairman of the Disabled Peoples' Organisation Denmark, and Holger Kallehauge, former High Court Judge and Chairman of the Danish Society of Polio and Accident Victims, who both so excellently promote the human rights of persons with disabilities in Denmark and globally, for encouraging me to do research on disability human rights.

In addition, thanks are due to Jan Høgelund of the Danish National Centre for Social Research for providing me with special calculations on the employment of persons with disabilities in Denmark. Many thanks also to Louise Rayar for translating the English summary of the thesis into Dutch.

I am also grateful to the members of the Reading Committee who provided helpful comments: Hildegard Schneider, Ann Numhauser-Henning (Lund University) and Anne Pieter van der Mei.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the substantial financial support of the Danish Research Council.

I dedicate this book to my husband, Jonas, with love and gratitude.

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xv

Part I

Introduction	1
-------------------------------	---

Chapter I

Introduction	3
1. Research Questions and Purposes	5
2. Methodology	6
3. Scope and Structure	7
4. Some Definitions	10
5. Disability Employment in Denmark and Sweden in Figures	11
6. This Thesis in the Context of Existing Research	14
7. Conclusion	15

Part II

Analytical Framework	17
---------------------------------------	----

Chapter II

Human Rights	19
1. The Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach	19
1.1. Methodology for Determining the “Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach”	20
1.2. From the End of World War II until the End of the 1960s – Formal Equality and the Medical Model of Disability	23
1.2.1. Models of Equality and Disability	23
1.2.2. The United Nations	24
1.2.3. The Council of Europe	27
1.3. From the 1970s until 2000s – Substantive Difference Equality and the Minority Model of Disability	28
1.3.1. The Models of Equality and Disability	28
1.3.2. The United Nations	31
1.3.3. The Council of Europe	36
1.3.3.1. European Convention on Human Rights	36
1.3.3.2. European Social Charter	44

1.4. Current trends – Substantive Diversity Equality and Social Universality	
Model of Disability	47
1.4.1. The Models of Equality and Disability	47
1.4.2. The United Nations	51
1.4.3. The Council of Europe	55
1.5. The Involvement of Civil Society and Social Partners	55
1.5.1. Involvement of Civil Society	56
1.5.2. Involvement of Social Partners	58
1.6. Conclusion	59
2. Legal Status of Human Rights in Denmark and Sweden	60
2.1. Human Rights Protection under Domestic Law	61
2.2. Legal Status of International Human Rights Treaties	63
2.3. National Disability Action Plans	67
2.4. Conclusion	69
3. Conclusion	69
Part III	
EU and Domestic Law and Policy	71
Chapter III	
EU Law and Policy	73
1. Introduction	73
2. Development of EU Disability Policies and Laws	73
2.1. The Early Years from Treaty of Rome to the Mid-1970s	73
2.2. Mid-1970s to the Treaty of Amsterdam	74
2.3. From the Amsterdam Treaty and Onwards	75
2.4. Conclusion	80
3. The EU and Human Rights Protection of Persons with Disabilities	81
3.1. General Human Rights Instruments	81
3.2. CRPD	87
3.3. Conclusion	89
4. Employment Equality Directive	89
4.1. Definition of Disability	91
4.1.1. Models of Disability	91
4.1.2. Delimitation of the Concept of Disability	92
4.1.3. Definition of Disability and the ‘Causal Link’	95
4.1.4. Conclusion	97
4.2. Direct Discrimination	97
4.3. Indirect Discrimination	103
4.4. Reasonable Accommodation	106
4.4.1. What are “Appropriate Measures”?	108
4.4.2. Who is Entitled to Reasonable Accommodation and in Which Situations?	109

4.4.3. Limitations on the Duty to Accommodate	110
4.4.4. Reasonable Accommodation, Direct and Indirect Discrimination and Positive Action	112
4.4.5. Conclusion on Reasonable Accommodation	115
4.5. Harassment and Instruction to Discriminate.	116
4.6. Scope of Application	116
4.7. Burden of Proof	119
4.8. Positive Action	120
4.8.1. Definition of Positive Action.	121
4.8.2. ECJ Case Law on Positive Action.	122
4.8.3. Disability-Related Positive Action	124
4.9. Remedies and Sanctions and Victimisation	126
4.10. Conclusion on Employment Equality Directive	128
5. Employers' Obligations	128
5.1. Protection Against Dismissals.	129
5.1.1. Hard-law on Protection Against Dismissals.	129
5.1.2. Soft-law on Protection Against Dismissals	130
5.2. Health and Safety.	130
5.2.1. Hard-law on Health and Safety.	131
5.2.2. Soft-law on Health and Safety	135
5.3. Conclusion on Employers' Obligations	136
6. Employment Promotion.	136
6.1. Hard-law on Employment Promotion	137
6.2. Soft-law on Employment Promotion	140
6.3. Conclusion on Employment Promotion	141
7. Income-Replacement Benefits.	141
7.1. Hard Law on Income-Replacement Benefits.	142
7.2. Soft-law on Income-Replacement Benefits	146
7.3. Conclusion on Income-Replacement Benefits.	147
8. Involvement of Civil Society and Social Partners	147
8.1. Civil Society	148
8.2. Social Partners.	150
8.3. Conclusion	153
9. Legal Status of Denmark and Sweden under EU Law	153
10. Conclusions	155
 Chapter IV	
Equality Law and Policy.	159
1. Introduction.	159
2. Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach	159
2.1. Non-Discrimination and Equality	159
2.2. Definition of Disability	162

2.3. Positive Action	163
2.4. Conclusion	167
3. Overview of Danish and Swedish Equality Law	167
4. Definition of Disability	171
4.1. Danish Definition of disability	171
4.2. Swedish Definition of Disability	177
4.3. Conclusion	180
5. Direct Discrimination	181
5.1. Less favourable treatment	182
5.2. Comparable Situation	182
5.3. Causal Link Between Disability and the Differential Treatment	187
5.4. Exceptions	190
5.5. Conclusion	192
6. Indirect Discrimination.	192
6.1. Indirect Differential Treatment	193
6.2. Objective Justification Clause	194
6.3. Reasonable Accommodation Clause	196
6.4. Conclusion	198
7. Reasonable Accommodation.	198
7.1. Meaning of “Reasonable Accommodation”	199
7.2. What are “Appropriate Measures”?	200
7.3. Who is Entitled to Reasonable Accommodation and in Which Situations?	203
7.4. Limitations on the Duty to Accommodate	207
7.5. Reasonable Accommodation, Direct and Indirect Discrimination and Positive Action	212
7.6. Conclusion	215
8. Scope of Application	215
8.1. Employer-Employee Relationship	216
8.2. Membership of Workers’ or Employers’ Organisations	218
8.3. Armed Forces.	219
8.4. Self-Employment	219
8.5. Education and Training	220
8.6. Related Areas of Transport, Infrastructure and Social Security.	220
8.7. Conclusion	221
9. Positive Action.	221
9.1. Public Employers	223
9.2. Private Employers	225
9.3. Conclusion	227
10. Conclusion.	228

Chapter V	
Employers' Obligations.....	231
1. Introduction.....	231
2. Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach.....	232
2.1. Employers' Obligations Towards Employees with Disabilities and Disability-Related Reduced Working Capacity.....	232
2.2. Protection Against Unfair Dismissals.....	237
2.3. Dismissals Due to Shortage of Work.....	239
2.4. Conclusion.....	240
3. Dismissal Due to Disability-Related Reduced Working Capacity.....	241
3.1. Material Limitations.....	242
3.1.1. Denmark.....	242
3.1.2. Sweden.....	248
3.1.3. Conclusion.....	252
3.2. Protection against Unfair Dismissal.....	253
3.2.1. Denmark.....	253
3.2.2. Sweden.....	256
3.2.3. Conclusion.....	258
3.3. Conclusion.....	259
4. Adjustment for Reduced Working Capacity.....	260
4.1. Denmark.....	260
4.2. Sweden.....	263
4.2.1. General Duty to Adjust Working Tasks and Conditions.....	264
4.2.2. Duty to Rehabilitate Employees on Sick Leave.....	265
4.2.3. Reorganisation of Work and Transfer to Another Position.....	267
4.3. Conclusion.....	270
5. Protection against Dismissals Due to Shortage of Work.....	270
5.1. Denmark.....	271
5.2. Sweden.....	274
5.2.1. Criteria for Choosing Employees set by Law.....	275
5.2.2. Special Protection of Persons with Disabilities.....	276
5.3. Conclusion.....	280
6. EU Law and Policy.....	281
7. Conclusion.....	281
Chapter VI	
Employment Promotion.....	283
1. Introduction.....	283
2. Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach.....	284
2.1. Sheltered Employment.....	285
2.2. Supported Employment.....	287
2.3. Conclusion.....	291

3.	Introduction to Danish and Swedish Labour Market Policy	291
3.1.	Danish and Swedish Employment Promotion Policies	291
3.2.	Implementation of Danish and Swedish Employment Promotion Policy	293
3.3.	Conclusion	296
4.	Supported Employment in the Open Labour Market	296
4.1.	Overview	296
4.2.	Reserved to Persons Otherwise Excluded from the Labour Market	300
4.3.	Available to Those Who Need It	302
4.4.	Promote Transition to Open Labour Market	304
4.5.	Usual Benefits of Labour Law	306
4.6.	Conclusion	308
5.	Sheltered Employment	309
5.1.	Overview	309
5.2.	Reserved to Persons Excluded from the Open Labour Market	313
5.3.	Available to Those Who Need It	315
5.4.	Promote Transition to Open Labour Market	315
5.5.	Usual Benefits of Labour Law	317
5.6.	Conclusion	321
6.	EU Law and Policy	322
7.	Conclusion	324
Chapter VII		
	Income Replacement Benefits	327
1.	Introduction	327
2.	Contemporary Disability Human Rights Approach	328
2.1.	Disability-Specific Provisions	329
2.2.	Non-Disability-Specific provisions	332
2.3.	Work Injury Benefit from a Human Rights' Perspective	334
2.4.	Conclusion	335
3.	Disability Pension	336
3.1.	Available to Those Who Need it and Ensures an Adequate Standard of Living	337
3.1.1.	Long-Lasting Reduced Working Capacity	337
3.1.2.	Partially Reduced Working Capacity	338
3.1.3.	Documentation of Reduced Working Capacity	338
3.1.4.	Level of Benefit	340
3.1.5.	Conclusion	341
3.2.	Dignified Support for Entry into Labour Market	342
3.2.1.	Suspension of Disability Pension	344
3.3.	Design and Administration of Disability Pension	344
3.4.	Conclusion	346

4. Sickness Benefit	346
4.1. Available to Those Who Need It and Ensures an Adequate Standard of Living.	347
4.1.1. Measurement of Working Capacity	348
4.1.2. Level of Sickness Benefits	350
4.2. Dignified Support for Entry into the Labour Market	351
4.3. Design and Administration of Sickness Benefits	354
4.4. Conclusion	355
5. Rehabilitation	356
5.1. Available to Those Who Need It and Ensures an Adequate Standard of Living.	356
5.2. Promotes Re-entry into Labour Market in a Dignified Manner	358
5.3. Design and Administration of Rehabilitation Benefits	359
5.4. Conclusion	360
6. Work Injury Compensation	360
6.1. Design and Administration of Work Injury Compensation	361
6.2. Equal Right of Persons with Disabilities to Public Work Injury Compensation	363
6.3. Conclusion	366
7. EU Law and Policy	366
8. Conclusion	368
Part IV	
Conclusion	371
Chapter VIII	
Conclusion	373
1. Main Findings	373
2. Employers' Obligations	377
3. Equality Law and Policy	377
4. Employment Promotion	379
5. Income-Replacement Benefits	380
6. Disability Organisations and Social Partners	381
7. Rights-Based Approach	382
8. EU Law and Policy	382
9. Main Recommendations	383
<i>Summary in English</i>	<i>385</i>
<i>Summary in Dutch (Samenvatting)</i>	<i>393</i>
<i>List of Literature</i>	<i>401</i>

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CAT	Convention Against Torture and Other Forms of Cruel, Inhuman and Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CERD	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRMW	Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
ECHR	European Convention of Human Rights
ECJ	Court of Justice of the European Communities
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
ESC	European Social Charter
CJEU	Court of Justice of the European Union
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICF	International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health (WHO)
ICIDH	World Health Organization International Classification of Impairments, Disabilities and Handicaps (WHO)
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
WHO	World Health Organisation

